

Chair Lambert called the Regular meeting of the Troy City Planning Commission to order at 7:00 p.m. on March 14, 2023, in the Council Chamber of the Troy City Hall. Chair Lambert and Vice Chair Perakis presented opening remarks relative to the role of the Planning Commission and procedure of tonight’s meeting.

1. ROLL CALL

Present:

Toby Buechner
 Carlton M. Faison
 Tyler Fox
 Michael W. Hutson
 Tom Krent
 David Lambert
 Lakshmi Malalahalli
 Marianna Perakis
 John J. Tagle

Also Present:

Ben Carlisle, Carlisle Wortman & Associates
 R. Brent Savidant, Community Development Director
 Julie Quinlan Dufrane, Assistant City Attorney (arrived 7:01 p.m.)
 Kathy L. Czarnecki, Recording Secretary

2. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Resolution # PC-2023-03-017

Moved by: Faison
 Support by: Krent

RESOLVED, To approve the Agenda as prepared.

Yes: All present (9)

MOTION CARRIED

3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – February 28, 2023

Mr. Fox asked that the February 28, 2023 minutes reflect an additional bullet under Agenda item #8, Planning Commission Comment, on page 5:

- The Planning Commission discussed the possibility of having a joint meeting with the City Council to discuss potential application ordinance amendments that relate to environmental sustainability. No official motion was made.

Resolution # PC-2023-03-018

Moved by: Fox

Support by: Malalahalli

RESOLVED, To approve the minutes of the February 28, 2023 Regular meeting as amended.

Yes: All present (9)

MOTION CARRIED

4. **PUBLIC COMMENT** – For Items Not on the Agenda

There was no one present who wished to speak.

SPECIAL USE AND PRELIMINARY SITE PLAN APPROVALS

Chair Lambert asked the applicant, Board members and the administration if there are any objections to combining Agenda items #5 and #6 for Planning Consultant presentations and discussion.

Applicant Jordon Jonna and Board members stated no objections. Ms. Dufrane said she has no objection and asked that the record reflect discussion relates to both applications.

5. **SPECIAL USE APPROVAL AND PRELIMINARY SITE PLAN REVIEW (File Number SU JPLN2022-0004)** – Proposed 2690 Crooks Road Apartments, East side of Crooks, South of Big Beaver (2690 Crooks), Section 28, Currently Zoned BB (Big Beaver) District

6. **SPECIAL USE APPROVAL AND PRELIMINARY SITE PLAN REVIEW (File Number SU JPLN2022-0004)** – Proposed 911 and 999 W. Big Beaver Mixed Use Development, Southeast corner of Big Beaver and Crooks (PIN 88-20-28-101-032, -034 and -047), Section 28, Currently Zoned BB (Big Beaver) District

Planning Consultant presentation on 2690 Crooks Road Apartments

Mr. Carlisle reviewed the Special Use and Preliminary Site Plan application for 2690 Crooks Road Apartments. He addressed the conversion of the existing Lindsey Center to create 62 units and construct a new 4-story, 82-unit multiple family residential building for a total of 144 units. Mr. Carlisle reported the Planning Commission postponed action on the item at the January 10, 2023 Planning Commission meeting after considerable discussion on building heights, deficiency of green space, improvement on pedestrian walkability and proposed shared parking.

Mr. Carlisle reported the following Site Plan changes since last reviewed.

- Removed one (1)-story from rear building; building is now 4 stories.
 - Removed first floor in-building parking for rear building.
 - Reduced number of units by 12. Site total is 144 units.
 - Reconfigured unit types by providing 41 studio/efficiency units. Zero (0) efficiency units were provided in the previous plan.

- Added internal parking lot landscape islands.
 - Increased site landscaping by 1.8%.
- Revised pedestrian connection between site and northern property (Kelly Services site).

Mr. Carlisle noted representatives from the City Traffic Consultant OHM Advisors are present this evening to address OHM's comments in its memorandum dated March 7, 2023 regarding shared parking and any parking concerns the Board members might have.

Mr. Carlisle said as part of the deliberation, the Planning Commission and applicant shall discuss:

- Compliance with Section 5.04.E Big Beaver Design Standards.
- Compliance with Section 8.06 Site Plan Review Standards.
- Compliance with 9.02.D Special Use Standards.
- Architecture and material use:
 - Transparency for east, north, and south elevations on new building.
 - Consideration of a 3-D model of the buildings in context to the site and to each other.
- Parking lot tree location.
- Shared parking.

Mr. Carlisle stated if Planning Commission approves the Preliminary Site Plan and Special Use application, the following conditions shall be required as part of the Final Site plan submittal:

1. Update Table of Land Use and Zoning calculations provided on sheet C-3 of the plan set.
2. Address OHM's comments.
3. Provide trash enclosure screening details that comply with Section 13.02.
4. Provide a Shared Parking Agreement to the satisfaction of the City Attorney.

Planning Consultant presentation on 911 and 999 W Big Beaver Mixed Use Development

Mr. Carlisle reviewed the Special Use Approval and Preliminary Site Plan for the 911 and 999 W. Big Beaver Mixed Use Development application. He addressed proposed improvements for new Buildings A, B, C, D and E, the new 4-story parking deck located to the rear of the existing Kelly Services Building, landscaping, lighting and other site amenities. He said the plan is to demolish the existing 5-story (911 Big Beaver) building but keep the existing 10-story Kelly Services building (999 Big Beaver) as an office building.

Mr. Carlisle reported the Planning Commission postponed action on the item at the January 10, 2023 Planning Commission meeting after considerable discussion and comments relating to:

- Shared parking and parking deck.
- Improve walkability for pedestrians.
- Alternative site arrangement, access, circulation.
- Drive-through for financial institution.
- Open space deficiencies.
- Requirement for parking lot trees to break up pavement, create islands.
- Trash collection.

Mr. Carlisle reported the following Site Plan changes since last reviewed.

- Added parking lot landscaping by reducing 13 parking spaces to the overall parking site.
- Increased site landscaping to 15.5%.
- Reconfigured parking between Crooks Road and Building E.
- Added some additional internal pedestrian crosswalks.
- Demonstrated stacking space and dimensions for drive-through use.

Mr. Carlisle said representatives from the City Traffic Consultant OHM Advisors are present this evening to address OHM's review of the site circulation, shared parking and any parking concerns.

Mr. Carlisle addressed consideration of the applicant's request to seek dimensional waivers on Building A and Building C, drive-through standards for the proposed financial institution, replacement of the first-floor residential use along the eastern (*corrected to western, see Resolution #PC-2023-03-021*) elevation (Crooks), increase in internal landscaping and alternative location of parking lot trees.

Mr. Carlisle said as part of the deliberation, the Planning Commission and applicant shall discuss.

- Two (2) building placement waiver requests.
- Compliance with Section 5.04.E Big Beaver Design Standards.
- Compliance with Section 8.06 Site Plan Review Standards.
- Compliance with 9.02.D Special Use Standards.
- Architecture and material use.
- Parking lot tree location.
- Shared parking.

Mr. Carlisle reported if the Planning Commission approves the Preliminary Site Plan and Special Use application, the following conditions shall be required as part of the Final Site plan submittal:

1. Review and revise site plan based on OHM's comments.
2. For Building E, replace use of first-floor residential with a non-residential use along the eastern (*corrected to western, see Resolution #PC-2023-03-021*) elevation (Crooks).
3. Provide transparency calculations on the elevation plan set.
4. Provide a Shared Parking Agreement to the satisfaction of the City Attorney.

Discussion on 2690 Crooks Road Apartments and 911 and 999 W Big Beaver Mixed Use Development

Discussion among administration and Planning Commission:

- Confirmation on number of units in Lindsey Center (total 144).
- Efficiency unit; definition, required number of parking spaces per unit.
- 3-D rendering; views from different perspectives.
- Shared Parking Agreement; how it relates to overall site.
- Ownership of parcels.

Traffic Engineer Lauren Hull of OHM Advisors addressed shared parking between the two sites as relates to ownership structure and the pedestrian connectivity of the sites during on-going construction development stages.

Ms. Hull answered questions from the Board relating to parking for Lindsey Center, overflow parking, walking distance to parking from residential units, and pedestrian traffic flow. She indicated OHM's report focus was within the subject site.

Sara Merrill of OHM Advisors addressed the proposed shared parking, surface space parking, non-designation of parking spaces, flexibility in first-come, first-served parking spaces, calculations of overall parking spaces, walkability to parking from residential units, Zoning Ordinance parking requirements based on residential units and shared access drive to Big Beaver. She noted the south site is deficient 51 spaces but there would be no parking space deficiency with the utilization of the site to the north.

Ms. Merrill answered questions relating to the walking distance to parking from residential units, especially given inclement weather.

Applicant Jordan Jonna introduced the development team present in the audience: Project Engineer Eric Williams of Stonefield, Project Architect Kevin Biddison, Traffic Engineer Julie Kroll of Fleis & Vandenbrink and Austin Armstrong of AF Jonna Development.

Mr. Jonna said a cross access easement between the sites would be provided. He addressed changes in the applications, notably the reduction of number of units in the Lindsey Center, additional landscaping and parking lot trees and a reduction of parking spaces by offering studio/efficiency units. Mr. Jonna addressed circulation and traffic flow on site, access connection to Big Beaver, utilization of the parking deck and first-floor parking spaces in Building C, proposed landbanked parking and overall number of onsite parking spaces to accommodate residents.

Traffic Engineer Julie Kroll of Fleis & Vandenbrink addressed the parking analysis prepared for both the north and south sites combined. She indicated parking requirements for the Lindsey Center (south site) do not meet Zoning Ordinance requirements, and the parking requirements for the north site (Kelly Services) do meet Zoning Ordinance requirements. Ms. Kroll stated shared parking between the two sites would provide overall adequate parking in the event the Lindsey Center site needs additional parking.

- There was considerable discussion on parking:
 - Assurance parking is sufficient.
 - Walking distance to parking from residential units; concern with distance during inclement weather.
 - Non-designation of parking spaces.
 - Parking calculations per unit.
 - Landbanked parking.

Mr. Jonna said he is very comfortable with the number of parking spaces provided.

Discussion continued, some comments related to:

- Site layout restrictions relating to major tenant, Kelly Services.
- Amenities on site and additional amenities to attract/engage residents and community.
- First-floor non-residential uses; office, retail, restaurant.
- Retention basin on site; year-round wet pond.
- Alternative use for proposed financial institution.
- Pedestrian circulation, pathways.
- Sustainable, energy-efficient resources.
- Variable percentage of leasing occupancy.
- Photometrics plan.

Ms. Perakis expressed disappointment with the development. She said the plans appear not to have changed much since last reviewed. Ms. Perakis suggested an alternative site arrangement of buildings. Ms. Perakis addressed the application as relates to the Master Plan, Design Standards, Zoning Ordinance and the relationship between the applicant and Kelly Services. She said she is not in favor of the development as proposed.

Mr. Jonna said they respect their relationship with Kelly Services and acknowledged they are working with constrictions on the site arrangement. He stated the project team has considered many different layouts of the site and considers the application before the Board a good plan. Mr. Jonna said he does not want to see the site remain vacant and good management would attend to any need for overflow parking. He addressed how the project team would go forward should only one application get approval this evening.

Mr. Hutson expressed support for the development as proposed, noting the subject corner has been a very challenging corner to develop.

Chair Lambert opened the floor for public comment. Acknowledging there was no one present who wished to speak, Chair Lambert closed the floor for public comment.

Mr. Fox said after walking the site, he feels the walking distance from residential to available parking is reasonable, and that he believes parking should not be a criterion on approval of the application.

Resolutions on 2690 Crooks Road Apartments

Resolution # PC-2023-03-019

Moved by: Perakis

Seconded by: Lambert

RESOLVED, That Special Use Approval and Preliminary Site Plan Approval for the proposed 2690 Crooks Road Apartments, east side of Crooks, south of Big Beaver (2690 Crooks), Section 28, Currently Zoned BB (Big Beaver) District, be denied, for the following reasons: * *Note: Application location corrected by Recording Secretary during minute preparation, as corrected by the Assistant City Attorney during discussion on Resolution #PC-2023-03-020.*

1. The shared parking is not supported.
2. The application does not meet the Design Standards, Section 8.06, c.1. through 5, or Section 8.06 a.1.
3. The application does not comply with the Special Use Standards, Section 9.03, a.2 or b.2.

Discussion on the motion on the floor.

Ms. Perakis said the application poses a problem with parking, especially for senior residents because there is no designated parking and the long distance to walk from residential units to parking.

Mr. Fox said he does not support denial of the application based on parking. He indicated the parking requirements are met with the proposed shared parking and believes it is the developer/owner's determination if the walking distance to parking is too long of a distance for some residents.

Mr. Krent agreed parking requirements are met with the proposed shared parking and he agrees with the comments expressed by Mr. Fox. Mr. Krent noted the Shared Parking Agreement would be in effect should only the southern portion of the application be granted approval.

Mr. Faison agreed with the comments expressed by Mr. Fox and Mr. Krent.

Ms. Malalahalli expressed concerns the entire project might fail if only one of the applications is approved, based on comments expressed by the applicant.

Mr. Carlisle advised the Board that each application should be considered, deliberated and voted on separately.

Mr. Savidant reminded Board members that the application before the Board is not only a Site Plan approval but also a Special Use Approval, to which specific conditions can be applied to its approval should the Board desire.

Mr. Tagle said parking is an extremely important element of the development. He is in support of placing conditions on its approval that relate to providing designated parking for the Lindsey Center and utilization of the landbanked parking.

Vote on the motion on the floor.

Yes: Perakis

No: Buechner, Faison, Fox, Hutson, Krent, Lambert, Malalahalli, Tagle

MOTION FAILED

Resolution # PC-2023-03-

Moved by: Fox

Seconded by: Krent

RESOLVED, The Planning Commission hereby approves shared parking between 911 and 999 W. Big Beaver Road and 2690 Crooks Road, with the following condition:

1. That there is designated parking for the southern building in the Shared Parking Agreement with 2690 Crooks Road, along with the proposed landbanked parking as designated in the blue rectangular box on Site Plan.

RESOLVED, That Special Use Approval and Preliminary Site Plan Approval for the proposed 2690 Crooks Road Apartments, east side of Crooks, south of Big Beaver (2690 Crooks), Section 28, Currently Zoned BB (Big Beaver) District, be granted, with the following conditions: * *Note: Motion amended to correctly identify the application location, as corrected by the Assistant City Attorney.*

1. Update Table of Land Use and Zoning calculations provided on sheet C-3 of the plan set.
2. Address OHMs comment /concerns.
3. Provide trash enclosure screening details that comply with section 13.02.
4. Provide a Shared Parking Agreement to the satisfaction of the City Attorney.

Discussion of the motion on the floor.

Ms. Merrill of OHM Advisors indicated the 2690 Crooks Road site is 51 spaces deficient, that 196 spaces are proposed for the 144 units on site, that the 80% percentile anticipated peak parking demand would bring the number to 172 spaces, and the Zoning Ordinance requires 247 spaces. Ms. Merrill suggested that the Resolution provide enough parking spaces to meet the Zoning Ordinance requirement of 247 spaces.

It was determined during discussion that the proposed landbanked parking in the blue rectangular box comprise of 48 parking spaces.

Ms. Dufrane explained how the Shared Parking Agreement would work should the northern parcel be developed in the future with new ownership.

Chair Lambert said he would vote affirmatively on the motion based on tonight’s discussion, the Resolution as presented, and the application meeting all requirements.

Motion on the floor was revised to read:

Resolution # PC-2023-03-020

Moved by: Fox
 Seconded by: Krent

RESOLVED, The Planning Commission hereby approves shared parking between 911 and 999 W. Big Beaver Road and 2690 Crooks Road; with the following condition:

1. That there is designated parking for the southern building in the Shared Parking Agreement with 2690 Crooks, along with the proposed 28 landbanked parking spaces.

RESOLVED, That Special Use Approval and Preliminary Site Plan Approval for the proposed 2690 Crooks Road Apartments, east side of Crooks, south of Big Beaver (2690 Crooks), Section 28, Currently Zoned BB (Big Beaver) District, be granted, with the following conditions:

1. Update Table of Land Use and Zoning calculations provided on sheet C-3 of the plan set.
2. Address OHMs comment /concerns.
3. Provide trash enclosure screening details that comply with Section 13.02.
4. Provide a Shared Parking Agreement to the satisfaction of the City Attorney, that also includes the designation as highlighted.

Yes: Buechner, Faison, Fox, Hutson, Krent, Lambert, Malalahalli, Tagle
 No: Perakis

MOTION CARRIED

Resolutions on 911 and 999 W. Big Beaver Mixed Use Development

Resolution # PC-2023-03-021

Moved by: Fox
 Seconded by: Lambert

RESOLVED, The Planning Commission hereby approves shared parking between 911 and 999 W. Big Beaver Road and 2690 Crooks Road; and,

RESOLVED, That Special Use Approval and Preliminary Site Plan Approval for the proposed 911 and 999 W. Big Beaver Mixed Use Development, southeast corner of Big

Beaver and Crooks (PIN 88-20-28-101-032, -034 and -047), Section 28, Currently Zoned BB (Big Beaver) District, be granted, subject to the following conditions:

1. Review and revise site plan based on OHM’s comments.
2. For Building E, replace use of first-floor residential along eastern elevation and the northern elevation.
3. Provide transparency calculations on the elevation plan set.
4. Provide a Shared Parking Agreement to the satisfaction of the City Attorney.

Discussion on the motion on the floor.

Mr. Carlisle advised Mr. Fox that the northern elevation of Building E is first-floor covered surface parking. Mr. Fox, in turn, asked that the motion strike the reference to the northern elevation in condition #2.

Mr. Savidant declared an error on the administration’s part with reference to the eastern elevation for Building E and it should read *western* elevation in condition #2.

Motion on the floor was revised to read:

RESOLVED, The Planning Commission hereby approves shared parking between 911 and 999 W. Big Beaver Road and 2690 Crooks Road; and,

RESOLVED, That Special Use Approval and Preliminary Site Plan Approval for the proposed 911 and 999 W. Big Beaver Mixed Use Development, southeast corner of Big Beaver and Crooks (PIN 88-20-28-101-032, -034 and -047), Section 28, Currently Zoned BB (Big Beaver) District, be granted, subject to the following conditions:

1. Review and revise site plan based on OHM’s comments.
2. For Building E, replace use of first-floor residential along the western elevation.
3. Provide transparency calculations on the elevation plan set.
4. Provide a Shared Parking Agreement to the satisfaction of the City Attorney.

Yes: Faison, Fox, Hutson, Krent

No: Buechner, Lambert, Malalahalli, Perakis, Tagle

MOTION FAILED

OTHER ITEMS

7. PUBLIC COMMENT – For Items on the Agenda

Jordan Jonna, AF Jonna Development, thanked the Board for their consideration this evening of both applications. He said the project is a complex one and the development team would continue to make improvements and work through phasing the development.

Mr. Carlisle said the administration in its review looked at all the uses as a whole and it was determined that they could not make a recommendation this evening based on specific uses.

8. PLANNING COMMISSION COMMENT

There were comments relating to review of the Zoning Ordinance parking requirements:

- Flexibility of the current parking requirements allows for landbanking, reducing and sharing parking spaces.
- Elimination of parking requirements in some municipalities.
- Parking requirements as relates to lifestyle changes.

Mr. Krent encouraged Mr. Jonna to add vibrancy and community engagement to the mixed use development presented this evening.

Mr. Jonna advocated the City's review of its parking requirements and to compare them with other municipalities.

Mr. Savidant announced City Council approved unanimously the following items at their March 13, 2023 meeting:

- Long Lake and Crooks Planned Unit Development application (File Number PUD 2020-0018).
- Zoning Ordinance Text Amendment (ZOTA 257) relating to Places of Worship.

Chair Lambert reported environmental sustainability was a discussion topic at the last City Council meeting. He said the City Council is considering holding a study session in the summer and possibly extending an invitation to the Planning Commission.

Mr. Savidant shared there might be an opportunity to conduct a study session on environmental sustainability after approval of the City budget, which is the immediate focus of the administration and City Council.

9. ADJOURN

The Regular meeting of the Planning Commission adjourned at 9:35 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



David Lambert, Chair



Kathy L. Czarneda, Recording Secretary