

CITY COUNCIL AGENDA ITEM

Date: September 8, 2020

To: Mark F. Miller, City Manager

From: Robert J. Bruner, Assistant City Manager

Robert C. Maleszyk, Chief Financial Officer

Lisa Burnham, Controller

Kurt Bovensiep, Public Works Director

Dennis Trantham, Facilities and Grounds Operations Manager

Ashely Levin, Project Manager

MaryBeth Murz, Purchasing Manager

Subject: Standard Purchasing Resolution 2 – Low Bidder Meeting Specifications – Trail and

Pathway Paving - Phase 2

History

Trails and Pathways has been a heavily discussed topic in the City of Troy. For the past several years trails and pathways have been included as a strategy and top initiative. "Re-evaluate the Trails & Pathways program with a focus on public participation and creative problem solving to build community support" is included as a 2019 strategy. Over the years, City Staff has applied for grants, held public engagement sessions, and recently constructed Phase One of the Troy Trail.

The first phase features a paved pathway approximately one mile in length that stretches from the Daisy Knight Dog Park to Wattles Road highlighting Troy's natural features in a wooded area.

In 2019, City Council was presented the proposed pathway for Phase Two of the Troy Trail in Sylvan Glen Lake Park. The second phase of the Troy Trail will begin in the parking lot at the park. A paved pathway will be constructed from the parking lot along the south edge of the lake and enter the wooded area. The trail will wind through the wooded area and provide connection to the adjacent subdivision. Phase two will continue to highlight Troy's natural resources while providing a new recreational opportunity.

Residents in the adjacent neighborhood were notified by mail of the proposed trail and asked to provide comments. Feedback was received regarding concerns for tree preservation and drainage which were both taken into consideration in the design process.

Anderson, Eckstein, and Westrick, Inc. (AEW), one of the City's professional service engineering firms (Resolution #2017-06-105-J-4a), has completed the Phase Two design drawings and specifications. AEW has also obtained necessary wetland and flood plain permits from the Michigan Department of Environment, Great Lakes, and Energy. With approval from City Council, the City will continue to use consultant AEW for construction management on this project.



Purchasing

- On September 3, 2020 a bid opening was conducted as required by City Charter/Code for the Sylvan Glen Pathway Project.
- The bid was posted on the Michigan Intergovernmental Trade Network (MITN); www.mitn.info.
- Five hundred and fifty nine (559) vendors were notified via the MITN website.
- Six (6) bid responses were received. Below is a detailed summary of potential vendors for the bid opportunity:

Companies notified via MITN	559					
Troy Companies notified via MITN	15					
Troy Companies notified - Active email Notification	15					
Troy Companies - Active Free	0					
Companies that viewed the bid						
Troy Companies that viewed the bid	2					

MITN provides a resourceful online platform to streamline the procurement process, reduce costs, and make it easier and more transparent for vendors to do business with the City of Troy.

Active MITN members with a current membership and paying annual dues receive automatic electronic notification which allows instant access to Bids, RFPS and Quote opportunities with the City.

Active MITN non-paying members are responsible to monitor and check the MITN website for opportunities to do business with the City.

Inactive MITN member status can occur when a company does not renew their account upon expiration. Inactive members cannot be notified of solicitations or access any bid information.

- After reviewing the bid proposals with AEW, Warren Contractors & Development, Inc. of Shelby Township, MI was the low bidder meeting all specifications for the installation of the second phase of the Troy Trail and is being recommended.
- Attached is *AEW*'s supporting documentation to this recommendation.
- Although Warren Contractors & Development was not the low bidder, they are the next lowest bidder meeting the similar project completion requirement.
- The low bidder did not meet this requirement because they did not have the necessary project experience as a primary contractor.

Financial

Funds are available in Capital Fund – Park – Trails & Pathways with an associated project number of 2021C0048. Expenditures will be charged to 401.751.770.7974.710.

Recommendation

City management recommends awarding a contract to install the second phase of the Troy Trail to the low bidder meeting specifications; *Warren Contractors & Development, Inc. of Shelby Township, MI* at the unit prices contained in the bid tabulations opened September 3, 2020 with an estimated total of \$549,671.25 and with a 15% contingency totaling \$82,450.69 but not to exceed budgetary limitations. The award is contingent upon the contractor's submission of properly executed bid documents including insurance certificates, and all other specified requirements.





BID TABULATION CITY OF TROY SYLVAN GLEN PATHWAYS

ITB-COT 21-04 Page 1 of 4

	Allstar Power Excavation,	Warren Contractors &	Pro-Line Asphalt Paving
Vendor Name:	LLC	Development, Inc.	Corp.
City:	Grosse Pointe, MI	Shelby Twp., MI	Washington, MI
Check Amt:	\$10,000.00	\$10,000.00	\$10,000.00
Check #:	1608212131	1625409576	2014205661

BID PROPOSAL: SYLVAN GLEN PATHWAY PROJECT														
Line	Description	Total Quantity	Units	U	nit Price	Total Cost	U	nit Price	Т	otal Cost	U	Init Price	Т	otal Cost
1	Bonds, Insurance & Mobilization (\$40,000 Max)	1	Ls	\$ -	40,000.00	\$ 40,000.00	\$	40,000.00	\$	40,000.00	\$	40,000.00	\$	40,000.00
2	Preconstruction Audio-Visual Documentation (\$10,000 Max)	1	Ls	\$	4,000.00	\$ 4,000.00	\$	1,100.00	\$	1,100.00	\$	1,500.00	\$	1,500.00
3	Clearing, Modified	6.8	Sta	\$	1,675.00	\$ 11,390.00	\$	1,650.00	\$	11,220.00	\$	1,500.00	\$	10,200.00
4	Removal of Misc. Concrete	1	Ls	\$	1,500.00	\$ 1,500.00	\$	4,000.00	\$	4,000.00	\$	2,000.00	\$	2,000.00
5	Pavt, Rem	97	Syd	\$	13.00	\$ 1,261.00	\$	24.00	\$	2,328.00	\$	25.00	\$	2,425.00
6	Station Grading	3977	Ft	\$	11.00	\$ 43,747.00	\$	25.00	\$	99,425.00	\$	40.00	\$	159,080.00
7	Tree, Remove, 1 inch to 6 inch	1	Ea	\$	140.00	\$ 140.00	\$	137.00	\$	137.00	\$	150.00	\$	150.00
8	Tree, Remove, 6 inch to 18 inch	13	Ea	\$	245.00	\$ 3,185.00	\$	242.00	\$	3,146.00	\$	220.00	\$	2,860.00
9	Culv, Rem, 24 inch to 48 inch	1	Ea	\$	670.00	\$ 670.00	\$	1,650.00	\$	1,650.00	\$	2,500.00	\$	2,500.00
10	Culv, Rem, Less than 24 inch	2	Ea	\$	845.00	\$ 1,690.00	\$	490.00	\$	980.00	\$	100.00	\$	200.00
11	Culv, End, Rem, Less than 24 inch	2	Ea	\$	300.00	\$ 600.00	\$	250.00	\$	500.00	\$	100.00	\$	200.00
12	Culv, Cl A, Conc, 48 inch	16	Ft	\$	240.00	\$ 3,840.00	\$	405.00	\$	6,480.00	\$	400.00	\$	6,400.00
13	Culv, Cl A, Conc, 15 inch	22	Ft	\$	70.00	\$ 1,540.00	\$	120.00	\$	2,640.00	\$	150.00	\$	3,300.00
14	Culv, Cl A, Conc, 12 inch	45	Ft	\$	62.00	\$ 2,790.00	\$	65.00	\$	2,925.00	\$	150.00	\$	6,750.00
15	Headwall, Conc.	1	Ls	\$:	20,000.00	\$ 20,000.00	\$	17,100.00	\$	17,100.00	\$	20,000.00	\$	20,000.00
16	Culv, End Sect, Conc, 15 inch	2	Ea	\$	800.00	\$ 1,600.00	\$	915.00	\$	1,830.00	\$	1,500.00	\$	3,000.00
17	Culv, End Sect, Conc, 12 inch	4	Ea	\$	650.00	\$ 2,600.00	\$	690.00	\$	2,760.00	\$	1,000.00	\$	4,000.00
18	6 inch ADS N-12 Pipe	212	Ft	\$	16.00	\$ 3,392.00	\$	52.00	\$	11,024.00	\$	25.00	\$	5,300.00
19	12 inch Dia Nyloplast Inlet	5	Ea	\$	1,350.00	\$ 6,750.00	\$	1,650.00	\$	8,250.00	\$	1,500.00	\$	7,500.00
20	Fence, Split Rail, Wood	980	Ft	\$	12.00	\$ 11,760.00	\$	22.00	\$	21,560.00	\$	20.00	\$	19,600.00
21	Fence, Rem	1033	Ft	\$	5.00	\$ 5,165.00	\$	8.25	\$	8,522.25	\$	8.00	\$	8,264.00
22	Fence, Moving	158	Ft	\$	15.00	\$ 2,370.00	\$	22.00	\$	3,476.00	\$	25.00	\$	3,950.00
23	Subgrade Undercutting, Type 1	1474	Cyd	\$	25.00	\$ 36,850.00	\$	65.00	\$	95,810.00	\$	10.00	\$	14,740.00
24	HMA 36A, 2 inch	10	Ton	\$	120.00	\$ 1,200.00	\$	103.00	\$	1,030.00	\$	200.00	\$	2,000.00
25	HMA 3C, 2.5 inch	10	Ton	\$	120.00	\$ 1,200.00	\$	113.00	\$	1,130.00	\$	200.00	\$	2,000.00
26	HMA 36A, 1.5 inch	400	Ton	\$	111.00	\$ 44,400.00	\$	103.00	\$	41,200.00	\$	120.00	\$	48,000.00
27	HMA 3C, 1.5 inch	400	Ton	\$	109.00	\$ 43,600.00	\$	113.00	\$	45,200.00	\$	115.00	\$	46,000.00
28	Aggregate Base, 8 inch, 21AA	89	Syd	\$	16.00	\$ 1,424.00	\$	18.00	\$	1,602.00	\$	25.00	\$	2,225.00
29	Aggregate Base, 6 inch, 21AA	4332	Syd	\$	12.25	\$ 53,067.00	\$	11.00	\$	47,652.00	\$	13.00	\$	56,316.00
30	Seeding, Mixture THM	138	Lbs	\$	10.00	\$ 1,380.00	\$	9.00	\$	1,242.00	\$	10.00	\$	1,380.00
31	Water, Seeding	21	Units	\$	110.00	\$ 2,310.00	\$	100.00	\$	2,100.00	\$	90.00	\$	1,890.00
32	Fertilizer, Chemical Nutrient, CI A	142	Lbs	\$	8.00	\$ 1,136.00	\$	8.00	\$	1,136.00	\$	10.00	\$	1,420.00

BID TABULATION CITY OF TROY SYLVAN GLEN PATHWAYS

ITB-COT 21-04 Page 2 of 4

	Vendor Name:			Allstar Power Excavation, LLC			Warren Contractors & Development, Inc.					Pro-Line Asphalt Paving Corp.				
			City:	Grosse Pointe, MI			Shelby Twp., MI				Washington, MI					
Line	Description	Total Quantity	Units	Un	nit Price	Total Cost	U	nit Price	Т	Total Cost		Total Cost		nit Price	Т	otal Cost
33	Mulch	3036	Syd	\$	2.00	\$ 6,072.00	\$	1.25	\$	3,795.00	\$	2.00	\$	6,072.00		
34	Topsoil Surface, Furn, 4 inch	3036	Syd	\$	4.00	\$ 12,144.00	\$	3.75	\$	11,385.00	\$	4.00	\$	12,144.00		
35	Erosion Control, Inlet Protection, Fabric Drop	2	Ea	\$	85.00	\$ 170.00	\$	100.00	\$	200.00	\$	100.00	\$	200.00		
36	Erosion Control, Silt Fence	5300	Ft	\$	1.75	\$ 9,275.00	\$	1.65	\$	8,745.00	\$	2.00	\$	10,600.00		
37	Erosion Control, Sediment Trap	1	Ea	\$	90.00	\$ 90.00	\$	500.00	\$	500.00	\$	250.00	\$	250.00		
38	Maintenance Aggregate, 21AA Limestone	61	Ton	\$	40.00	\$ 2,440.00	\$	31.00	\$	1,891.00	\$	40.00	\$	2,440.00		
39	Traffic Control and Maintenance	1	Ls	\$ 1	2,000.00	\$ 12,000.00	\$	6,000.00	\$	6,000.00	\$ 2	25,000.00	\$	25,000.00		
40	Inspection Day		Days	\$	500.00	\$ 15,000.00	\$	500.00	\$	27,500.00	\$	500.00	\$	17,500.00		
41	Obtain Permit from EGLE	1	Ls	\$	500.00	\$ 500.00	\$	500.00	\$	500.00	\$	500.00	\$	500.00		
			\$ 414,248.00			\$		5	49,671.25	\$		5	59,856.00			
	Warranty:			2 Year				1 `	Yea	r	1 Year					
	Start Date Anticipated:			09/17/2020 09/21/2020			ASAP 09/21/2020			9/21/2020						
	Anticipated Duration to Complete:			10/30/2020			11 weeks of construction; Dec 4th weather permitting for paving				11/15/2020					
	Hours of Operation:			6AM - 6PM			7AM - 5PM				7AM - 5PM					
	24 Hour Phone #:			734-308-7106			Upon Request				586-752-7730					
	Proposed Payment Schedule:			\$30,000 initial; 30 net upon			Evony Month				Dragraga Daymenta 20 Daya					
	References:		Y or N		completion Y		Every Month Y				Progress Payments - 30 Days					
	Can meet Insurance:		Y or N			<u>'</u> /	Y				Y					
			1 01 11					ending on s	start	date cannot						
	Can meet Completion Date:		Y or N		11/15			guarantee p				11/15				
	Payment Terms:				30	Net	Dor	30 l		s date cannot		30 E	Days	i		
	Exceptions: Y		Y or N		١	N		guarantee p			t N					
	Acknowledgement:		Y or N)	/	Y				Y					
	Signed Addendum: Y or N			Addendum 2 signed only			Addendum 2 signed only				Addendum 2 signed only					
	Bidder Questionnaire Included:		Y or N		١	1	Υ				Υ					
	Forms:		Y or N		١	1	Υ				Y					

BID TABULATION CITY OF TROY SYLVAN GLEN PATHWAYS

ITB-COT 21-04 Page 3 of 4

Vendor Name:	Anglin Civil, LLC	Asphalt Specialists, Inc.	WCI Contractors, Inc.
City:	Livonia, MI	Pontiac, MI	Detroit, MI
Check Amt:	\$10,000.00	\$10,000.00	\$10,000.00
Check #	9200930504	2014151172	420075320

Check #: 9200930504 2014151172 420075320													20	
BID PROPOSAL: SYLVAN GLEN PATHWAY PROJECT														
Line	Description	Total Quantity	Units	Ur	nit Price	Total Cost	U	nit Price	Т	otal Cost	U	Init Price	Т	otal Cost
1	Bonds, Insurance & Mobilization (\$40,000 Max)	1	Ls	\$ 4	10,000.00	\$ 40,000.00	\$	40,000.00	\$	40,000.00	\$	37,100.00	\$	37,100.00
2	Preconstruction Audio-Visual Documentation (\$10,000 Max)	1	Ls	\$ 1	0,000.00	\$ 10,000.00	\$	5,000.00	\$	5,000.00	\$	4,200.00	\$	4,200.00
3	Clearing, Modified	6.8	Sta	\$	2,300.00	\$ 15,640.00	\$	1,500.00	\$	10,200.00	\$	2,200.00	\$	14,960.00
4	Removal of Misc. Concrete	1	Ls	\$	4,025.00	\$ 4,025.00	\$	2,500.00	\$	2,500.00	\$	5,700.00	\$	5,700.00
5	Pavt, Rem	97	Syd	\$	17.25	\$ 1,673.25	\$	3.00	\$	291.00	\$	17.00	\$	1,649.00
6	Station Grading	3977	Ft	\$	13.80	\$ 54,882.60	\$	45.00	\$	178,965.00	\$	25.00	\$	99,425.00
7	Tree, Remove, 1 inch to 6 inch	1	Ea	\$	402.50	\$ 402.50	\$	125.00	\$	125.00	\$	175.00	\$	175.00
8	Tree, Remove, 6 inch to 18 inch	13	Ea	\$	575.00	\$ 7,475.00	\$	220.00	\$	2,860.00	\$	260.00	\$	3,380.00
9	Culv, Rem, 24 inch to 48 inch	1	Ea	\$	1,725.00	\$ 1,725.00	\$	500.00	\$	500.00	\$	230.00	\$	230.00
10	Culv, Rem, Less than 24 inch	2	Ea	\$	575.00	\$ 1,150.00	\$	300.00	\$	600.00	\$	1,150.00	\$	2,300.00
11	Culv, End, Rem, Less than 24 inch	2	Ea	\$	575.00	\$ 1,150.00	\$	100.00	\$	200.00	\$	300.00	\$	600.00
12	Culv, Cl A, Conc, 48 inch	16	Ft	\$	287.50	\$ 4,600.00	\$	500.00	\$	8,000.00	\$	400.00	\$	6,400.00
13	Culv, Cl A, Conc, 15 inch	22	Ft	\$	172.50	\$ 3,795.00	\$	200.00	\$	4,400.00	\$	115.00	\$	2,530.00
14	Culv, Cl A, Conc, 12 inch	45	Ft	\$	143.75	\$ 6,468.75	\$	120.00	\$	5,400.00	\$	115.00	\$	5,175.00
15	Headwall, Conc.	1	Ls	\$ 2	24,725.00	\$ 24,725.00	\$	15,000.00	\$	15,000.00	\$	29,600.00	\$	29,600.00
16	Culv, End Sect, Conc, 15 inch	2	Ea	\$	1,150.00	\$ 2,300.00	\$	500.00	\$	1,000.00	\$	575.00	\$	1,150.00
17	Culv, End Sect, Conc, 12 inch	4	Ea	\$	862.50	\$ 3,450.00	\$	450.00	\$	1,800.00	\$	575.00	\$	2,300.00
18	6 inch ADS N-12 Pipe	212	Ft	\$	23.00	\$ 4,876.00	\$	20.00	\$	4,240.00	\$	29.00	\$	6,148.00
19	12 inch Dia Nyloplast Inlet	5	Ea	\$	1,725.00	\$ 8,625.00	\$	1,500.00	\$	7,500.00	\$	1,750.00	\$	8,750.00
20	Fence, Split Rail, Wood	980	Ft	\$	51.75	\$ 50,715.00	\$	21.00	\$	20,580.00	\$	55.00	\$	53,900.00
21	Fence, Rem	1033	Ft	\$	6.90	\$ 7,127.70	\$	11.00	\$	11,363.00	\$	8.00	\$	8,264.00
22	Fence, Moving	158	Ft	\$	28.75	\$ 4,542.50	\$	30.00	\$	4,740.00	\$	28.00	\$	4,424.00
23	Subgrade Undercutting, Type 1	1474	Cyd	\$	51.75	\$ 76,279.50	\$	50.00	\$	73,700.00	\$	61.20	\$	90,208.80
24	HMA 36A, 2 inch	10	Ton	\$	115.00	\$ 1,150.00	\$	120.00	\$	1,200.00	\$	480.00	\$	4,800.00
25	HMA 3C, 2.5 inch	10	Ton	\$	119.60	\$ 1,196.00	\$	118.00	\$	1,180.00	\$	475.00	\$	4,750.00
26	HMA 36A, 1.5 inch	400	Ton	\$	115.00	\$ 46,000.00	\$	120.00	\$	48,000.00	\$	182.00	\$	72,800.00
27	HMA 3C, 1.5 inch	400	Ton	\$	119.60	\$ 47,840.00	\$	118.00	\$	47,200.00	\$	209.00	\$	83,600.00
28	Aggregate Base, 8 inch, 21AA	89	Syd	\$	17.25	\$ 1,535.25	\$	14.00	\$	1,246.00	\$	57.00	\$	5,073.00
29	Aggregate Base, 6 inch, 21AA	4332	Syd	\$	8.63	\$ 37,385.16	\$	11.00	\$	47,652.00	\$	18.25	\$	79,059.00
30	Seeding, Mixture THM	138	Lbs	\$	34.50	\$ 4,761.00	\$	10.00	\$	1,380.00	\$	13.00	\$	1,794.00
31	Water, Seeding	21	Units	\$	402.50	\$ 8,452.50	\$	175.00	\$	3,675.00	\$	600.00	\$	12,600.00
32	Fertilizer, Chemical Nutrient, CI A	142	Lbs	\$	17.25	\$ 2,449.50	\$	5.00	\$	710.00	\$	13.00	\$	1,846.00

BID TABULATION CITY OF TROY SYLVAN GLEN PATHWAYS

Anglin Civil, LLC

Asphalt Specialists, Inc.

Vendor Name:

ITB-COT 21-04 Page 4 of 4

WCI Contractors, Inc.

			City:	Livonia, MI			Pontiac, MI				Detroit, MI			
Line	Description	Total Quantity	Units	U	nit Price	Total Cost	U	nit Price	Т	otal Cost	Unit Price		Т	otal Cost
33	Mulch	3036	Syd	\$	4.60	\$ 13,965.60	\$	3.50	\$	10,626.00	\$	1.50	\$	4,554.00
34	Topsoil Surface, Furn, 4 inch	3036	Syd	\$	9.20	\$ 27,931.20	\$	4.50	\$	13,662.00	\$	10.00	\$	30,360.00
35	Erosion Control, Inlet Protection, Fabric Drop	2	Ea	\$	172.50	\$ 345.00	\$	150.00	\$	300.00	\$	175.00	\$	350.00
36	Erosion Control, Silt Fence	5300	Ft	\$	3.45	\$ 18,285.00	\$	3.00	\$	15,900.00	\$	1.80	\$	9,540.00
37	Erosion Control, Sediment Trap	1	Ea	\$	747.50	\$ 747.50	\$	1,100.00	\$	1,100.00	\$	850.00	\$	850.00
38	Maintenance Aggregate, 21AA Limestone	61	Ton	\$	57.50	\$ 3,507.50	\$	20.00	\$	1,220.00	\$	57.00	\$	3,477.00
39	Traffic Control and Maintenance	1	Ls	\$	4,025.00	\$ 4,025.00	\$	3,000.00	\$	3,000.00	\$ 1	0,700.00	\$	10,700.00
40	Inspection Day		Days	\$	500.00	\$ 22,500.00	\$	500.00	\$	17,500.00	\$	500.00	\$	22,500.00
41	Obtain Permit from EGLE	1	Ls	\$	500.00	\$ 500.00	\$	500.00	\$	500.00	\$	500.00	\$	500.00
				\$		578,204.01	\$		6	15,015.00	\$		7	37,721.80
Warranty:			,	Not Specified				1 Year			2 Years per project documents			documents
	Start Date Anticipated:			Not Specified				Within 10 days of Award			Within 10 days of Notice to Proceed			ce to Proceed
	Anticipated Duration to Complete:			Not Specified		Per Contract Documents			ocuments	10 Weeks			s	
	Hours of Operation:			8AM - 5PM		7:30AM - 4:30PM			8AM - 4PM			М		
	24 Hour Phone #:			989-621-2175			734-323-7744 248-648-7526				248-330-8663			663
	Proposed Payment Schedule:			4 Payments @ 25 % intervals based on dollar value				Progress payments - every 2 weeks				Monthly		
	References:		Y or N	Υ			Υ				Y			
	Can meet Insurance:		Y or N		Υ		Υ				Υ			
	Can meet Completion Date:		Y or N		Not Sp	ecified		Per Contrac	t Do	ocuments		Not Sp	ecif	ied
Payment Terms:					Not Sp	ecified		Every 2	2 W	eeks	Net 30			
Exceptions:			Y or N		١	N			N		N			
Acknowledgement:			Y or N	Y			Y				Υ			
	Signed Addendum:		Y or N	A	Addendum 2	signed only	N				Addendum 2 signed only			
	Bidder Questionnaire Included:		Y or N		١	1	Y				Y			
	Forms:		Y or N		١	·	Υ				Y			

Attest:

(*Bid Opening conducted via a Go-To Meeting)

Kurt Bovensiep

Ashley Levin Kristine Kallek

Jackie Ahlstrom Jodi Kolakowski MaryBeth Murz, Purchasing Manager



ANDERSON, ECKSTEIN & WESTRICK, INC. CIVIL ENGINEERS - SURVEYORS - ARCHITECTS

51301 Schoenherr Road, Shelby Township, MI 48315 586.726.1234 | www.aewinc.com

September 8, 2020

Kurt Bovensiep, Public Works Director City of Troy 500 W. Big Beaver Troy, Michigan 48084

Reference: Recommendation of Award

Sylvan Glen Pathway Project AEW Project No. 0238-0009

Dear Mr. Bovensiep:

Anderson, Eckstein and Westrick, Inc. (AEW) prepared plans and specifications for the Sylvan Glen Pathway Project. This project consists of providing a 10-foot-wide bituminous pathway through the Sylvan Glen Park from Rochester Road to Glasgow Drive.

The City of Troy received bids for this project on Thursday, September 3, 2020. Six bids were received and the low bidder was All Star Power Excavation, LLC, with a total bid amount of \$414,248.00. All Star Power Excavation's bid was 25% less than the next bidder or approximately \$135,000 less and 29% less than the engineer's estimate or approximately \$165,000 less. AEW has not worked with or heard of this company; and we have concern that they may be missing costs in their bid price.

The next closest bidder was Warren Contractors & Development Inc, with a total bid amount of \$549,671.25. AEW has worked with Warren Contractors & Development in the past and are confident they can conduct the work included in this project.

Therefore, based upon past experience working with Warren Contractors & Development, Inc, the available funding and the necessity of completing this project, we recommend that the City of Troy contract with Warren Contractors & Development, Inc, 14979 Technology Dr, Shelby Twp, MI 48315, for the above referenced project with a total bid amount of \$549,671.25.

Sincerely,

Taylor Sting, PE Licensed Engineer

Enclosure:

cc: Kyle Seidel, PE, CFM

M:\0238\0238-0009\Gen\Letters\Recommendation of Award.docx