



500 West Big Beaver
Troy, MI 48084
troymi.gov

FROM THE OFFICE OF THE CITY MANAGER

April 13, 2020

To: Mayor and City Council Members

From: Mark F. Miller, City Manager
Robert J. Bruner, Assistant City Manager
Drew Benson, Assistant to the City Manager

Subject: City Council Agenda Questions & Answers – 4.13.2020

The following are communications that City Administration would like Council to be made aware of. For questions or comments initiated by citizens, the answers provided in this document have also been sent to the citizens directly. In order to ensure that all questions are received and answered, all City Council Questions should be sent to the CITY MANAGER DISTRIBUTION GROUP e-mail address.

From: Rebecca A. Chamberlain-Creangă
Sent: Sunday, April 12, 2020 11:07 PM
To: City Manager Distribution Group <CityManager@troymi.gov>
Subject: Council agenda questions

Hello, Mark and team!

I hope you all had a nice Easter holiday for those who celebrated. It certainly took on new meaning for me amid all that is going on.

Mark - please also accept my condolences for the loss of your family friend due to COVID-19, as shared last week during our council prep meeting. My thoughts are with your family. I am also thinking of your wife on the frontlines of the pandemic.

I have a few small questions about council agenda items. I'm still learning the ropes, as this is just my second council meeting, so I hope this is a good time to submit questions? Or should I submit them sooner? Feel free to let me know. None of the questions are urgent; they are not necessarily things that I will raise in tomorrow's meeting. I just want to understand the materials in the council packet better.

- J-4 b): In case I missed this, have we worked with LaserCom before for printing tax bills? Are we certain this company will remain in business during this difficult period? What would happen to the contract if they went out of business? I ask because I already know of one printing company that has gone under in this climate.
- J-5: Just so I understand this agenda item, what were these streets before (subdivision streets for condos, etc. but used publicly?) As explained to me, adding these roads into the City of Troy local street system is important, as it allow the City of Troy to secure funding from the State of

Michigan for road maintenance. Is this true? And is this submission of new roads just once a year at this time - part of the annual road mileage certification noted in the agenda item?

- Employee Retirement Board: I see that there was a board decision to sell 3M stock and invest in emerging markets. How is that fairing now (given that emerging markets have been hit by coronavirus)? I presume these decisions are only made when the board meets (quarterly)?
 - Assessment Roll report: This is fabulous work on the part of Nino, his department and the Board of Review. I commend them all! I spent a good deal of time with this report and want to make sure I understand it. I have a couple of questions/comments to make sure that I understand correctly:
 - The taxable value representing just 38% of market value in 2020 shows just what impact Proposal A has on our community - where residential homes are largely homesteaded (and can only increase in taxable value with the rate of inflation/CPI) and not enough homes are being sold to uncap the "homesteaded" taxable value, while industrial value is declining or subject to abatements. Is this a fair assessment of the 38% figure? Or is there a better way to describe it?
 - How best to understand the last column on p. ii ("Ratio No Personal")?: At first I read this as "taxable value from personal property represents 37.37% of overall taxable value in 2020?" (And of course taxable value from real property makes up the majority of taxable value). But I'm not sure if the numbers add up?
 - DDA & TIF entities: The total taxable value for 2020 (\$5.2 billion) includes the taxable value *of the base value* (see base column of *page quick stats 2*) of all real and personal property in the DDA and other TIF entities (6 BRAs, LDFA) - is that correct? I know the increase attributable to an increase in property values from the base value is captured by and goes to the respective TIF entities. But taxable value on the base value is still part of the city's total taxable value, right?
 - I saw that 3 BRAs had no capture (due to no increase in property value) in 2020. Why is this for these particular properties? Is there any reason for concern going forward?
-

Answers: Multiple

- J-4 b): In case I missed this, have we worked with LaserCom before for printing tax bills? Are we certain this company will remain in business during this difficult period? What would happen to the contract if they went out of business? I ask because I already know of one printing company that has gone under in this climate.

Answers: Robert Maleszyk, Chief Financial Officer

The company LaserCom is our current vendor. They have been in business for over 25 years. We can't be certain of this company's future as we can't for any vendor we use. If they can't fulfill the contract, we will go to the next lowest bidder on the bid sheet. Next, we would rebid.

- J-5: Just so I understand this agenda item, what were these streets before (subdivision streets for condos, etc. but used publicly?) As explained to me, adding these roads into the City of Troy local street system is important, as it allow the City of Troy to secure funding from the State of Michigan for road maintenance. Is this true? And is this submission of new roads just once a year at this time - part of the annual road mileage certification noted in the agenda item?

Answers: William Huotari, City Engineer

Yes, we add new roads to our system once a year as part of the Act 51 mileage certification which is used for the basis of funding for our road network. The new roads are typically local roads built by developers as part of new residential subdivisions/site condominiums. Meaning, there were no roads there previously, in most cases it is vacant property that has been developed.

- Employee Retirement Board: I see that there was a board decision to sell 3M stock and invest in emerging markets. How is that fairing now (given that emerging markets have been hit by coronavirus)? I presume these decisions are only made when the board meets (quarterly)?

Answers: Robert Maleszyk, Chief Financial Officer

As of our last meeting, 3M was down more than the emerging markets. Domestic markets have been hit as hard or harder than emerging markets. This transaction needs to be looked at from an overall portfolio, not just the transaction. Also, it needs to be viewed in a long-term perspective. The Board meets monthly and it was a recommendation from our Consultant UBS.

- Assessment Roll report: This is fabulous work on the part of Nino, his department and the Board of Review. I commend them all! I spent a good deal of time with this report and want to make sure I understand it. I have a couple of questions/comments to make sure that I understand correctly:
 - The taxable value representing just 38% of market value in 2020 shows just what impact Proposal A has on our community - where residential homes are largely homesteaded (and can only increase in taxable value with the rate of inflation/CPI) and not enough homes are being sold to uncap the "homesteaded" taxable value, while industrial value is declining or subject to abatements. Is this a fair assessment of the 38% figure? Or is there a better way to describe it?

Answers: Nino Licari, City Assessor

All properties are covered by the cap on Taxable Value. Whether a property is Homestead (actually, has a Principal Residence Exemption) has no bearing on the Assessed/Taxable ratio. What the 38% figure is showing is that Market Values are increasing (for all classes of property) far higher than the rate of inflation, so the gap between Assessed Value and Taxable Value is growing. At this point in time, Industrial property is increasing in market value at a higher percentage than residential. Abatements have no effect on this ratio.

- How best to understand the last column on p. ii ("Ratio No Personal")?: At first I read this as "taxable value from personal property represents 37.37% of overall taxable value in 2020?" (And of course taxable value from real property makes up the majority of taxable value). But I'm not sure if the numbers add up?

Answers: Nino Licari, City Assessor

For Personal Property, there is no difference between Assessed and Taxable Value, it is always the same. So, in order to get the actual ratio of Assessed to Taxable Value, we take the personal Property out of the equation. Which means the true ratio of Assessed to Taxable Value of Real Property is 37.7%, not 38%, a larger gap.

- DDA & TIF entities: The total taxable value for 2020 (\$5.2 billion) includes the taxable value of the base value (see base column of *page quick stats 2*) of all real and personal property in the DDA and other TIF entities (6 BRAs, LDFA) - is that correct? I know the increase attributable to an increase in property values from the base value is captured by and goes to the respective TIF entities. But taxable value on the base value is still part of the city's total taxable value, right?

Answers: Nino Licari, City Assessor

Correct.

- I saw that 3 BRAs had no capture (due to no increase in property value) in 2020. Why is this for these particular properties? Is there any reason for concern going forward?

Answers: Nino Licari, City Assessor

No reason for concern. It just means that the new construction hasn't started or amounted to anything yet. They also had demolition of structures to facilitate the new development, which has caused the current Taxable Value to less than the base value at this point. In Brownfields there is no negative capture, just 0, or positive. This means they can't start being reimbursed until they increase the Taxable Value.

From: David Hamilton

Sent: Sunday, April 12, 2020 11:59 AM

To: City Manager Distribution Group <CityManager@troymi.gov>

Subject: Fw: Oakland County Small Businesses: Let's work together during these challenging times!

Probably already been handled or answered, but how is the City of Troy contributing to the effort to ensure our businesses are getting access to the grants they need?

David Hamilton

Troy Mayor Pro Tem

Answers: Mark F. Miller, City Manager

Troy has been assigned to Business Grant District #9, which includes all of Troy and Clawson. The review team for our district includes Glenn Lapin & Drew Benson from the City of Troy, Joan Horton from the Clawson DDA, Lori Fisher from the City of Clawson, Tara Tomcsik from the Troy Chamber of Commerce, and Penny Luebs, the Oakland County Commissioner for our district.

This team will review all of the grant applications for our district, and provide recommendations to Oakland County as to how to provide funding. Our review team has not yet received the applications for our district, but we have been told that the total amount of funding that will be available to distribute in our district will likely be around \$300,000.

Oakland County is still working on sorting through the 7000+ grant applications that have been received. Oakland County has scheduled a virtual meeting on Monday, April 13 to discuss the review process, review criteria, and timeline for the review process. A follow up call to receive the applications, and begin evaluating them will take place later this week.

As this process moves forward, we will continue to share updates with City Council.

From: Rebecca A. Chamberlain-Creangă

Sent: Sunday, April 12, 2020 11:45 PM

To: City Manager Distribution Group <CityManager@troymi.gov>

Subject: Question about obtaining data on health of small businesses & overall economy in Troy - in advance of budget discussions

Hello all,

This question doesn't pertain to the council agenda for tomorrow, but I wonder if at some point we could discuss how to obtain data on the health of small businesses and overall economy in Troy related to our current environment? I know it may be too early to know. And I'm not sure if the county and state has disaggregated data for Troy. It would be good to have some sort of data going into budget discussions - even if it is just forecasting.

Feel free to let me know if this is already being done for budget discussions - or whether this needs to be a council referral item for the next council meeting.

All very best,
Rebecca

Answers: Glenn Lapin, Economic Development Specialist & Robert Maleszyk, Chief Financial Officer

We do not currently have up-to-date data that reflects how the COVID-19 crisis has specifically impacted businesses in Troy. Much of the aggregated data I have seen so far comes from a variety of sources including the local Michigan Works offices (i.e. unemployment applications filed), MEDC, Oakland County, and federal sources like the Bureau of Labor Statistics, American Community Survey, Small Business Administration and U.S. Department of Commerce.

Getting Troy specific data is more difficult to obtain, and there is a time lag. SEMCOG has Troy specific data, but it is not necessarily current.

Our website's [Business & Investment Assistant](#) (on the Economic Development page) has Troy specific data on employment and some workforce factors, and I am hoping to get more current data soon from Local Intel, the provider of the service. Much of this data comes from the Bureau of Labor Statistics. I will keep an eye out for additional sources of current data that might better reflect the impacts faced as a result of the pandemic.

As it relates to the budget, our primary revenue (property taxes) are secure for the next fiscal year (2021). Ancillary things like State Shared Revenue are difficult to accurately predict beyond our historical disbursements at this point. If this becomes a severe recession or depression, then 2 or 3 budgets from now we would be more materially impacted.

Based upon the new facts coming out daily, we are being conservative, and are not filling open positions or filling the new budgeted positions come July 1, etc. As more information is made available about how the COVID-19 crisis will impact the City's finances, we will share that information with City Council.

From: Ellen C Hodorek
Sent: Monday, April 13, 2020 12:07 PM
To: City Manager Distribution Group <CityManager@troymi.gov>
Subject: Agenda Questions

Hello:

Here are my questions for tonight's agenda:

I-04 EMERGENCY PURCHASE - MSA FACE PIECE APR ADAPTERS AND FILTERS FOR FIRE DEPARTMENT

Completely support this and appreciate how fast this was brought together. Are we able to meet the traditional PPE needs of fire, police, Alliance Mobile, and other essential staff on the front lines? Do we have enough on hand?

J-04A SPR2 SOLE BIDDER MEETING SPECIFICATIONS - INTERVIEW ROOM RECORDING SYSTEM - POLICE DEPARTMENT

Does this include ongoing technical support after the system installation and training?

Also, thank you all for everything you are doing to keep us up and running.

Thanks,

Ellen

Answers: Multiple

I-04 EMERGENCY PURCHASE - MSA FACE PIECE APR ADAPTERS AND FILTERS FOR FIRE DEPARTMENT

Completely support this and appreciate how fast this was brought together. Are we able to meet the traditional PPE needs of fire, police, Alliance Mobile, and other essential staff on the front lines? Do we have enough on hand?

Answers: David Roberts, Fire Chief

Currently, the Fire Department's needs are adequately met. The addition of the APR adapters and filters for Fire Dept. SCBA are an assurance that our future needs will be adequately met without relying on other sources. EMS and Police must rely on traditional sources to meet their PPE needs.

My last conversation with Alliance Mobile Health late last week was that they have adequate PPE, but understandably are using their PPE regularly. They have implemented decontamination procedures in order to re-use their PPE so as not to deplete their limited supply.

Our emergency management team has been doing a great job keeping up with the police departments PPE needs as well.

J-04A SPR2 SOLE BIDDER MEETING SPECIFICATIONS - INTERVIEW ROOM RECORDING SYSTEM - POLICE DEPARTMENT

Does this include ongoing technical support after the system installation and training?

Answers: Frank Nastasi, Police Chief

Yes, the interview room recording system does include technical support, software upgrades, and training.

PROPOSED RESOLUTION

Suggested Resolution

Resolution #2020-04-

Moved by

Seconded by

WHEREAS, On March 11, 2020, Michigan Governor Gretchen Whitmer declared a State of Emergency (Executive Order 2020-4), and has issued several orders implementing measures in the State of Michigan that are designed to help prevent the rapid spread of the COVID-19 virus, a respiratory disease that can result in serious illness or death, based on a validated exponential spread of the virus, which will detrimentally impact our medical community; and,

WHEREAS, On March 11, 2020, Oakland County Executive David Coulter also declared a County Emergency, and activated the Oakland County Emergency Control Center, based on the same concerns of the COVID-19 virus; and,

WHEREAS, On March 13, 2020, President Donald J. Trump declared a National Emergency, based on the detrimental impact of the spread of the COVID-19 virus to our community, as recommended by the Center for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC); and,

WHEREAS, On March 23, 2020, Governor Gretchen Whitmer Issued Executive Order 2020-21, which temporarily suspended all activities not necessary to sustain or protect life, which is commonly referred to as the Stay Home/Stay Safe Order. This Order is required to be construed broadly to prohibit any in person work that is not necessary to sustain or protect life, and expressly exempts essential workers who are necessary to protect life; and,

WHEREAS, The City of Troy has complied with the National and State Directives and Orders, and although some measures have been implemented to minimize exposure and transmission of COVID-19, Troy's public safety workers (including but not limited to police, fire, and public works) are continuing to report for in-person work, and Troy's remaining full time staff has been technologically equipped to continue to work from home; and,

WHEREAS, The COVID-19 pandemic is a national issue, and Congress has responded by enacting several pieces of legislation to address the negative impacts, and on March 29, 2020, President Trump extended the nationwide social distancing requirements until April 30, 2020; and,

WHEREAS, On April 1, 2020, Governor Gretchen Whitmer issued Executive Order 2020-33, which superseded Executive Order 2020-04, and Declared a State of Disaster in addition to the previously declared State of Emergency; and,

WHEREAS, Since the pandemic has been prolonged, and the total amount of confirmed cases and deaths in the State of Michigan continues to escalate, on April 7, 2020, the Michigan Legislature passed Senate Concurrent Resolution 0024 of 2020, extending the Emergency and Disaster Order (2020-33) beyond the 28 day time limitation otherwise allotted for a Governor's declaration, and as a result, the Declared Emergency and Disaster Order is extended to April 30, 2020; and,

WHEREAS, On April 8, 2020, Governor Gretchen Whitmer issued Executive Order 2020-42, expanding the Stay Home, Stay Safe Order until April 30, 2020; and,

WHEREAS, These proactive responsive actions are authorized under existing laws in times of emergencies, and facilitate broad based communication to the public. Some of these proactive measures may also result in some financial reimbursement for governmental measures that were required to be performed to respond to the emergency; and,

WHEREAS, Although the City of Troy is relegated to a coordinating role, and must cede to the emergency authority of the State and County and Federal government on several public health issues, on March 11, 2020, the City of Troy administratively activated the City of Troy's Emergency Operations Plan, and based on recommendations from the CDC and the State of Michigan Department of Health and Human Services and Oakland County Health Division, the Troy Community Center and Troy Public Library were closed to the public on March 13, 2020, Troy City Hall and Department of Public Works and the Troy Nature Center were closed to the public on March 16, 2020, and closed on March 24, 2020; and,

WHEREAS, The Troy City Council and Troy City Administration have been actively monitoring legislation and executive orders and directives issued as a result of the pandemic, and the City's Emergency Operations Center has continued its coordination with other disaster relief efforts, and continues to facilitate communication of the directives and orders of other governmental entities to the public; and,

WHEREAS, On March 16, 2020, the Troy City Council declared an emergency under Troy's City Charter and State Law, specifically the Emergency Management Act, MCL 30.401, which allowed for communication to the public about health risks and regulations, allowed the cancellation of meetings when necessary, and allows the City to recoup any available reimbursement incurred by Troy employees during the emergency, as well as the request of additional financial aid; and,

WHEREAS, In light of all of the developments that have occurred since March 16, 2020, City Council's affirmation of the City's continued state of emergency is prudent;

NOW THEREFORE,

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, That the Troy City Council hereby **ACKNOWLEDGES** that a "state of emergency" continues to exist in the City of Troy, due to the known transmission

of COVID-19 within Oakland County and the concern of sickness and potential loss of life. The situation is worsening and impacting the whole community and local economy.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, That as a result of this Emergency Declaration, the City **MAY CONTINUE TO TAKE ADDITIONAL MEASURES** to limit further exposure, including but not limited to the continued closure of public facilities, the postponement of public meetings and public hearings, the extension of time to respond to Freedom of Information Act requests, the transition to electronic meetings, which necessarily amends the available methods for public comment, the publication of orders and directives and clarifications, as well as the ability for law enforcement to enforce orders, including but not limited to the Stay at Home/ Stay Safe orders and the minimum six foot social distancing requirements that are applicable to everyone.

BE IT FINALLY RESOLVED, That this Emergency Declaration **SHALL TERMINATE** automatically after all State of Michigan Emergency and Disaster Declaration and/or the National Declarations resulting from the COVID-19 pandemic are terminated; but **CAN ALSO BE TERMINATED** through affirmative action of the City of Troy City Council.

Yes:

No:

From: [Aileen Dickson](#)
To: [Drew A Benson](#); [Bob Bruner](#); [Mark F Miller](#)
Subject: FW: Alternatives fixes to obtaining necessary signatures to run for the Partial Term for (1) Council Member position
Date: Monday, April 13, 2020 4:22:16 PM
Attachments: [image001.png](#)
[image002.png](#)
[image003.png](#)
[image004.png](#)
[image005.png](#)
[image006.png](#)



M. Aileen Dickson, MMC, CMMC
City Clerk | City of Troy
O: 248-524-3331
F: 248-524-1770
[f](#) [i](#) [t](#) [y](#) [in](#)

From: David Anderson [mailto:dcalaw08@att.net]
Sent: Monday, April 13, 2020 12:25 PM
To: Public Comment <PublicComment2020@troymi.gov>
Subject: Alternatives fixes to obtaining necessary signatures to run for the Partial Term for (1) Council Member position

Dear Mayor Baker and Troy City Council Members,

My name is David Carl Anderson and I am a forty (40) year resident of Troy. I am interested in running for the Partial Term for (1) Council Member position. The election for this position will be held on August 4, 2020. The date for filing the sixty (60) to one hundred (100) signatures needed to run for this position expires on Tuesday, April 21, 2020, at 4:00 p.m. Unfortunately, the "stay home, stay safe" executive orders issued by the Governor on March 10, 2020 and April 9, 2020 and running through April 30, 2020 has made obtaining the signatures necessary to run for this position impossible to achieve.

On March 9, 2020, I picked up from the city clerk's office an informational packet for candidates wishing to run for the abovesaid city council position. The informational packet clearly stated candidates wishing to run for the Partial Term for (1) Council Member position have until April 21, 2020 to obtain and file the needed signatures with the clerk's office to run for this position. As such, on March 9, 2020 I had over forty (40) days to obtain the needed signatures from my neighbors to run for this city council position.

On March 10, 2020, the day after I picked up my candidate informational packet, the Governor issued her first "stay home, stay safe" executive order. This order required all law abiding citizens of Troy to remain at

home so we would not spread the deadly coronavirus to one another. I strictly complied with the stay-at-home order and did not have any contact with my neighbors so as not to risk spreading the disease to them or contracting the disease from them. By being a good citizen and not contacting my neighbor's in compliance with the Governor's order between March 10, 2020 through April 13, 2020, I was unable to gather any of the signatures needed to run for the abovesaid position.

It was my intention to use a safe approach in gathering the needed signatures between April 13, 2020 through April 20, 2020. Unfortunately for me and candidates similarly situated, on April 9, 2020, the Governor unexpectedly extended the "stay home, stay safe" executive order until April 30, 2020. The April 9, 2020 order precludes any contact between neighbors until April 30, 2020. Both of the aforementioned executive orders made it a crime to contact our neighbors between March 10, 2020 through April 30, 2020, and therefore, effectively prevented the gathering of the signatures needed to run for the abovesaid city council position. Like with the Governor's first executive order, I intend to be a good citizen and strictly comply with the stay-at-home requirement between April 9, 2020 through April 30, 2020.

Due to the unprecedented pandemic we find ourselves in, I am requesting via this e-mail that the Troy City Council either extend the time to file the signatures needed to run for the city council position discussed above, or in the alternative, allow candidates wishing to run for this city council position to pay a one-time, flat fee for the privilege of seeking this council seat. If the Troy City Council does not have the power to approve the abovesaid request, then I request the Troy City Council contact the Governor's office on behalf of candidates like myself seeking a special dispensation from the Governor's office consistent with either of the fixes referenced above.

Our democratic system requires that anyone who wishes to run for an elected position be afforded the right to do so. Numerous rules are now being implemented by the state and federal governments to accommodate new and unique situations/problems being created by the current pandemic. The fixes outlined above constitute a fair and pragmatic deviation from the current signature requirements to redress the signature timing problem which was not caused by any of the candidates adversely affected by this pandemic.

I have every reason to believe the current Troy City Council will show both the wisdom and integrity to address this very inequitable situation by following one of the two approaches outlined above. Hopefully either the Troy City Council or the Governor's office will rectify this precarious situation sooner rather than later.

Thanking you in advance for your anticipated prompt response to this request.

Very truly yours,

David Carl Anderson, Esq.
Law Office of David C. Anderson, P.C.
2361 Oak Ridge
Troy, Michigan 48098
(248) 408-8096
dc law08@att.net

This message is intended for the sole use of the individual and entity to whom it is addressed, and may contain information that is privileged, confidential and exempt from disclosure under applicable law. Any unauthorized review, use, disclosure or distribution of this email message, including any attachment, is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please advise the sender by reply email and destroy all copies of the original message. Thank you.