Chair Perakis called the Regular meeting of the Troy City Planning Commission to order at 7:00 p.m. on July 23, 2024, in the Council Chamber of the Troy City Hall. Chair Perakis and Vice Chair Malalahalli presented opening remarks relative to the role of the Planning Commission and procedure of tonight's meeting.

1. ROLL CALL

<u>Present:</u> Toby Buechner Carlton M. Faison Tyler Fox Michael W. Hutson Tom Krent David Lambert Lakshmi Malalahalli Marianna Perakis John J. Tagle

<u>Also Present:</u> Ben Carlisle, Carlisle Wortman & Associates Allan Motzny, Assistant City Attorney Kathy L. Czarnecki, Recording Secretary

2. <u>APPROVAL OF AGENDA</u>

Ms. Malalahalli asked to move Agenda item #7 after Agenda item #4.

Resolution # PC-2024-07-043

Moved by: Malalahalli Support by: Lambert

RESOLVED, To approve the agenda as revised.

Yes: All present (9)

MOTION CARRIED

3. <u>APPROVAL OF MINUTES</u> – July 9, 2024

Resolution # PC-2024-07-044

Moved by: Buechner Support by: Fox

RESOLVED, To approve the minutes of July 9, 2024 Regular meeting as submitted.

Yes: Buechner, Faison, Fox, Hutson, Krent, Lambert, Malalahalli, Perakis Abstain: Tagle

MOTION CARRIED

4. <u>PUBLIC COMMENT</u> – For Items Not on the Agenda

There was no one present who wished to speak.

PRELIMINARY SITE PLAN APPROVAL

(Refer to revised agenda per Resolution # PC-2024-07-043)

 PRELIMINARY SITE PLAN APPROVAL (JPLN2023-0031) – Proposed Wattles Square Apartments, South side of Wattles and East of John R (PIN 88-20-24-100-039), Section 24, Zoned NN (Neighborhood Node "F") Zoning District

Mr. Carlisle addressed the revisions to the Wattles Square Apartments application since it was last considered by the Planning Commission at its May 28, 2024 meeting. He said the applicant has provided a fence along the eastern and southern property lines and submitted revised elevations as relates to architectural design features and color scheme. Mr. Carlisle addressed the City Traffic Consultant OHM memorandum that states traffic generated from the proposed site will not present significant impacts to Wattles Road, John R Road or the surrounding roadway network.

In summary, Mr. Carlisle said the by-right application meets all the requirements of the Zoning Ordinance. He asked the Planning Commission to consider in its deliberations if the application complies with the Site Plan Design Review Standards set forth in Section 8.06.

Present were Richard Atto and Landscape Architect Stacee Hadeed.

Some comments during discussion related to the following:

- Public comment and signed petitions received and distributed to the Board prior to the beginning of tonight's meeting.
- Permitted uses within the Neighborhood Node zoning district.
- Transition between proposed development to residential properties.
- Applicant's efforts to mitigate light, noise, odor, sound and traffic.
- Reduction in building height compared to single family homes.
- Existing trees on site; tree survey, size and type of proposed trees.
- Marketing target of tenants.
- Recreational amenities and community space.

Chair Perakis acknowledged the number of residents in the audience. She asked by a show of hands to determine how many were in support or opposition of the proposed application. The count was 27 in opposition; zero in support.

It was the consensus of the Board to open the floor for public comment.

PUBLC COMMENT OPENED

The following persons spoke in opposition. The majority of concerns voiced related to safety, privacy, trash, overflow parking, traffic, light pollution and not a fit for the neighboring properties. Some comments related to the traffic data and summary provided by OHM.

- Anuratha Battula, 3930 Macaw Drive
- Fred Przybysz, 3842 Wayfarer
- Humberto Gonzales, 3939 Macaw
- Peter Wilkins, 3905 Wayfarer
- Michael Madley, 3831 Wayfarer
- Robert Mansour, 2153 Cumberland
- Angela Yuan, 3815 Wayfarer
- Manishe Sheran, 3895 Macaw
- Sonny Quan, 3922 Macaw
- Andrzej Olszweski, 2369 Newbedford
- Trey Brice, Taft Law, 27777 Franklin #2500, Southfield
- Ravi Bhamidipati, 3886 Sandpiper
- Ellen Thomas, 2198 Cumberland
- Laura Wilkins, 3905 Wayfarer
- Chandou Boopalam, 3894 Sandpiper

PUBLIC COMMENT CLOSED

Mr. Carlisle addressed:

- Methodology and ITE standards used by OHM in its traffic review.
- Stormwater management; full engineering review at Final Site Plan review/approval.
- Proposed development as relates to the current Master Plan.

Mr. Buechner said he does not support the application. It is his opinion some of the Site Plan design standards and Neighborhood Node characteristics are not met.

Mr. Motzny advised the Board's determination of approval should be based on whether the application meets the requirements of the Zoning Ordinance. He said the Master Plan is a guide only.

Mr. Atto addressed:

- Snow removal.
- Fence material.
- Price point of rental units.

Mr. Tagle addressed dimensional drawings and renderings as relates to a perception of distance from adjacent properties.

Mr. Hutson said he does not support the application. He addressed concerns with the safety of subterranean residential units, lack of recreational amenities for public use, and the application not meeting Neighborhood Node characteristics.

Resolution # PC-2024-07-045

Moved by:	Faison
Seconded by:	Fox

RESOLVED, That Preliminary Site Plan Approval, pursuant to Article 8 of the Zoning Ordinance, as requested for the proposed Wattles Square Apartments, located on the South side of Wattles, East of John R, Section 24, Zoned NN (Neighborhood Node "F") Zoning District, be **granted**.

Discussion on the motion on the floor.

Mr. Lambert addressed future changes to the Master Plan as relates to Neighborhood Node zoning districts.

Mr. Krent said he supports the application because it meets all requirements of the Zoning Ordinance.

Vote on the motion on the floor.

Yes: Faison, Fox, Krent, Lambert, Malalahalli, Perakis, Tagle No: Buechner, Hutson

MOTION CARRIED

SPECIAL USE REQUEST

5. <u>SPECIAL USE AND PRELIMINARY SITE PLAN REVIEW (SU JPLN2024-003)</u> – Proposed Starbucks with drive through, North side of Big Beaver, West of John R (1735 E. Big Beaver), Section 23, Currently Zoned CB (Community Business) Zoning District

Mr. Carlisle addressed the revisions to the Starbucks application since last reviewed at the May 14, 2024 Regular meeting, as relates to the circulation plan for the Troy Sports Center parking lot, the dumpster location, required landscaping and pedestrian improvements.

In summary, Mr. Carlisle asked the Planning Commission in its deliberations to consider if the application complies with the Special Use Standards and the Site Plan Review Design Standards as set forth Section 9.03 and Section 8.06 of the Zoning Ordinance, respectively.

Project Engineer James Butler of the PEA Group was present. He briefly addressed the addition of parking lot trees, traffic circulation, pedestrian improvements and ADA parking.

Chair Perakis opened the floor for public comment. Acknowledging there was no one present who wished to speak, Chair Perakis closed the floor for public comment.

Resolution # PC-2024-07-046

Moved by:	Lambert
Support by:	Fox

RESOLVED, That Special Use Approval and Preliminary Site Plan Approval for the proposed Starbucks with drive through, North side of Big Beaver, West of John R (1735 E. Big Beaver), Section 23, Currently Zoned CB (Community Business) District, be **granted**, subject to the following condition:

1. Submittal of a photometric plan approved by the City staff.

Yes: All present (9)

MOTION CARRIED

PRELIMINARY SITE PLAN APPROVAL

6. <u>PRELIMINARY SITE PLAN APPROVAL (JPLN2023-0028)</u> – Proposed John R Commons Townhome Development, West side of John R, North of Big Beaver (PIN 88-20-23-476-017), Section 23, Zoned MF (Multi-Family Residential) Zoning District

Mr. Carlisle addressed the revisions to the John R Commons Townhome Development since last reviewed at the May 14, 2024 Regular meeting, as relates to the Troy Sports Center circulation improvements and architectural design.

In summary, Mr. Carlisle asked the Planning Commission to consider in its deliberations whether the application meets the Site Plan Review Design Standards as set forth in Section 8.06 of the Zoning Ordinance.

Project Engineer Greg Bono of the PEA Group and Project Architect Brian Neeper were present.

Some comments during discussion related to the following:

- Access points to site.
- Recreational amenities in common area.
- Stormwater detention area.
- Path/trail on north side of the pond.

- Architectural elevations; building material.
- Site layout of residential units.
- Additional landscaping adjacent to Building 16.
- Techniques for traffic calming/mitigation along the north drive aisle.

Chair Perakis opened the floor for public comment. Acknowledging there was no one present who wished to speak, Chair Perakis closed the floor for public comment.

Resolution # PC-2024-07-047

Moved by:	Fox
Support by:	Buechner

RESOLVED, That Preliminary Site Plan Approval, pursuant to Article 8 of the Zoning Ordinance, as requested for the proposed John R Commons Townhome Development, located on the West side of John R, North of Big Beaver, Section 23, Zoned MF (Multi-Family Residential) District, be **granted**, subject to the following condition:

1. Applicant explores the traffic speeding mitigation on the entire site to the satisfaction of the Planning Department.

Discussion on the motion on the floor.

Mr. Lambert said he would prefer an EVA (Emergency Vehicular Access) at the western access point.

Vote on the motion on the floor.

Yes: Buechner, Faison, Fox, Hutson, Krent, Malalahalli, Perakis, Tagle No: Lambert

MOTION CARRIED

OTHER ITEMS

8. <u>PUBLIC COMMENT</u> – For Items on the Agenda

There was no one present who wished to speak.

9. PLANNING COMMISSION COMMENT

There were general Planning Commission comments, some relating to:

- Analysis/study of parking requirements in the Zoning Ordinance.
- Data/demographics relating to apartments in comparison to single family homes and like communities.

10. ADJOURN

The Regular meeting of the Planning Commission adjourned at 9:56 p.m.

7

Respectfully submitted,

MJP

Marianna J. Perakis, Chair

Kathy L. Garnechi

Kathy L. Czarnecki, Recording Secretary

G:\PLANNING COMMISSION MINUTES\2024 PC MINUTES\FINAL\2024 07 23 FINAL.docx