

Chair Perakis called the Regular meeting of the Troy City Planning Commission to order at 7:02 p.m. on February 25, 2025, in the Council Chamber of the Troy City Hall. Chair Perakis and Vice Chair Malalahalli presented opening remarks relative to the role of the Planning Commission and procedure for tonight’s meeting.

1. ROLL CALL

Present:

- Carlton M. Faison
- Tyler Fox
- Michael W. Hutson
- Tom Krent
- David Lambert
- Lakshmi Malalahalli
- Marianna Perakis
- John J. Tagle

Absent:

- Toby Buechner

Also Present:

- Ben Carlisle, Carlisle Wortman & Associates
- R. Brent Savidant, Community Development Director
- Julie Quinlan Dufrane, Assistant City Attorney
- Kathy L. Czarnecki, Recording Secretary

2. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

**Resolution # PC-2025-02-013**

- Moved by: Faison
- Support by: Fox

**RESOLVED**, To approve the agenda as prepared.

- Yes: All present (8)
- Absent: Buechner

**MOTION CARRIED**

3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – February 11, 2025

**Resolution # PC-2025-02-014**

- Moved by: Lambert
- Support by: Faison

**RESOLVED**, To approve the minutes of February 11, 2025 Regular meeting as submitted.

Yes: Faison, Hutson, Krent, Lambert, Malalahalli, Perakis, Tagle  
 Abstain: Fox  
 Absent: Buechner

**MOTION CARRIED**

4. PUBLIC COMMENT – For Items Not on the Agenda

There was no one present who wished to speak.

**SPECIAL USE APPROVAL**

5. PUBLIC HEARING – SPECIAL USE APPLICATION (SU JPLN2024-0031) – Proposed Barbat Troy Vehicle Fueling/Multi Use Station, Southeast corner of Crooks Road and South Boulevard (1981 South Boulevard, PIN 88-20-04-100-059), Section 4, Currently Zoned NN (Neighborhood Node “U”) District

Mr. Carlisle reviewed the Special Use and Preliminary Site Plan application for the Barbat Troy Vehicle Fueling/Multi Use Station. He asked the Planning Commission members to keep in mind the vision of the Master Plan for the Neighborhood Node “U” zoning district in its consideration of the application.

Mr. Carlisle asked the Planning Commission to consider the applicant’s request for relief of the required setback along Crooks Road to accommodate the outdoor patio, a parking deviation from the required number of parking spaces, and an exception for decorative light fixtures. He addressed the south (facing Crooks Road) and north (facing South Boulevard) elevations and asked the applicant to consider flipping the elevations so the more engaging façade faces South Boulevard, or to make both facades the same. Mr. Carlisle asked the applicant to provide more details on the buildout of the restaurant and the projected timeline.

Mr. Carlisle asked the Planning Commission in its deliberation to consider compliance with Section 5.06 (Neighborhood Nodes Districts), Section 9.02.D (Special Use Standards), Section 8.06 (Site Plan Review Design Standards) and Section 6.28 (Vehicular Fueling/Multi Use Stations) of the Zoning Ordinance.

Mr. Carlisle said any approval of the application should be subject to the conditions as cited in his report dated February 13, 2025.

Mr. Savidant acknowledged the Planning Department received a signed petition and two emails after the agenda packet was distributed, copies of which were provided to the members prior to the beginning of the meeting. Mr. Savidant announced the emails were from Fabrice Smieliauskas and Farid and Karima Jindo.

Present were Eric Williams of Stonefield Engineering, Project Architect John Abro, and Duane and Scott Barbat of the Barbat Organization.

Mr. Williams clarified there are four (4) EV charging stations proposed on site. He addressed the request for an increased front setback along Crooks Road. Mr. Williams articulated how the application meets the Special Use Standards. He said the development would generate passerby traffic resulting in an insignificant impact.

Mr. Abro addressed the setback along Crooks Road, orientation of the patio, canopy details, and the north and south elevations. He said they would enhance the north elevation in a similar fashion to the south elevation.

Duane Barbat shared a brief history of their company. He said they would gladly incorporate a Troy gateway sign. Mr. Barbat addressed the latest trend for a state-of-the-art fueling station, convenience store and restaurant. He indicated the existing vacant building could potentially be repurposed by an auto parts supplier should this application not get approval.

Scott Barbat addressed operations of the fueling center and restaurant. He said the restaurant would be constructed and opened at the same time as the fueling center. Mr. Barbat shared their affiliation with the *Shell* brand and *Saroki's Pizza* restaurant.

Some comments during discussion related to the following:

- Calculation of parking spaces overall, as relates to EV charging stations, restaurant, fueling and convenience store.
- Gateway signage.
- Number of EV charging stations; underground conduits for future EV stations.
- Gateway signage.
- Traffic volume and potential impact.
- Timeline of restaurant opening.
- Impact on existing service stations in area.
- Screening between the patio and Crooks Road.
- Improvements to enhance the corner entrance; masonry wall, landscaping.
- *Shell* brand color scheme.
- Enhancement of South Boulevard and Crooks Road elevations.
- Hours of operation.
  - Fueling center/convenience store (applicant prefers 24/7).
  - Restaurant 10 a.m. to 10 or 11 p.m.
- Delivery trucks; days/times, turning radiuses.
- Adjacent retail center; visibility, site access, parking.

Mr. Fox expressed his opposition to autocentric uses at the gateway to the City.

PUBLIC HEARING OPENED

- Melinda Pace, 1977 W. South Boulevard (adjacent retail center, Billy Sims BBQ); expressed concern with the visibility of the retail center, parking overflow.
- Farid (Jay) Jindo, 5772 Springbrook; expressed concern with impact on neighboring businesses, traffic and potential sale of property to different user.
- Marcia Bossenberger, 369 Ottawa; said there is no need for another gas station, questioned building not being re-purposed, likes concept and design.
- Eric Rabin, 801-803 W. Big Beaver; addressed challenges of demolishing existing vacant buildings and bringing in future development.
- Jiovani Odeesh, 3814 Rhoten, Sterling Heights (family owns service station at 3980 Crooks Road); said there is no need for another fueling station, likes concept and design.
- Stephen Sadlier, 300 Scone; said there is no need for another fueling station, expressed concern with selling alcohol, effect on neighboring businesses, said location would be an asset for EV owners.
- Arson Koka, 3765 Jennings; expressed support, welcomes an addition of a valued business in the City.
- Edmond Marena, 1969 W. South Boulevard (adjacent retail business owner); expressed concern with visibility of retail center, shared access and overflow parking.
- Anersi Koka, 3765 Jennings; expressed support, likes design, safe area and EV charging stations.
- Kelly (no last name), 1804 Eldridge; expressed support, feels business would attract the younger generation, familiar with Barbat developments.
- Albana Koka, 3765 Jennings; expressed support, likes concept and design.

PUBLIC HEARING CLOSED**Resolution # PC-2025-02-015**

Moved by: Krent

Support by: Lambert

**RESOLVED**, That Special Use Approval and Preliminary Site Plan Approval for the proposed Barbat Troy Vehicle Fueling/Multi Use Station, Southeast corner of Crooks Road and South Boulevard (1981 South Boulevard), Section 4, Currently Zoned NN (Neighborhood Node) District, be **postponed**, so that the developer can review and revise their plan from the feedback received from the Planning Commission, and those items are:

1. Address gateway signage that applicant agrees to incorporate in the development.
2. Indicate the turning radiuses for various delivery trucks on the site.
3. Provide a good illustration of the finished gas pump canopy.
4. Provide revised elevations for the north (South Boulevard) and west (Crooks Road) frontages.
5. Provide some type of screening between Crooks Road and the dining patio that would be aesthetically pleasing.
6. Show the locations of the future EV charging stations.

7. Provide specifications of the EV charging stations; output levels, amperage.
8. Provide details on the decorative light fixtures.
9. Ensure canopy materials match the design of the main building.
10. Acknowledge the fueling center and restaurant will be constructed and opened at the same time.

Discussion on the motion on the floor.

There was discussion on:

- Potential reuse of the existing building.
- Gateway signage; seek direction from administration on uniformity of signage.
- Clarification on Section 9.03 Special Use Standards; impact on overall environment.
- Renderings to show perspective of different elements of development from street view.

Vote on the motion on the floor.

Yes: Faison, Fox, Krent, Lambert, Malalahalli, Perakis, Tagle  
 No: Hutson  
 Absent: Buechner

**MOTION CARRIED**

Chair Perakis called for a recess at 9:17 p.m. The meeting was reconvened at 9:24 p.m.

**CONDITIONAL REZONING**

6. PUBLIC HEARING – CONDITIONAL REZONING APPLICATION (JPCR2025-001) – Proposed Village of Hastings, East side of Livernois, North of Square Lake, PIN 88-20-03-301-088, -023, -024, -025 and 88-20-03-351-004, Section 3, Presently Zoned NN (Neighborhood Node “Q”) and R-1B (One Family Residential) Zoning Districts

Mr. Carlisle reviewed the Conditional Rezoning application for the Village of Hastings. He referenced the applicant’s previously approved development of 14 residential units on the southern end of the parcels and a previously Planned Unit Development (PUD) application that the City Council denied. Mr. Carlisle said the applicant is voluntarily offering eight conditions with approval of the application, as cited in the Planning Consultant report dated February 17, 2025.

Mr. Carlisle addressed the number of proposed units, the one ranch-style home abutting Livernois that must comply with the required RT zoning setback and the City standard that requires a bypass lane on the west side of Livernois (a County road) within the right of way. Mr. Carlisle said the application is missing some elevations, colored renderings, a three dimensional (3D) model of the plan and a photometric plan.

Mr. Carlisle asked the Planning Commission in its deliberation to consider compliance with the Master Plan, the Conditional Rezoning Standards (Section 16.04.C.3) and Site Plan Review Design Standards (Section 8.06).

Mr. Carlisle said any approval of the application should be subject to the three conditions as cited in his report dated February 17, 2025.

Ms. Dufrane said the applicant's submission of a Conditional Rezoning application is a more appropriate avenue to develop the properties than the previously submitted PUD application.

City Traffic Consultant Stephen Dearing of OHM Advisors addressed the design consideration of either a bypass lane or a center left turn lane on Livernois under the jurisdiction of the RCOC (Road Commission of Oakland County).

Mr. Savidant said the City engineering standards would be considered at the time of the Final Site Plan approval process. He said the traffic design consideration by RCOC is not within the Planning Commission purview.

Gary Abitheira addressed the reduction of units, mix of housing styles, preservation of the existing homes, trash removal, photometric plan, open space, price point of homes and turnarounds for emergency vehicles and delivery trucks. He distributed to the Board members pictures of the elevations that were missing from the agenda packet. Mr. Abitheira said he does not own the two properties to the east of the application under consideration this evening.

Some comments during discussion related to the following:

- EVA (emergency vehicle access) located off Square Lake.
- Email received by the Planning Department with concerns the applicant will extend development to the east.
- Consideration by the applicant to soften the starkness, massiveness of the duplex facades.

#### PUBLIC HEARING OPENED

- Jeff Williams, 159 Telford; spoke of the Telford Ridge HOA concerns the applicant will extend development to the east.
- Ann Coleman 6091 Livernois; expressed concerns with traffic impact on Livernois and proposed bypass lane.
- Nanette Gearhart, 6197 Livernois; expressed concerns with traffic impact on Livernois and proposed bypass lane, encouraged access off Square Lake, preservation of existing homes.
- Leasa William, 159 Telford; addressed landscape screening, elevations, architectural features of existing homes, aesthetics of duplex buildings.
- John Malott, 72 Telford; thanked applicant for the recent improvements, addressed housing mix, landscape screening, preservation of existing homes, encouraged access off Square Lake.

- Mary Rettig, 6860 Westaway; addressed duplex building aesthetics, encouraged access off Square Lake.
- Marcia Bossenberger, 369 Ottawa; addressed architectural features of housing, lighting at entrance, safety of school children.
- Deborah Louzecky, 6327 Donaldson; addressed proposed bypass lane, Livernois right of way, encouraged access off Square Lake, thanked applicant for reducing density and offering more ranch style homes.

**PUBLIC HEARING CLOSED**

Ms. Dufrane asked the applicant to flush out what is meant by the preservation of the existing homes and include those particulars in the Conditional Rezoning Agreement.

Ms. Dufrane stated the Planning Commission is only to consider in its deliberation the properties within the application.

Mr. Savidant said the proposed access off Livernois meets City standards and a traffic study reveals no significant traffic impact. He noted the 30 foot access off Square Lake does not meet City standards.

**Resolution # PC-2025-02- (no support)**

Moved by: Fox

Seconded by:

**RESOLVED**, That the Planning Commission hereby recommends that the NN and R-1B to RT Conditional Rezoning Request, as per Section 16.04 of the City of Troy Zoning Ordinance, located on the East side of Livernois and North of Square Lake (PIN 88-20-03-301-088, -023, -024, -025 and 88-20-03-351-004), within Section 3, being approximately 5 acres in size, be **granted**, for the following reasons:

1. The request complies with the Master Plan.
2. The rezoning would permit greater flexibility in use and development of the property.
3. The conditions offered by the applicant reasonably protect the adjacent properties.
4. The rezoning would be compatible with surrounding zoning and land use.
5. The site can be adequately served with municipal water and sewer.

**BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED**, That the Planning Commission recommends the following site plan design considerations:

1. Provide a photometric plan.

**MOTION FAILED**

**Resolution # PC-2025-02-016**

Moved by: Fox  
 Seconded by: Krent

**RESOLVED**, That the Planning Commission hereby recommends that the NN and R-1B to RT Conditional Rezoning Request, as per Section 16.04 of the City of Troy Zoning Ordinance, located on the East side of Livernois and North of Square Lake (PIN 88-20-03-301-088, -023, -024, -025 and 88-20-03-351-004), within Section 3, being approximately 5 acres in size, be **postponed**, subject to the following clarifications provided by the applicant:

1. Clarification on voluntary offer to preserve existing three homes; define preservation, provide timeline and perpetuity of preservation.
2. Provide a photometric plan.
3. Resubmit colored renderings.
4. Consideration to provide a Conditional Rezoning Agreement for review by the City Attorney.

Discussion on the motion on the floor.

Discussion related to the preservation of the three existing homes.

Mr. Abitheira was thanked for his consideration in coming back to the Board with a plan that appears to be more satisfactory to the neighboring properties.

Vote on the motion on the floor.

Yes: All present (8)  
 Absent: Buechner

**MOTION CARRIED**

Mr. Abitheira approached the Board to question how the RT zoning district might relate to the preservation of the existing homes. He asked the Board’s consideration to expedite the approval process due to an impending expiration deadline and limited extensions on the townhome project.

Mr. Abitheira asked the record to reflect he would not develop and/or purchase the properties to the east with the understanding that the Telford Ridge HOA would support the Conditional Rezoning application when considered by the City Council. He said he would encourage the RCOG to provide a bypass and/or left hand turn lane for this project.



**OTHER ITEMS**

7. **PUBLIC COMMENT** – For Items on the Agenda

There was no one present who wished to speak.

8. **PLANNING COMMISSION COMMENT**

There were general comments among the members.

Ms. Dufrane informed the Board of a recent court case.

9. **ADJOURN**

The Regular meeting of the Planning Commission adjourned at 10:52 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



\_\_\_\_\_  
Marianna J. Perakis, Chair



\_\_\_\_\_  
Kathy L. Czarnecki, Recording Secretary