

Chair Krent called the virtual Regular meeting of the Troy City Planning Commission to order at 7:00 p.m. on December 8, 2020. Chair Krent introduced the procedure to be followed for a remote meeting.

1. ROLL CALL

Present:

Ollie Apahidean  
Karen Crusse  
Carlton M. Faison  
Michael W. Hutson  
Tom Krent  
David Lambert  
Sadek Rahman  
John J. Tagle

Absent:

Marianna Perakis

Also Present:

R. Brent Savidant, Community Development Director  
Ben Carlisle, Carlisle Wortman Associates  
Julie Quinlan Dufrane, Assistant City Attorney  
Jackie Ferencz, Planning Department Administrative Assistant  
Kathy L. Czarnecki, Recording Secretary

2. SUSPENSION OF PLANNING COMMISSION BYLAWS

**Resolution # PC-2020-12-032**

Moved by: Krent

Support by: Lambert

WHEREAS, the Michigan Department of Health and Human Services (MDHHS) Director Robert Gordon issued an Order on October 5, 2020 under MCL 333.2253 restricting indoor gathering sizes to protect public health and safety, and

WHEREAS, Public Act 228 of 2020 permits public meetings to be held by electronic means where an in-person meeting could detrimentally increase exposure of board members and the general public to COVID-19,

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, That as allowed by Planning Commission Rules of Procedure Article IV, Section 6, the Troy Planning Commission hereby **TEMPORARILY SUSPENDS** the requirement of holding a meeting at the Troy City Hall and **ALLOWS** all Troy Planning Commission Members to electronically participate in any Planning Commission meeting through December 31, 2020.

Members participating electronically will be considered present and in attendance at the meeting and may participate in the meeting as if physically present. However, members must avoid using email, texting, instant messaging, and other such electronic forms of communication to make a decision or deliberate toward a decision.

RESOLVED, As allowed by Planning Commission By-laws and Rules of Procedure Article X, the Troy Planning Commission hereby **TEMPORARILY SUSPENDS AND MODIFIES** the By-laws and Rules of Procedure concerning the Order of the Agenda, as set forth in Article V, Section 3, to consolidate the Public Comment sections of the meeting for any meeting held through December 31, 2020.

RESOLVED, As allowed by Planning Commission By-laws and Rules of Procedure Article X, the Troy Planning Commission hereby **TEMPORARILY SUSPENDS AND ALLOWS** two methods of receiving Public Comment for virtual meetings. Public comments can be submitted for the Planning Commission meeting by sending an email to: [planning@troymi.gov](mailto:planning@troymi.gov). Emails received prior to 4:30 p.m. on the day preceding the Planning Commission meeting will be incorporated into the official record by attaching the emails to the agenda for review and consideration by Planning Commission members and interested persons. Public comments can also be submitted by calling the following phone number and leaving a voicemail message: (248) 524-1305. Recorded voicemail messages received prior to 4:30 p.m. on the day of the Planning Commission meeting will be played at the meeting. Email and voicemail public comments will be limited to three minutes each.

Yes: All present (8)  
Absent: Perakis

### **MOTION CARRIED**

#### 3. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

##### **Resolution # PC-2020-12-033**

Moved by: Faison  
Support by: Hutson

**RESOLVED**, To approve the Agenda as prepared.

Yes: All present (8)  
Absent: Perakis

### **MOTION CARRIED**

#### 4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

##### **Resolution # PC-2020-12-034**

Moved by: Lambert  
Support by: Rahman

**RESOLVED**, To approve the minutes of the November 10, 2020 Regular meeting as submitted.

Yes: All present (8)  
Absent: Perakis

### **MOTION CARRIED**

#### **5. PUBLIC COMMENT – For Items Submitted via Email or Telephone Message**

Mr. Savidant stated a revised Agenda packet was posted on the City website incorporating email messages received prior to 4:30 p.m. Monday, December 7, 2020, as stipulated by Resolution # PC-2020-12-032.

Mr. Savidant and Ms. Ferencz read the following email messages received after 4:30 p.m. Monday, December 7, 2020 through 4:30 p.m. today, December 8, 2020.

Email messages received, in response to Agenda item #6.

- Ashish Bajaj, 6313 Country Ridge Drive; in opposition.
- Paul Balas, 4087 Parkstone Court; in opposition.
- Sandeep Bhatti, no address; in opposition.
- Mary Branch, Miracle Drive; in opposition.
- Sanjay Chawla, Villas of Troy resident; in opposition.
- Joe Cole, President of WSE HOA; in opposition.
- Sarah Compton, Huron Drive; in opposition.
- Ryan and Stephanie Giorio, 4460 Lehigh; in opposition.
- Sudhanshu Grover, 4886 Seasons; in opposition.
- Priti Gupta and family, no address; in opposition.
- Randall Hicks, Troy resident; in opposition.
- Judith Holmburg, 1351 Bradbury Drive; in opposition.
- Jing Huang, 3588 Oriole Drive; in opposition.
- Tony Huang, 772 Palermo; in opposition.
- Sanjay Kumar; resident Coolidge and Wattles; in opposition.
- Joy Lackey, no address; in opposition.
- Laura Lipinski, 4233 Carson; in opposition.
- Jonathan Maksabo, no address; in opposition.
- F. Marnandus, Alpine Road; in opposition.
- Kathy Metevier, no address; in opposition.
- Mike and Yvette Metz, 1239 Bradbury; in opposition.
- Ashish Modi, resident Long Lake and Livernois; in opposition.
- Marilyn Papandrea, no address; in opposition.
- Mark and Diane Paul, 3844 Root; in opposition.
- Jayashree Rao, 4415 Wintergreen Drive; in opposition.
- Daniel Raubinger, 4083 Penrose, President Woodlands HOA; in opposition.
- Jeanne Stine, no address; in opposition.
- Aish Ramesh, 4609 Colling Drive; in opposition.
- Raymond Richard, 344 Colebrook Drive; in opposition.

- Rovita A., no address; in opposition.
- Arun K. Sekhri, 3539 Delaware; in opposition.
- Patricia Serafini, Troy resident; in opposition.
- Anshul Shah, 4609 Colling Drive; in opposition.
- Aashka Shah, 4088 Parkstone Court; in opposition.
- Ananya Shah, no address; in opposition.
- Jigna Shah, 4088 Parkstone Court; in opposition.
- Bhaskar Thota, 788 Palermo; in opposition.
- Vandan Kumar Manni, 740 Palermo; in opposition.
- Susan Voytal, Troy resident; in opposition.
- Jinming Xu, 4179 Carson; in opposition.
- Ringo Zhang, Whisperway; in opposition.

Ms. Ferencz played the following voicemail messages. The messages were not audible to the Board; she therefore identified the following names and addresses:

- Shah (last name), no address; in opposition.
- Vandan Kumar Manni, 740 Palermo; in opposition.
- David Rusing, 1425 Bradbury; in opposition.

### **PRELIMINARY SITE PLAN APPROVAL**

6. **PRELIMINARY SITE PLAN REVIEW (File Number SP JPLN2019-0045) – Proposed The Westington, South side of Wattles, East of Crooks, Section 21, Currently Zoned NN (Neighborhood Node “I”) District**

Mr. Carlisle briefly reviewed the Preliminary Site Plan application that was before the Planning Commission on October 27, 2020, at which time the Board postponed action on the item asking the applicant to address concerns relating to access, massing and traffic. Mr. Carlisle addressed three significant revisions to the plan: 1) the building fronting Wattles is broken up into two buildings; 2) the number of units is reduced from 108 to 102; and 3) the drive access is shifted further east on Wattles.

Mr. Carlisle addressed the Fire Department requirements for the EVA (emergency vehicle access) and the traffic consultant (OHM) review of the traffic report noting support of the changes in the application. Mr. Carlisle reported the application meets all the “hard” requirements of the Zoning Ordinance and is an appropriate use. He indicated compatibility and transition of the proposed development is the jurisdiction of the Planning Commission.

Mr. Carlisle recommended Preliminary Site Plan approval with the condition that the Fire Department requirements relating to the proposed EVA are addressed prior to Final Site Plan approval.

Project Architect Peter Stuhlreyer of DesignHaus and Attorney Greg Obloy of Carson Fischer were present. Mr. Stuhlreyer indicated project engineers and the applicant are present as well.

Mr. Stuhlreyer addressed revisions to the site plan with respect to access, breaking up the building fronting Wattles into two buildings, parking, play area for children and the proposed emergency vehicle access (EVA). Mr. Stuhlreyer indicated he would be happy to respond to the public comment should the Board wish.

Mr. Obloy briefly explained the ownership of Barilane and how it relates to the proposed EVA. Mr. Obloy expressed confidence that the access for emergency vehicles can be accomplished during Final Site Plan approval.

There was discussion on:

- Children play area; approximate 80'x120' area on east side of development, grill area and pavilion.
- Emergency Vehicle Access (EVA); road ownership, Fire Department requirements.
- Massing of building fronting Wattles; adequately addressed by applicant allowing light and air between proposed two buildings.
- Troy School Superintendent on record that new residential development does not negatively impact schools.
- Traffic Study submitted by applicant; review by City's traffic consultant in support of revisions to plan, finding negligible traffic impact.
- Public comment relating to changes in the Master Plan.
- Density of development.

**Resolution # PC-2020-12-035**

Moved by: Faison

Support by: Tagle

**RESOLVED**, That Preliminary Site Plan Approval, pursuant to Article 8 of the Zoning Ordinance, as requested for the proposed The Westington Apartment Project, 102 units, located on the South side of Wattles, East of Crooks (Parcels 88-20-21-101-004, -005 and -008), Section 21, Zoned NN (Neighborhood Node "I") District, be granted, subject to the following condition:

1. Address Fire Department requirements with regards to proposed Emergency Vehicle Access (EVA) prior to Final Site Plan Approval.

Yes: Apahidean, Crusse, Faison, Hutson, Krent, Lambert, Tagle

No: Rahman

Absent: Perakis

**MOTION CARRIED**

**OTHER ITEMS****7. MISCELLANEOUS BUSINESS – Planning Commission 2021 Meeting Schedule**

It was the consensus of the Board to omit the November 23 date because of the Thanksgiving holiday.

**Resolution # PC-2020-12-036**

Moved by: Lambert

Support by: Faison

**RESOLVED**, To approve the 2021 Planning Commission regular meeting dates as presented with the omission of the November 23, 2021 date.

Yes: All present (8)

Absent: Perakis

**MOTION CARRIED****8. PLANNING COMMISSION COMMENT**

There were general Planning Commission comments, some relating to:

- Density of development projects in Neighborhood Node districts.
- Roles of Community Development Director and Planning Commission.
- Planning Commission members appointed, not elected officials.
- Master Plan; timeline of update, process as relates to State statute.
- Status of proposed Zoning Ordinance text amendments for City Council action.
- Recent crime within City.

Ms. Dufrane updated the Board on the Eureka lawsuit relating to proposed rezonings at the northwest corner of Rochester and Sylvanwood; favorable opinion granted by Court to dismiss the matter.

A happy and safe holiday season and a brighter 2021 New Year was wished to all.

The virtual Regular meeting of the Planning Commission adjourned at 8:58 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Tom Krent, Chair



Kathy L. Czarnecki, Recording Secretary