

Chair Faison called the Regular meeting of the Troy City Planning Commission to order at 7:01 p.m. on January 14, 2020 in the Council Chamber of the Troy City Hall.

1. ROLL CALL

Present:

- Ollie Apahidean
- Karen Crusse
- Carlton M. Faison
- Michael W. Hutson
- Tom Krent
- David Lambert
- Marianna Perakis
- Sadek Rahman
- John J. Tagle

Also Present:

- R. Brent Savidant, Community Development Director
- Ben Carlisle, Carlisle Wortman Associates
- Julie Quinlan Dufrane, Assistant City Attorney
- Jackie Ferencz, Planning Department Administrative Assistant
- Kathy L. Czarnecki, Recording Secretary

2. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

**Resolution # PC-2020-01-001**

Moved by: Lambert  
Support by: Rahman

**RESOLVED**, To approve the Agenda as prepared.

Yes: All present (9)

**MOTION CARRIED**

3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Mr. Krent asked the minutes to reflect a correction in the time of adjournment.

**Resolution # PC-2020-01-002**

Moved by: Krent  
Support by: Tagle

**RESOLVED**, To approve the minutes of the December 10, 2019 Regular meeting as revised.

Yes: All present (9)

**MOTION CARRIED**

4. PUBLIC COMMENT – Items not on the Agenda

There was no one present who wished to speak.

**PUBLIC HEARING**

5. PUBLIC HEARING – REZONING REQUEST (File Number Z 2019-0039) – Proposed Addison Heights Subdivision Rezoning, East of Livernois, South side of Arthur (88-20-27-307-033), Section 27, From P (Vehicular Parking) District to R-1E (One Family Residential) District

Mr. Savidant explained what a rezoning request is and its approval process. He provided a history of the zoning of the property. Mr. Savidant addressed the request as relates to the Rezoning Standards and Master Plan. Mr. Savidant said the applicant wants to construct a residential home on the site. It was recommended that the Planning Commission recommends to the City Council to grant approval of the rezoning request.

The applicant Ross Martin was present.

PUBLIC HEARING OPENED

There was no one present who wished to speak.

PUBLIC HEARING CLOSED

There was discussion on:

- Ownership of adjacent parcels.
- Potential development in the future along Livernois and the right of way.

**Resolution # PC-2020-01-003**

Moved by: Hutson

Support by: Tagle

**RESOLVED**, That the Planning Commission hereby recommends to the City Council that the P (Vehicular Parking) District to R-1E (One Family Residential) District rezoning request, as per Section 16.03 of the City of Troy Zoning Ordinance, located on the south side of Arthur, East of Livernois, within Section 27, being approximately 0.24 acres in size, be **GRANTED** for the following reasons:

1. The proposed rezoning is consistent with the Master Plan.
2. The proposed rezoning does not appear to cause or increase any nonconformity.
3. If rezoned the property will be capable of accommodating service and facility loads caused by use of the development.
4. The rezoning does not appear to impact public health, safety, or welfare.
5. The rezoning will ensure compatibility with adjacent uses of land.

Yes: All present (9)

## **MOTION CARRIED**

### **PRELIMINARY SITE PLAN APPROVALS**

6. PRELIMINARY SITE PLAN REVIEW (File Number SP2019-0022) – Proposed Crooks Road Townhomes, West side of Crooks, North of Wattles, Section 17, Currently Zoned NN (Neighborhood Node “I”) District

Ms. Perakis disclosed she formerly lived in the Woodlands subdivision from 2008 to 2014 and her home on Parkstone backed up to the subject property. She also disclosed that the applicant is a current neighbor of hers and she was in opposition to the applicant’s proposed apartment project that was formerly considered by the City. Ms. Perakis said there is no conflict of interest and that she can be objective in her consideration of the application.

Mr. Carlisle outlined the revisions the applicant proposes to the application based on discussion from the Planning Commission, staff and the public when considered at the September 24, 2019 meeting. He noted the site plan revisions are identified on page 5 of his report dated January 7, 2020. Mr. Carlisle reported there are significant outstanding site plan items on the revised site plan, as relates to screening/landscaping along adjacent residential property lines, tree removal loss due to the stormwater facility and lighting impact to adjacent property.

Mr. Carlisle recommended to postpone the application to allow the applicant to address site plan items.

Present were Carmine Avantini, AICP, of Community Image Builders, Arvin Stafa, Brandon Bronikowski, James Butler and Greg Bono, both of Professional Engineering Associates (PEA).

Mr. Avantini presented a PowerPoint presentation and addressed the additional acreage, decrease in density, increase in guest parking, traditional two-car garages, increased setback, screening and buffer to residential, building height, line of sight visual, grade difference, location of EVA, parking and pedestrian traffic. Mr. Avantini indicated several site plan issues identified by the Planning Consultant have been addressed. He asked for a favorable vote conditioned on the remaining issues that could be administratively addressed through engineering and final site plan processes.

Mr. Stafa addressed building height, grading, outlots and public engagement. Mr. Bronikowski addressed building materials and circulated building material samples. Mr. Bono addressed stormwater management. Mr. Butler said concerns relating to floodplain and wetlands would be addressed through the engineering process.

Chair Faison opened the floor for public comment.

The following spoke in opposition, voicing concerns with grade difference, drainage, flooding, compatibility, property values, application process, no public engagement, traffic impact and safety.

- James Chang, 4397 Bender
- Latish Adnani, 4219 Crooks
- Tom Reiss, 1400 Bradbury
- Jerry Rauch, 4187 Penrose
- Doug and Linda Gerard, 4197 Carson
- Mike and Laura Lipinski, 4233 Carson
- Thomas Mikulski, 4408 Cahill
- Daphne (Ntiri) and Jean-Claude Quenum, 4198 Carson
- JinMing Xu, 4179 Carson
- Bob Laudicina, 1286 Fountain
- Paul Balas, 4087 Parkstone
- Nadwa Gowda, 4412 Lehigh (*illegible*)
- Trevor Babi, 4537 Cahill
- Jeff Silagy, Whisper Way
- Raghav Kashi, 4420 Cahill

David Donnellon, architect and municipal planner; represented the seller of the property. He stated the development is permitted by right in the Neighborhood Node zoning district and addressed the balance between the Neighborhood Node and Single Family Residential zoning districts.

Chair Faison closed the floor for public comment.

There was discussion on:

- Grading difference, as relates to drainage and engineering design process.
- Stormwater management.
- Outlots; ownership, potential to build, property lines.
- Wetland and floodplain, as relates to MDEQ and engineering design process.
- Compatibility and transition to residential, as relates to landscape buffer, building height, line of vision, building materials.
- Line of vision scale and calculations.
- Neighborhood Node districts as relates to Master Plan, philosophy.
- Traffic impact; study.
- “Real” density.
- Engagement with neighbors; strongly encouraged.
- Intent of Master Plan.
- Joint meeting with City Council to discuss Neighborhood Node zoning districts.

Ms. Dufrane interjected the discussion to state the proposed development is permitted by right on the subject property.

Mr. Avantini asked the Board’s consideration to postpone the item to allow an opportunity to respond to and investigate comments made this evening and to possibly gain insight from the joint meeting.

**Resolution # PC-2020-01-004**

Moved by: Krent  
 Support by: Lambert

**RESOLVED**, That Preliminary Site Plan Approval, pursuant to Article 8 of the Zoning Ordinance, as requested for the proposed Crooks Road Townhomes, located on the west side of Crooks, North of Wattles, Section 17, within the NN (Neighborhood Node “I”) District, be postponed, for the following reasons:

1. Allow the applicant time to digest comments made by residents, Planning Commission and staff and to address the site plan items identified in the Planning Consultant report and staff review.

Yes: Apahidean, Crusse, Lambert, Faison, Krent, Rahman, Tagle  
 No: Hutson, Perakis

**MOTION CARRIED**

Chair Faison called for a recess at 9:33 p.m. The meeting reconvened at 9:50 p.m.

7. PRELIMINARY SITE PLAN REVIEW (File Number SP JPLN2019-0040) – Proposed Square Lake Court Townhomes, South side of Square Lake Road, West of Dequindre, Section 12, (88-20-12-200-025), Currently Zoned NN (Neighborhood Node “N”) District

Mr. Carlisle reviewed the Preliminary Site Plan application for Square Lake Court Townhomes. He addressed the need for a dedicated guest parking area, a cross-access easement along the southern property line, additional trees along the west property line, shielding light fixtures and architectural detail on elevations.

Mr. Carlisle recommended to postpone the Preliminary Site Plan application to allow the applicant to address the guest parking, architectural detailing and other site plan concerns identified in his report dated January 7, 2020.

Present were Renis Nushaj, Erion Nikolla of Eureka Building Company and James Butler of Professional Engineering Associates (PEA).

Mr. Butler addressed the outstanding site plan issues relating to the photometric plan, landscaping and guest parking. He said the additional trees would be added and the light fixture shielded. Mr. Butler indicated 10 to 12 parallel spaces could be dedicated for guest parking along the southern property line.

Mr. Nikolla addressed design and architectural features of the elevations, building materials and colors. Building material samples were circulated.

Mr. Nushaj addressed the City’s requirement for a cross-access easement. Mr. Nushaj believes a cross-access easement agreement should be a private contract among involved parties, not a requirement of the City, and views the City’s requirement as an encumbrance on private property.

There was discussion on:

- Guest parking; accommodation and layout.
- Ownership of property to south.
- Cross-access easement and EVA requirements.
- Traffic circulation; no comments from Engineering review.
- Recent revisions to site plan.

Ms. Dufrane referenced Zoning Ordinance sections that relate to the requirement of a cross-access easement and exceptions to that requirement; i.e., if it is demonstrated that there are either physical limitations or functional circumstances that prevent such access from being installed.

Mr. Carlisle said the EVA is noted on the site plan; the cross-access easement is not noted on the site plan.

Mr. Savidant stated that both the Fire Department and Engineering Department recommend a cross-access easement, but it is the authority of the Planning Commission to place a cross-access easement on a property.

**Resolution # PC-2020-01-005**

Moved by: Krent  
 Seconded by: Crusse

**RESOLVED**, That Preliminary Site Plan Approval, pursuant to Article 8 of the Zoning Ordinance, as requested for the proposed Square Lake Court Townhomes, 14 units, located on the South side of Square Lake, West of Dequindre (PIN 88-20-12-200-025), Section 12, Zoned NN (Neighborhood Node “N”), be granted, subject to the following:

1. Add dedicated guest parking.
2. Provide cross-access easement along southern property line.
3. Add additional trees along west property line.
4. Replace light fixture with shielded one.
5. Identify all materials.
6. Add additional architectural details to the side elevations.

Yes: Crusse, Lambert, Faison, Krent, Rahman, Tagle  
 No: Apahidean, Hutson, Perakis

**MOTION CARRIED**

**OTHER BUSINESS**

8. **PLANNING COMMISSION 2020 MEETING SCHEDULE – REVISION**

Mr. Savidant asked for the Board’s consideration to revise the 2020 Planning Commission meeting calendar by removing the March 10, 2020. He explained an election is being held that day and there could be a conflict in reserving a meeting room.

**Resolution # PC-2020-01-006**

Moved by: Lambert  
 Seconded by: Rahman

**RESOLVED**, To revise the 2020 Planning Commission Schedule and remove the March 10, 2020 date.

Yes: All present (9)

**MOTION CARRIED**

9. **ELECTION OF OFFICERS**

Chair Faison opened the floor for nominations of Chair. Ms. Crusse nominated Mr. Faison. Mr. Hutson nominated Mr. Krent. There were no further nominations placed on the floor.

Mr. Faison said he would be happy to serve another year or happy to step down to allow the opportunity to another member.

Mr. Krent accepted the nomination.

**Roll call vote on the nomination of Mr. Faison for Chair**

Yes: Crusse, Lambert, Faison, Rahman  
 No: Apahidean, Hutson, Krent, Perakis, Tagle

**MOTION FAILED**

**Roll call vote on the nomination of Mr. Krent for Chair**

Yes: Apahidean, Lambert, Faison, Hutson, Krent, Perakis, Rahman, Tagle  
 No: Crusse

**MOTION CARRIED**

Mr. Krent is the newly elected Chair.

Chair Faison opened the floor for nominations of Vice Chair. Mr. Tagle nominated Mr. Lambert. There were no further nominations placed on the floor.

Mr. Lambert accepted the nomination and is the newly elected Vice Chair.

There was discussion on the role, structure and formation of the Planning Commission representative to the Zoning Board of Appeals; consideration might be given to making revisions.

Chair Faison opened the floor for nominations of Zoning Board of Appeals (ZBA) Representative. Mr. Apahidean nominated Mr. Rahman. There were no further nominations placed on the floor.

Mr. Rahman accepted the nomination and is the newly elected ZBA Representative.

10. PUBLIC COMMENT

There was no one present who wished to speak.

11. PLANNING COMMISSION COMMENT

There were general Planning Commission comments, some relating to:

- Compatibility, transition of Neighborhood Nodes to single family residential.
- Opening the floor for public comment following a Public Hearing.
- 2020 Michigan Regional Future City Competition at Novi Showplace on January 28.

Chair Faison was acknowledged and thanked for a good job as Chair!

A warm welcome was extended to Ms. Perakis.

The Regular meeting of the Planning Commission adjourned at 11:19 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

 FOR CARLTON FAISON

Carlton Faison, Chair

 FOR Kathy Czarnecki

Kathy L. Czarnecki, Recording Secretary