



500 West Big Beaver
Troy, MI 48084
troymi.gov

CITY COUNCIL AGENDA ITEM

Date: March 11, 2020



To: Mark F. Miller, City Manager

From: Robert J. Bruner, Assistant City Manager
Rob Maleszyk, Chief Financial Officer
Lisa Burnham, Accounting Manager
Kurt Bovensiep, Public Works Director
Dennis Trantham, Facilities and Grounds Operations Manager
MaryBeth Murz, Purchasing Manager

Subject: Standard Purchasing Resolution 8: Best Value Award – Janitorial Services
(Introduced by: Dennis Trantham)

History

- Janitorial Services are needed to provide cleaning at City Hall, Police Department, Library, Community Center, Fire and Police Training Center, Stage Nature Center, Department of Public Works, all 6 Fire Stations, Parks Maintenance Building, Transit Center, and the 52-4 District Court.
- On June 4, 2018, Troy City Council approved a three-year contract to provide Janitorial Services with three, three year renewal options (Resolution 2018-06-098).
- On October 3, 2019 *DM Burr* sent a letter notifying the City of Troy the *DM Burr* is losing money on the contract attributing it to an increase in supply costs and not capturing the needed hours to complete all tasks within each facility. *DM Burr* requested an annual increase of \$104,556 or \$8,713 per month.
- City management met and decided that it was not in the best interest of the City of Troy to accept a 15% increase on the original contract and to start the RFP process over again. *DM Burr* was allowed to participate in the process.
- Insourcing was examined as part of the RFP process and found not to be a cost effective option at this time.
- Included in the Request for Proposal were the following: Price Proposal A – Janitorial Services – City Wide; Price Proposal B – Baseline Deep Cleaning; Price Proposal C – Supplementary Services including Casual Labor Hourly Rate, Furniture Moving Hourly Rate, and Price per Square Foot for future locations; Price Proposal D – Fire Locations Annual Exterior Cleaning; Price Proposal E – Custodial Products; and Price Proposal F – Additional Day of Service at the Troy Public Library.

Purchasing

- October 28, 2019 a Request for Proposal was issued and posted on the Michigan Inter-governmental Trade Network (MITN) website; www.mitn.info.
- 276 firms were notified of this bid opportunity.
- November 7, 2019 a Mandatory Pre-Proposal meeting was held at City Hall. The Pre-Proposal meeting also included a site visit to the Police Department, Library, Fire Station #3, and the Community Center. The Request for Proposal document and the project timeline was reviewed. Clarifications were discussed and questions answered which necessitated the issuance of an Addendum summarizing the meeting. Thirteen (13) companies attended the Pre-Proposal meeting as listed below:



500 West Big Beaver
Troy, MI 48084
troymi.gov

CITY COUNCIL AGENDA ITEM

Purchasing (continued)

Master Maintenance Corp.
RNA Facilities Management
Giant Janitorial Services, Inc.
Professional Building Services
The DM Burr Group
Interstate Building Maintenance
Sparkle Janitorial
Kristel Group, Inc.
LGC Global, Inc.
Grand Rapids Building Services, Inc.
GDI Integrated Facility Services
Du-All Cleaning, Inc.
VHM Enterprises, Inc.

- December 5, 2019, a bid opening was conducted and Proposals were received as required by City Charter and Code for the Janitorial Services – City Wide. Below is a summary of potential firms:

Companies notified via MITN	276
Troy Companies notified via MITN	14
Troy Companies - Active email Notification	12
Troy Companies - Active Free	2
Companies that viewed the bid	52
Troy Companies that viewed the bid	2

MITN provides a resourceful online platform to streamline the procurement process, reduce costs, and make it easier and more transparent for vendors to do business with the City of Troy. **Active MITN** members with a current membership and paying annual dues receive automatic electronic notification which allows instant access to Bids, RFPS and Quote opportunities with the City. **Active MITN non-paying** members are responsible to monitor and check the MITN website for opportunities to do business with the City. **Inactive MITN member** status can occur when a company does not renew their account upon expiration. Inactive members cannot be notified of solicitations or access any bid information.

- (9) Proposal responses were received as detailed:

Kristel Group, Inc.	Clawson, MI
Interstate Corporation	Horsham, PA
Du-All Cleaning, Inc.	Sterling Heights, MI
Giant Janitorial Service, Inc.	Detroit, MI
RNA Facilities Management	Ann Arbor, MI
LGC Global, Inc.	Detroit, MI
Master Maintenance Corporation	Ypsilanti, MI
The DM Burr Group	Flint, MI
GDI Integrated Facility Services	Southfield, MI
- Qualifying conditions of the Janitorial Firms were:
 - Experience, knowledge and reliability of Janitorial Services specifically for City entities. Each firm submitting a proposal was required to submit a complete list of similar projects and was required to include a *minimum* of three (3) similar City Contracts.
 - Positive References specifically relating to Janitorial Services for a Cities of similar size.
 - Qualifications of Firm to manage the contract as specified detailing personnel and project team led by a project manager.
 - Methodology, Approach and Staffing Plan
 - Overall response and completeness of the Proposal.



500 West Big Beaver
Troy, MI 48084
troymi.gov

CITY COUNCIL AGENDA ITEM

Purchasing (continued)

- Scoring criteria was as follows:
 - 40% Proposal Score
 - 20% Price Score
 - 40% Interview Score
- Seven (7) Committee Members reviewed and evaluated the proposals. The Committee Members were as follows:
 - Peter Hullinger, Assistant Fire Chief
 - Kurt Bovensiep, Public Works Director
 - Laura Campbell, Facilities and Grounds
 - Dennis Trantham, Facilities and Grounds Operations Manager
 - Philip Kwik, Assistant Library Director
 - Brian Goul, Assistant Recreation Director
 - Joseph Haddad, Police Department
- Based on the Firms' qualifying conditions and scores for proposal and price; the top three (3) Companies were interviewed by the full committee on Tuesday, February 25, 2020 by the Selection Committee:
 - LGC Global FM
 - Giant Janitorial Service, Inc.
 - RNA Facilities Management
- Based on the scoring criteria, the Selection Committee unanimously recommends awarding a contract to *RNA Facilities Management of Ann Arbor, MI*.
- *RNA Facilities Management (RNA)* was founded in 1991 and is a full service company headquartered in Ann Arbor, MI.
- *RNA* has a wide range of Janitorial accounts including city and government buildings, libraries, schools, health clinics and various other businesses.
- *RNA* will assign a dedicated management team to the City of Troy.
- *RNA* also utilizes an APP to track quality of service by building and generate inspection reports. They also use a color coded cleaning system and offer detailed ongoing training.
- *RNA* ensures a smooth transition by effectively communicating with the City, meeting with the City's designated representative(s), hiring existing staff for key positions where applicable and having a dedicated HR Recruiter assigned to the City of Troy.
- *RNA's* references were checked and were positive. *RNA* is prepared to have a complete staff in place for a *targeted* May 1, 2020 start date.
- Note that *RNA* provided pricing In Proposal F to supply an additional day of service at the Library (if required) at a not to exceed monthly cost of \$500.00.

Financial

The resulting proposed increase exceeds the FY20 budgeted amount, however, a budget amendment will not be required because of several deductions taken throughout the year. The increase in costs will be charged to the various departments and funds. All fund budgets are adequately appropriated.

The increase in cost will be included in the FY21 Budget.

The costs for any additional casual labor or furniture moving are available in the various department operating/capital budgets as needed.



500 West Big Beaver
Troy, MI 48084
troymi.gov

CITY COUNCIL AGENDA ITEM

Recommendation

City management recommends awarding a three (3) year contract to *RNA Facilities Management of Ann Arbor, MI* with the option to renew for three 3-year periods as a result of a best value evaluation process for Janitorial Services – City Wide, at an estimated annual amount of \$759,192 in year one, \$770,460 in year two and, \$781,896 in year three for Proposal A; an hourly rate of \$17.50 in year one, \$18.00 in year two, and \$18.50 in year 3 for casual labor and furniture moving over and above the requirements of the specifications, and a monthly price not to exceed \$.13 per square foot for future locations requiring janitorial services for Proposal C; at prices contained in the bid tabulation opened December 5, 2019. Additionally, if it is determined in the future to open the Library for an additional day, City management recommends approving \$500.00 per month for Janitorial Services for Proposal F.

VENDOR NAME:	Kristel Group, Inc.	Interstate Corporation	DU-All Cleaning, Inc.
	Clawson, MI	Horsham, PA	Sterling Heights, MI
CHECK #:	#32393104	#4852706	#515899040-8

PROPOSAL: PROVIDE JANITORIAL SERVICES FOR VARIOUS CITY OF TROY LOCATIONS FOR THREE YEARS WITH TWO (2) THREE YEAR RENEWAL OPTIONS.

Proposal A - Janitorial Services for all Services:									
	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
Monthly Cost:	\$48,175.00	\$48,175.00	\$48,175.00	\$54,160.00	\$55,514.00	\$56,901.85	\$55,539.00	\$55,539.00	\$55,539.00
Annual Cost:	\$578,100.00	\$578,100.00	\$578,100.00	\$649,920.00	\$666,168.00	\$682,822.20	\$666,468.00	\$666,468.00	\$666,468.00
Three Year Total Cost:	\$1,734,300.00			\$1,998,910.20			\$1,999,404.00		

Proposal B - Baseline Deep Cleaning:	\$20,245.00	\$80,457.00	\$8,200.00
---	-------------	-------------	------------

Proposal C - Supplementary Services Pricing for all Locations:									
	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
Casual Labor Hourly Rate:	\$18.25	\$18.25	\$18.25	\$19.76	\$19.76	\$19.76	\$18.00	\$19.00	\$20.00
Furniture Moving Hourly Rate:	\$18.75	\$18.75	\$18.75	\$26.70	\$26.70	\$26.70	\$18.00	\$19.00	\$20.00
Price per Square Foot Future Locations:	\$0.10	\$0.12	\$0.12	\$0.97	\$0.99	\$1.01	\$0.11	\$0.11	\$0.11

Proposal D - Fire Locations only. Annual Exterior Cleaning (power wash walls, bay doors,									
	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
	\$4,250.00	\$4,250.00	\$4,250.00	\$18,809.00	\$19,279.23	\$19,761.21	\$14,100.00	\$14,100.00	\$14,100.00

Proposal E - Pricing to Supply all Custodial									
	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
Monthly Cost:	\$2,925.00	\$2,925.00	\$2,925.00	\$11,086.81	\$11,363.98	\$11,648.08	\$1,846.00	\$1,906.50	\$2,000.50
Annual Cost:	\$35,100.00	\$35,100.00	\$35,100.00	\$133,041.72	\$136,367.76	\$139,776.96	\$22,152.00	\$22,878.00	\$24,006.00

Proposal F - Cost for Additional Day of Service at the Library:									
	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
Monthly Cost:	\$584.00	\$584.00	\$584.00	\$1,007.00	\$1,032.18	\$1,057.98	\$260.00	\$270.00	\$280.00
Annual Cost:	\$7,008.00	\$7,008.00	\$7,008.00	\$12,084.00	\$12,386.16	\$12,695.76	\$3,120.00	\$3,240.00	\$3,360.00

Mandatory Pre-Bid Meeting:	Y or N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Intent to Respond		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Ability to Provide Insurance:	Y or N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Signature Page:	Y or N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Exceptions:	Y or N	None	None	None	None	None	None	None	None
Forms Submitted:	Y or N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
References:	Y or N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Acknowledgement Page:	Y or N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y

ATTEST:
Laura Campbell
Susan Riesterer
Kurt Bovensiepe
Kristine Kallek

MaryBeth Murz
 Purchasing Manager

VENDOR NAME:	Giant Janitorial Service, Inc.	RNA Facilities Management	LGC Global Energy FM, LLC
	Detroit, MI	Ann Arbor, MI	Detroit, MI
CHECK #:	#001394410	#9037122067	#2074797

PROPOSAL: PROVIDE JANITORIAL SERVICES FOR VARIOUS CITY OF TROY LOCATIONS FOR THREE YEARS WITH TWO (2) THREE YEAR RENEWAL OPTIONS.

Proposal A - Janitorial Services for all Services:	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
Monthly Cost:	\$56,068.00	\$57,754.00	\$59,483.00	\$63,266.00	\$64,205.00	\$65,158.00	\$62,206.80	\$64,073.00	\$65,995.19
Annual Cost:	\$672,816.00	\$693,048.00	\$713,796.00	\$759,192.00	\$770,460.00	\$781,896.00	\$746,481.60	\$768,876.00	\$791,942.28
Three Year Total Cost:	\$2,079,660.00			\$2,311,548.00			\$2,307,299.88		
Proposal B - Baseline Deep Cleaning:	\$39,504.00			\$70,950.00			\$44,788.89		
Proposal C - Supplementary Services Pricing for all Locations:	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
Casual Labor Hourly Rate:	\$25.00	\$25.00	\$25.00	\$17.50	\$18.00	\$18.50	\$18.05	\$18.59	\$19.15
Furniture Moving Hourly Rate:	\$25.00	\$25.00	\$25.00	\$17.50	\$18.00	\$18.50	\$18.05	\$18.59	\$19.15
Price per Square Foot Future Locations:	\$0.12	\$0.12	\$0.12	\$0.13	\$0.13	\$0.13	\$2.69	\$2.77	\$2.85
Proposal D - Fire Locations only. Annual Exterior Cleaning (power wash walls, bay doors,	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
	\$25/man hour	\$25/man hour	\$25/man hour	\$13,810.00	\$13,810.00	\$13,810.00	\$12,211.00	\$12,577.33	\$12,954.65
Proposal E - Pricing to Supply all Custodial	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
Monthly Cost:	\$3,350.00	\$3,450.00	\$3,450.00	\$2,815.00	\$2,823.00	\$2,823.00	\$2,312.00	\$2,381.36	\$2,452.80
Annual Cost:	\$40,200.00	\$41,400.00	\$41,400.00	\$33,780.00	\$33,876.00	\$33,876.00	\$27,744.00	\$28,576.32	\$29,433.60
Proposal F - Cost for Additional Day of Service at the Library:	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
Monthly Cost:	\$800.00	\$825.00	\$850.00	\$500.00	\$500.00	\$500.00	\$420.00	\$432.60	\$445.58
Annual Cost:	\$9,600.00	\$9,900.00	\$10,200.00	\$6,000.00	\$6,000.00	\$6,000.00	\$5,040.00	\$5,191.20	\$5,346.96
Mandatory Pre-Bid Meeting:	Y or N	Y			Y			Y	
Intent to Respond:	Y or N	Y			Y			Y	
Ability to Provide Insurance:	Y or N	Y			Y			Y	
Signature Page:	Y or N	Y			Y			Y	
Exceptions:	Y or N	None			None			None	
Forms Submitted:	Y or N	Y			Y			Y	
References:	Y or N	Y			Y			Y	
Acknowledgement Page:	Y or N	Y			Y			Y	

VENDOR NAME:	Master Maintenance Corporation	DM Burr Group	GDI Integrated Facility Services
	Ypsilanti, MI	Flint, MI	Southfield, MI
CHECK #:	#01470792	#69820	#65520757

PROPOSAL: PROVIDE JANITORIAL SERVICES FOR VARIOUS CITY OF TROY LOCATIONS FOR THREE YEARS WITH TWO (2) THREE YEAR RENEWAL OPTIONS.

Proposal A - Janitorial Services for all Services:									
	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
Monthly Cost:	\$68,294.00	\$65,197.00	\$65,197.00	\$69,681.00	\$71,405.00	\$72,806.00	\$80,152.38	\$80,818.22	\$81,511.84
Annual Cost:	\$819,528.00	\$782,364.00	\$782,364.00	\$836,172.00	\$856,860.00	\$873,672.00	\$961,828.56	\$969,818.64	\$978,142.08
Three Year Total Cost:		\$2,384,256.00			\$2,566,704.00			\$2,909,789.28	

Proposal B - Baseline Deep Cleaning:		\$3,682.00			\$1,820.00			\$2,021.11	
---	--	------------	--	--	------------	--	--	------------	--

Proposal C - Supplementary Services Pricing for all Locations:									
	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
Casual Labor Hourly Rate:	\$35.00	\$35.00	\$35.00	\$20.00	\$21.00	\$22.00	\$22.21	\$22.39	\$22.58
Furniture Moving Hourly Rate:	\$65.00	\$65.00	\$65.00	\$20.00	\$21.00	\$22.00	\$22.21	\$22.39	\$22.58
Price per Square Foot Future Locations:	\$0.28	\$0.28	\$0.28	\$1.52	\$1.52	\$1.52	\$3.4672	\$3.4958	\$3.5253

Proposal D - Fire Locations only. Annual Exterior Cleaning (power wash walls, bay doors,									
	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
	\$7,040.00	\$7,040.00	\$7,040.00	\$560.00	\$560.00	\$560.00	\$750.00	\$785.00	\$820.00

Proposal E - Pricing to Supply all Custodial									
	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
Monthly Cost:		*		\$3,025.00	\$3,182.00	\$3,346.00	\$1,722.00	\$1,805.00	\$1,889.00
Annual Cost:	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$36,300.00	\$38,184.00	\$40,152.00	\$20,664.00	\$21,660.00	\$22,668.00

Proposal F - Cost for Additional Day of Service at the Library:									
	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
Monthly Cost:	\$1,943.00	\$1,943.00	\$1,943.00	\$1,907.00	\$1,945.00	\$1,984.00	\$2,804.88	\$2,834.46	\$2,862.30
Annual Cost:	\$23,316.00	\$23,316.00	\$23,316.00	\$22,884.00	\$23,340.00	\$23,808.00	\$33,658.56	\$34,013.52	\$34,347.60

Mandatory Pre-Bid Meeting:	Y or N	Y		Y		Y		Y	
Intent to Respond		Y		Y		Y		Y	
Ability to Provide Insurance:	Y or N	Y		Y		Y		Y	
Signature Page:	Y or N	Y		Y		Y		Y	
Exceptions:	Y or N	3M TwistnGo Products		3M TwistnGo Products		3M TwistnGo Products		None	
Forms Submitted:	Y or N	Y		Y		Y		Y	
References:	Y or N	Y		Y		Y		Y	
Acknowledgement Page:	Y or N	Y		Y		Y		Y	

* Without historical usage data, can only provide cost per case.