

Chair Lambert called the Regular meeting of the Troy City Planning Commission to order at 7:01 p.m. on January 10, 2023, in the Council Chamber of the Troy City Hall. Chair Lambert and Vice Chair Perakis presented opening remarks relative to the role of the Planning Commission and procedure of tonight’s meeting.

1. ROLL CALL

Present:

- Toby Buechner
- Carlton M. Faison
- Tyler Fox
- Michael W. Hutson
- Tom Krent
- David Lambert
- Lakshmi Malalahalli
- Marianna Perakis
- John J. Tagle

Also Present:

- R. Brent Savidant, Community Development Director
- Ben Carlisle, Carlisle Wortman Associates
- Julie Quinlan Dufrane, Assistant City Attorney
- Kathy L. Czarnecki, Recording Secretary

2. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Mr. Savidant announced the applicant for a potential Planned Unit Development application that was postponed at the December 13, 2022 meeting to tonight’s agenda would like to postpone the item indefinitely for personal reasons.

Resolution # PC-2023-01-001

Moved by: Faison
 Support by: Tagle

RESOLVED, To approve the Agenda as prepared.

Yes: All present (9)

MOTION CARRIED

3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – December 13, 2022

Resolution # PC-2023-01-002

Moved by: Fox
 Support by: Buechner

RESOLVED, To approve the minutes of the December 13, 2022 Regular meeting as submitted.

Yes: Buechner, Faison, Fox, Hutson, Krent, Lambert, Malalahalli, Tagle
Abstain: Perakis

MOTION CARRIED

4. PUBLIC COMMENT – For Items Not on the Agenda

There was no one present who wished to speak.

ZONING ORDINANCE TEXT AMENDMENT

5. PUBLIC HEARING – ZONING ORDINANCE TEXT AMENDMENT (File Number ZOTA 257)
– Places of Worship

Ms. Dufrane introduced proposed revisions to the Zoning Ordinance relating to places of worship because of a Zoning Board of Appeals litigation decision. She stated a Federal District Court Judge made known that portions of Sections 4.21 and 6.21 of the Zoning Ordinance are not enforceable as written. Ms. Dufrane emphasized the proposed revised text is not a directive from the Court but that the proposed revisions were drafted by the administration after a comprehensive review.

There was discussion, some comments related to:

- Proposed revisions as relates to the protection of residentially zoned properties; i.e., parking, setbacks, frontage and access to major or minor arterial roads.
- Zoning Ordinance definition of places of worship.
- Charge of the Zoning Administrator to interpret the Zoning Ordinance.
- Intent is to apply similar treatment to both religious institutions and nonreligious places of assembly and institutions.

Ms. Perakis stated she is not personally prepared this evening to recommend the text revisions as proposed.

PUBLIC HEARING OPENED

There was no one present who wished to speak.

PUBLIC HEARING CLOSED

Resolution # PC-2023-01-003

Moved by: Faison

Seconded by: Tagle

RESOLVED, That the Planning Commission hereby recommends to the City Council that Articles 4 and 6 of Chapter 39 of the Code of the City of Troy, which includes provisions related to places of worship, be amended as printed on the proposed Zoning Ordinance Text Amendment.

Discussion on the motion on the floor.

Chair Lambert said he is happy the City came forth with language that both eliminates some of the discriminatory language in the City’s Zoning Ordinance and at the same time protects the residential areas that might be impacted.

Vote on the motion on the floor.

Yes: Buechner, Faison, Fox, Hutson, Krent, Lambert, Malalahalli, Tagle
 No: Perakis

MOTION CARRIED

SPECIAL USE AND PRELIMINARY SITE PLAN APPROVALS

- 6. SPECIAL USE APPROVAL AND PRELIMINARY SITE PLAN REVIEW (File Number SU JPLN2022-0004) – Proposed 2690 Crooks Road Apartments, East side of Crooks, South of Big Beaver (2690 Crooks), Section 28, Currently Zoned BB (Big Beaver) District

Mr. Carlisle reviewed the Special Use and Preliminary Site Plan application for 2690 Crooks Road Apartments. The applicant proposes to repurpose the existing 4-story Lindsey Center building and construct a new 5-story multiple family residential building. Mr. Carlisle addressed the number of units, access and circulation, site arrangement, shared parking with 911 and 999 W. Big Beaver sites, waiver to relocate required parking lot trees and architectural features. Mr. Carlisle explained the Special Use Approval relates to the proposed residential use on the first floor not facing a public right of way. He reported the application includes a traffic study reviewed by both the City Traffic Consultant OHM Advisors and Oakland County Road Commission (OCRC). Mr. Carlisle said OHM and OCRC representatives are present this evening to address traffic and proposed shared parking.

(Mr. Savidant exited the meeting at 7:31 p.m.; returned at 7:33 p.m.)

Mr. Carlisle said as part of the deliberation, the Planning Commission should consider compliance with Section 5.04E Big Beaver Design Standards, Section 8.06 Site Plan Review Standards and Section 9.02.D Special Use Standards, as well the required transparency for the east, north and south elevations, parking lot tree location, proposed shared parking and consideration of providing a three-dimensional (3-D) rendering of the entire development.

Mr. Carlisle reported any approval this evening should be subject to the conditions identified in his report dated January 4, 2023 as part of Final Site Plan approval. Mr. Carlisle reminded the Board there was no public comment at the Public Hearing conducted at their December 13, 2022 meeting.

Board members expressed confusion in the review and deliberation of this application because of its relationship to Agenda item # 7 on tonight’s agenda.

It was determined the Planning Consultant would give a review on Agenda item #7, 911 and 999 W. Big Beaver Special Use Approval and Preliminary Site Plan application prior to taking any action on the 2690 Crooks Road application.

Applicant Jordan Jonna said the ownership structure of the subject parcels dictated the submission of individual applications. He noted that the south site (2690 Crooks) has sufficient parking to stand alone whether the north site (911 and 999 W. Big Beaver) is developed or not.

There was discussion, some comments related to:

- Building heights.
- Green recreational space deficiency.
- Shared parking.
 - Coordination of parking during construction phases.
 - Dynamics of shared parking among the various uses.

**Refer to page 6, Agenda item #7 for additional comments that relate to both applications.*

Resolution # PC-2023-01-xxx (motion withdrawn)

Moved by: Krent
 Seconded by: Faison

RESOLVED, The Planning Commission hereby approves a reduction in the total number of required parking spaces for the proposed 2690 Crooks Road residential development to 221 when a total of 312 spaces are required on the site based on the off-street parking space requirements for multi-family residential. This 91-space reduction is sufficient to meet parking demands based on shared parking provided on the abutting site to the north; and,

RESOLVED, That Special Use Approval and Preliminary Site Plan Approval for the proposed 2690 Crooks Road Apartments, east side of Crooks, south of Big Beaver (2690 Crooks), Section 28, Currently Zoned BB (Big Beaver) District, be granted, subject to the following conditions:

1. Increase the drive-aisle width to at least 26 feet.
2. Improve pedestrian circulation based on OHM’s comments.
3. Confirm existing screening of trash enclosure.
4. Confirm building lighting.
5. Verify unit numbers.
6. Provide a shared parking agreement to the satisfaction of the City Attorney prior to Final Site Plan Approval.
7. Provide transparency calculations.

Discussion on the motion on the floor.

Concerns discussed were:

- Required landscape trees in parking lot; impact to number of parking spaces.
- Non-friendly pedestrian walkability of site.
- Enhancement of green space.
- Improvements to access, circulation, and shared parking.

Mr. Krent withdrew his motion from the floor. Mr. Faison was in support of its withdrawal.

Resolution # PC-2023-01-004

Moved by: Tagle

Seconded by: Krent

RESOLVED, To postpone 2690 Crooks Road Apartments application so that the applicant may comply with the Zoning Ordinance requirements of interior parking lot landscaping, enhance the pedestrian walkways and to provide information to this Commission with regard to the distance to the parking spots for the residential units in excess of what is currently around the building.

Yes: All present (9)

MOTION CARRIED

7. PUBLIC HEARING - SPECIAL USE APPROVAL AND PRELIMINARY SITE PLAN REVIEW (File Number SU JPLN2022-0004) – Proposed 911 and 999 W. Big Beaver Mixed Use Development, Southeast corner of Big Beaver and Crooks (PIN 88-20-28-101-032, -034 and -047), Section 28, Currently Zoned BB (Big Beaver) District.

Mr. Carlisle reviewed the Special Use Approval and Preliminary Site Plan application for 911 and 999 W. Big Beaver that proposes to convert the existing Kelly Services site as a mixed use. He said the Special Use Approval relates to 1) a potential use of a financial institution drive-through, and 2) proposed residential use on the first floor not facing a public right of way. Mr. Carlisle said the applicant is seeking waivers for required setbacks for Buildings A and C. He noted the parking for Building E must be adjacent to the building.

Mr. Carlisle addressed access and site circulation, architectural features and deficiencies in the landscaping.

Mr. Carlisle reported as part of the deliberation, the Planning Commission should discuss compliance with Section 5.04.E Big Beaver Design Standards, Section 8.06 Site Plan Review Standards and Section 9.02D Special Use Standards, as well, architectural features, parking lot tree location, shared parking and setback waivers for placement of two buildings.

Mr. Carlisle said OHM and OCRC representatives are present this evening to address traffic and proposed shared parking.

Mr. Jonna addressed the relationship with Kelly Services Headquarters, complementary architectural features among buildings, development phases, current state of office space, parking deck and recreational amenities for all users of the sites. He addressed legal implications in the ownership structure of the subject parcels. Mr. Jonna said the project team is very comfortable with the proposed shared parking and briefly addressed parking calculations for both applications.

There was discussion, some comments related to:

- Shared parking and parking deck.
 - Distance to residential.
 - Location of parking deck for all users.
 - Parking calculations.
 - 2690 Crooks sufficient parking on its own.
- Improve walkability for pedestrians.
- Alternative site arrangement; access, circulation.
- Drive-through for financial institution.
- Open space deficiencies.
- Requirement for parking lot trees to break up pavement, create islands.
- Environmental resources.
- Recorded easement(s).
- Trash collection.

Project Architect Kevin Biddison addressed the subject parcels as relates to the residential use, public amenities and walking community.

Julie Kroll of Fleis & Vanderbrink addressed the parking study and analysis for both applications as relates to parking space calculations and number of parking spaces. She stated they are comfortable with the parking numbers.

PUBLIC HEAR OPENED

There was no one present who wished to speak.

PUBLIC HEARING CLOSED

Stephan Maxe of OHM Advisors addressed OHM comments on the traffic impact study as identified in their memorandum dated December 22, 0222 and their comments relating to the improvement of pedestrian circulation between the developments.

Resolution # PC-2023-01-005

Moved by: Fox
Seconded by: Buechner

RESOLVED, To postpone 911 and 999 W. Big Beaver Mixed Use Development application per the reasons discussed in the previous motion and including conditions as listed in the proposed Resolution (number one through nine) and that the applicant come back with a simplistic explanation and diagrams of the shared parking and circulation plans that clearly shows pedestrian amenities and how the subject sites are tied together.

Discussion on the motion on the floor.

- Easement to Tower Center Drive and to neighboring properties as relates to flow and connectivity.
- Drive-through facility as relates to environment, green space, walkability.
- Location of parking deck pursuant to Zoning Ordinance requirements.
- Concerns with pedestrian and vehicular circulation.
- Alternative commercial/retail uses other than drive-through financial institution.

Vote on the motion on the floor.

Yes: All present (9)

MOTION CARRIED

OTHER ITEMS

8. **ELECTION OF OFFICERS**

Chair Lambert opened the floor for nominations for Chair.

Ms. Perakis nominated David Lambert. Mr. Krent supported the nomination.

Acknowledging there were no further nominations, Chair Lambert closed the floor to nominations.

Roll Call vote on the nomination for *David Lambert as Chair.*

Yes: All present (9)

Chair Lambert opened the floor for nominations for Vice Chair.

Chair Lambert nominated Marianna Perakis. Mr. Buechner supported the nomination.

Acknowledging there were no further nominations, Chair Lambert closed the floor to nominations.

Roll Call vote on the nomination on the floor for *Marianna Perakis as Vice Chair.*

Yes: All present (9)

Chair Lambert opened the floor for nominations for Zoning Board of Appeals Representative.

Chair Lambert nominated Tyler Fox. Mr. Krent supported the nomination.

Acknowledging there were no further nominations, Chair Lambert closed the floor to nominations.

Roll Call vote on the recommendation of appointment for **Tyler Fox as ZBA Representative.**

Yes: All present (9)

9. PUBLIC COMMENT – For Items on the Agenda

There was no one present who wished to speak.

10. PLANNING COMMISSION COMMENT

There were general comments, some relating to:

- Welcome to Planning Commissioner Fox.
- Well wishes for the New Year.
- Potential future study on sustainability.

Ms. Dufrane gave an update on litigation of the Tollbrook (McClure and Alpine) matters.

11. ADJOURN

The Regular meeting of the Planning Commission adjourned at 9:45 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



David Lambert, Chair



Kathy L. Czarnecki, Recording Secretary