



500 West Big Beaver  
Troy, MI 48084  
troymi.gov

# CITY COUNCIL AGENDA ITEM



Date: November 6, 2024

To: Frank Nastasi, City Manager

From: Robert J. Bruner, Deputy City Manager  
 Kyle Vieth, Controller  
 Kurt Bovensiep, Public Works Director  
 Dennis Trantham, Deputy Public Works Director  
 Emily Frontera, Purchasing Manager

Subject: Standard Purchasing Resolution 2: Low Bidder Meeting Specifications – Snow Removal Services for Municipal Building Sidewalks and Parking Lots

## History

The Facilities and Grounds Division is responsible for the comprehensive snow and ice removal on all municipal properties to ensure safe access for the public and staff. Our coverage includes clearing parking lots, building entrances, and sidewalks at key city facilities, including; City Hall, Library, 52-4 District Court, Police Department, Community Center, Troy Historic Village, Stage Nature Center, Transit Center, Fire Stations, Fire and Police Training Center, and Camp Ticonderoga. In total the winter maintenance effort included in the contract covers over 35,300 linear feet of sidewalk (8.5 miles), and more 1,240,800 square feet (28 acres) of parking lot areas.

Parks and trails are serviced with in-house Department of Public Works staff.

## Purchasing

- On October 24, 2024 a bid opening was conducted as required by the City Charter/Code for seasonal requirements of Snow Removal Services with an option to renew for two (2) additional seasons.
- The bid was posted on the MITN Purchasing Group website; [www.bidnetdirect.com/city-of-troy-mi](http://www.bidnetdirect.com/city-of-troy-mi). Four hundred thirty-five (435) vendors were notified via the MITN website. Three (3) bids were received. Below is a detail summary of potential vendors for the bid opportunity:

<b>Companies notified via MITN</b>	435	<p><b>MITN</b> provides a resourceful online platform to streamline the procurement process, reduce costs, and make it easier and more transparent for vendors to do business with the City of Troy.</p> <p><b>Active MITN</b> members with a current membership and paying annual dues receive automatic electronic notification which allows instant access to Bids, RFPS and Quote opportunities with the City.</p> <p><b>Active MITN non-paying members</b> are responsible to monitor and check the MITN website for opportunities to do business with the City.</p> <p><b>Inactive MITN member</b> status can occur when a company does not renew their account upon expiration. Inactive members cannot be notified of solicitations or access any bid information.</p>
Troy Companies notified via MITN	7	
Troy Companies - Active email Notification	7	
Troy Companies - Active Free	0	
<b>Companies that viewed the bid</b>	87	
Troy Companies that viewed the bid	1	



500 West Big Beaver  
Troy, MI 48084  
troymi.gov

## CITY COUNCIL AGENDA ITEM

### **Purchasing (continued)**

After review of the bid proposals and in the best interest of the City, it was determined that no benefit would be gained by awarding each item separately. Therefore, it is being recommended to combine all line items and to award Proposal A to the overall low bidder meeting specifications *Russell Landscaping, Inc of Troy, MI*. Additionally, there will be no award for Proposal B as Proposal A was found to be more cost effective.

### **Financial**

Funds are budgeted and available for snow and ice removal services in the various department operating budgets.

### **Recommendation**

City Management recommends awarding a contract to provide seasonal requirements of snow removal services for municipal building sidewalks and parking lots with an option to renew for two (2) additional seasons to *Russell Landscaping, Inc. of Troy, MI* for Proposal A at unit prices contained in the bid tabulation dated October 24, 2024.

In addition, City Management is recommending the approval to allow City administration to extend the pricing established in Proposal A to other vendors for emergency conditions of snow and ice removal.

BID TABULATION  
 SNOW REMOVAL SERVICES  
 CITY OF TROY

VENDOR NAME:	Russell Landscaping, Inc.	DEQ Property Services, LLC dba Snow Plow Group	RNA Facilities Management
CITY:	Troy, MI	Armada, MI	Ypsilanti, MI

**PROPOSAL: TO FURNISH SEASONAL REQUIREMENTS OF SNOW REMOVAL SERVICES FOR THE CITY OF TROY MUNICIPAL PARKING LOTS, BUILDING ENTRANCES AND SIDEWALKS WITH AN OPTION TO RENEW FOR TWO – ONE (1) YEAR RENEWAL OPTIONS**

PROPOSAL (A): City Owned Properties – Parking Lots, Building Entrances and Sidewalks								
Item	Type of Equipment	Unit	# Dedicated	Cost per Hour (Hourly Rates all inclusive)	# Dedicated	Cost per Hour (Hourly Rates all inclusive)	# Dedicated	Cost per Hour (Hourly Rates all inclusive)
<b>Parking Lots:</b>								
1	5-10 Yd. Capacity Truck w/Salting Capabilities	Hour	2	\$125.00	1	\$150.00	1	\$200.00
2	Front End Loader - 5 yd. Capacity w/Snow Pusher	Hour	2	\$200.00		Not Specified	0	\$200.00
3	Front End Loader - 3 yd. Capacity w/Snow Pusher	Hour	2	\$165.00	1	\$175.00	2	\$200.00
4	Skid Steer with Snow Pusher	Hour	1	\$150.00		Not Specified	2	\$165.00
5	Pickup with 8 ft. Blade	Hour	3	\$125.00	1	\$150.00	6	\$125.00
6	Truck with 10 ft. Snowplow	Hour	2	\$125.00		Not Specified	0	\$200.00
7	Parking Lot Salt	Ton		\$150.00		\$240.00		\$220.00
<b>Sidewalks:</b>								
8	Utility Vehicle with 5' Snow Plow	Hour	1	\$120.00	3	\$75.00	4	\$150.00
9	Utility Vehicle with Salt Spreader	Hour	1	\$120.00		Not Specified	2	\$150.00
10	Utility Vehicle w/ 5' Snow Plow & Salt Spreader	Hour	1	\$120.00		Not Specified	2	\$150.00
11	Utility Tractor Mounted Snow Blower	Hour	1	\$200.00		Not Specified		Not Specified
12	Walk-Behind Snow Blower	Hour	30	\$70.00	3	\$75.00	8	\$75.00
13	Snow Shovel and Operator	Hour	15	\$65.00	6	\$75.00	20	\$60.00
14	Walk-Behind Salt Spreader with Operator	Hour	15	\$65.00	6	\$75.00	20	\$60.00
15	Sidewalk Snow and Ice Melter	50lb Bag		\$26.00		\$35.00		\$24.00
<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL - PROPOSAL A:</b>				<b>\$1,826.00</b>		<b>\$1,050.00</b>		<b>\$1,979.00</b>

DEQ Note: Line 8 is replaced with a Snow Rator w 4' plow

**PROPOSAL (B): City Owned Properties - Snow Plowing and Sidewalk Clearing (Various locations within the City of Troy)**

Item	Snow Plowing and Sidewalk Clearing		Unit	Number of Hours	Clearing Cost	Salting	Number of Hours*	Clearing Cost**	Salting***	Number of Hours	Clearing Cost	Salting
1	Fire Station #1 1019 E. Big Beaver	1-5" Snow	Per Push	1	\$125.00	\$125.00	1	\$530.00	\$265.00	1.6	\$195.00	\$244.00
		5"+ Snow	Per Push	1.5	\$160.00	1 Ton	2	\$1,060.00		3.2	\$390.00	
2	Fire Station #2 5600 Livernois	1-5" Snow	Per Push	1	\$125.00	\$125.00	0.8	\$290.00	\$135.00	1.2	\$145.00	\$179.00
		5"+ Snow	Per Push	1.5	\$160.00	1 Ton	1.6	\$580.00		2.4	\$290.00	
3	Fire Station #3 2400 W. Big Beaver	1-5" Snow	Per Push	1.5	\$190.00	\$125.00	1.1	\$445.00	\$210.00	1.3	\$170.00	\$248.00
		5"+ Snow	Per Push	2	\$240.00	1 Ton	2.2	\$890.00		2.6	\$340.00	
4	Fire Station #4 2103 E. Maple	1-5" Snow	Per Push	1.5	\$235.00	\$150.00	0.8	\$390.00	\$190.00	1.5	\$185.00	\$192.00
		5"+ Snow	Per Push	2	\$300.00	1.25 Ton	1.6	\$780.00		3	\$370.00	
5	Fire Station #5 6399 John R	1-5" Snow	Per Push	1	\$190.00	\$125.00	1	\$510.00	\$245.00	1.6	\$190.00	\$226.00
		5"+ Snow	Per Push	1.5	\$240.00	1 Ton	2	\$1,020.00		3.2	\$380.00	
6	Fire Station #6 5901 Coolidge	1-5" Snow	Per Push	1	\$175.00	\$110.00	0.7	\$240.00	\$110.00	1.1	\$135.00	\$164.00
		5"+ Snow	Per Push	1.5	\$220.00	.75 Ton	1.4	\$480.00		2.2	\$270.00	
7	Fire-Police Training Facility 4850 John R	1-5" Snow	Per Push	1.75	\$270.00	\$185.00	1.1	\$515.00	\$220.00	1.6	\$195.00	\$269.00
		5"+ Snow	Per Push	2.5	\$340.00	1.5 Ton	2.2	\$1,030.00		3.25	\$390.00	
8	Troy Historical Museum 60 W. Wattles	1-5" Snow	Per Push	1.5	\$255.00	\$185.00	1.4	\$870.00	\$435.00	3.1	\$330.00	\$352.00
		5"+ Snow	Per Push	2	\$320.00	1.5 Ton	2.8	\$1,740.00		6.2	\$660.00	
9	Camp Ticonderoga 5725 Rochester Road	1-5" Snow	Per Push	4.5	\$635.00	\$600.00	3.5	\$1,485.00	\$695.00	4.7	\$610.00	\$825.00
		5"+ Snow	Per Push	6	\$795.00	4 Ton	7	\$2,970.00		9.4	\$1,220.00	
10	Lloyd Stage Nature Center 6685 Coolidge	1-5" Snow	Per Push	0.75	\$170.00	\$110.00	1.3	\$710.00	\$335.00	2.9	\$288.00	\$298.00
		5"+ Snow	Per Push	1.25	\$215.00	.75 Ton	2.6	\$1,420.00		5.8	\$576.00	
11	Civic Center Campus 500 Big Beaver	1-5" Snow	Per Push	6	\$1,925.00	\$1,050.00	15.1	\$11,490.00	\$5,645.00	24	\$2,950.00	\$4,320.00
		5"+ Snow	Per Push	8	\$2,410.00	7 Ton	15.1	\$22,980.00		48	\$5,900.00	
12	Transit Center 1201 Doyle	1-5" Snow	Per Push	2	\$278.00	\$300.00	1.4	\$730.00	\$360.00	1.6	\$190.00	\$257.00
		5"+ Snow	Per Push	3	\$350.00	2 Ton	2.8	\$1,460.00		3.2	\$380.00	
<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL - PROPOSAL B:</b>					<b>\$10,323.00</b>	<b>\$3,190.00</b>		<b>\$54,615.00</b>	<b>\$8,845.00</b>		<b>\$16,749.00</b>	<b>\$7,574.00</b>
<b>ESTIMATED GRAND TOTAL - PROPOSAL A &amp; B:</b>					<b>\$15,339.00</b>			<b>\$64,510.00</b>			<b>\$26,302.00</b>	

\*Includes total hrs for plowing & shoveling

\*\*Rates include sidewalk & plowing labor

\*\*\*includes labor & material

BID TABULATION  
 SNOW REMOVAL SERVICES  
 CITY OF TROY

	VENDOR NAME:	Russell Landscaping, Inc.	DEQ Property Services, LLC dba Snow Plow Group	RNA Facilities Management
SITE VISITS:	Y/N	Y	N	N
INSURANCE MET:	Y/N	Y	Y	Y
ANNUAL PRICE INCREASE:		5%	5%	3%
PAYMENT TERMS:		Net 30	Net 30 Days	Net 30
EXCEPTIONS:		None	DEQ is only interested in performing the work under the per push pricing listed in Proposal B. We do not wish to perform any work listed on Proposal B under an hourly basis. The pricing listed in Proposal A will only apply to work listed outside of the sites listed on Proposal B.	None
ALL OR NONE AWARD:	Y/N	N	Y	N
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT:	Y/N	Y	Y	Y
VENDOR QUESTIONNAIRE:	Y/N	Y	Y	3 of 4 pages provided
SIGNED ADDENDUM:	Y/N	Y	Y	N
FORMS:	Y/N	Y	Y	Y

Low Bidder Meeting Specifications

**Attest:**  
 (\*Bid Opening conducted via a Zoom Meeting)

Dennis Trantham  
Andrew Chambliss  
Nellie Bert  
Dina Gates

\_\_\_\_\_  
 Emily Frontera  
 Purchasing Manager