

Chair Krent called the virtual Regular meeting of the Troy City Planning Commission to order at 7:03 p.m. on November 10, 2020. Chair Krent introduced the procedure to be followed for a remote meeting.

1. ROLL CALL

Present:

- Ollie Apahidean
- Karen Crusse
- Carlton M. Faison
- Michael W. Hutson
- Tom Krent
- David Lambert
- Marianna Perakis
- Sadek Rahman
- John J. Tagle (audibly only)

Also Present:

- R. Brent Savidant, Community Development Director
- Ben Carlisle, Carlisle Wortman Associates
- Julie Quinlan Dufrane, Assistant City Attorney
- Jackie Ferencz, Planning Department Administrative Assistant
- Kathy L. Czarnecki, Recording Secretary

2. SUSPENSION OF PLANNING COMMISSION BYLAWS

Resolution # PC-2020-11-027

Moved by: Rahman
 Support by: Perakis

WHEREAS, the Michigan Department of Health and Human Services (MDHHS) Director Robert Gordon issued an Order on October 5, 2020 under MCL 333.2253 restricting indoor gathering sizes to protect public health and safety, and

WHEREAS Public Act 228 of 2020 permits public meetings to be held by electronic means where an in-person meeting could detrimentally increase exposure of board members and the general public to COVID-19,

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, That as allowed by Planning Commission Rules of Procedure Article IV, Section 6, the Troy Planning Commission hereby **TEMPORARILY SUSPENDS** the requirement of holding a meeting at the Troy City Hall and **ALLOWS** all Troy Planning Commission Members to electronically participate in any Planning Commission meeting through December 31, 2020.

Members participating electronically will be considered present and in attendance at the meeting and may participate in the meeting as if physically present. However, members must avoid using email, texting, instant messaging, and other such electronic forms of communication to make a decision or deliberate toward a decision.

RESOLVED, As allowed by Planning Commission By-laws and Rules of Procedure Article X, the Troy Planning Commission hereby **TEMPORARILY SUSPENDS AND MODIFIES** the By-laws and Rules of Procedure concerning the Order of the Agenda, as set forth in Article V, Section 3, to consolidate the Public Comment sections of the meeting for any meeting held through December 31, 2020.

RESOLVED, As allowed by Planning Commission By-laws and Rules of Procedure Article X, the Troy Planning Commission hereby **TEMPORARILY SUSPENDS AND ALLOWS** two methods of receiving Public Comment for virtual meetings. Public comments can be submitted for the Planning Commission meeting by sending an email to: planning@troymi.gov. Emails received prior to 4:00 pm on the day of the Planning Commission meeting, will be read at the meeting and made part of the public record. Public comments can also be submitted by calling the following phone number and leaving a voicemail message: (248) 524-1305. Recorded voicemail messages received prior to 4:00 pm on the day of the Planning Commission meeting will be played at the meeting. For emails and recorded messages received after the deadline, reasonable efforts will be made to read emails and play recorded messages received during the meeting. Email and voicemail public comments will be limited to three minutes each.

Yes: All present (9)

MOTION CARRIED

3. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Resolution # PC-2020-11-028

Moved by: Perakis
 Support by: Apahidean

RESOLVED, To approve the Agenda as prepared.

Yes: All present (9)

MOTION CARRIED

4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Mr. Lambert asked that the draft minutes reflect that Resolution # PC-2020-10-026 was moved by him and not Mr. Tagle.

Resolution # PC-2020-11-029

Moved by: Lambert
 Support by: Rahman

RESOLVED, To approve the minutes of the October 27, 2020 Regular meeting as revised.

Yes: All present (9)

MOTION CARRIED

5. PUBLIC COMMENT – For Items Submitted via Email or Telephone Message

Email messages received after the online posting of the agenda, in response to Agenda item #6.

- Carl Koenig, 4393 Cahill; oppose
- Jan Walsh, 4318 Bender Court; oppose
- Omar Shouhayib, 2265 Livernois, Choice Development; in support
- Laura Lipinski, 4233 Carson; oppose
- Ken McCabe, no address; oppose
- Thomas and Patricia Reiss, 1400 Bradbury; oppose
- Charlotte MacPherson, no address; oppose
- Senthil Kumar, 4073 Parkstone; oppose
- Lisa Paglino, 1061 Redding; oppose
- Neal and Paulette Shaw, 3861 Jennings; oppose
- Linda Baatz, no address; oppose
- Anirudh Sure, no address; oppose
- Daryl and Denise Jamison, no address; oppose
- Yumin and Zhang Ying Sheng, 4678 Tifton; oppose
- Tom Shaw, 4040 Glencastle; oppose
- John and Shelly Shallcross, 1059 Fountain; oppose
- Vivian Zoma, no address; oppose
- Sathya Dev, no address; oppose
- Maureen Cash, 4278 Lehigh; oppose
- Bonnie Jeffrey, no address; oppose
- Maureen Pickard, no address; oppose
- Celine T (concerned citizen), no address; oppose
- Faina Temkin, no address; oppose
- Larry and Jennifer Patton, 1417 Fountain; oppose
- Srinivasan Ravindran, no address; oppose
- Medha Tripathi, no address; oppose
- Angela He, 1347 Fountain; oppose
- Natarajan Athreya, 4089 Glencastle; oppose
- No name (Boots2344), 1310 Fountain; oppose
- Jonathan Maksabo, no address; oppose
- Ralph Schick, 4117 Penrose; oppose
- Amy Hirina, 4234 Carson; oppose
- Shalin Shah, no address; oppose
- No name, no address; oppose
- Harshini Chandrasekaran, no address; oppose
- Varun Aravapally, no address; oppose
- Ayesha Khan, no address; oppose
- Aryamaan Gaddam, no address; oppose
- Andrea Noble, Treasurer Woodlands of Troy HOA; oppose
- Rose Marie Lalapi, no address; oppose

- Matt Parowski, 240 W. Wattles; oppose
- Sanjay Shah and Bela Shah, no address; oppose
- June Yount, no address; oppose
- Aashit Shah, 4088 Parkstone; oppose
- Aashka Shah, no address; oppose
- Abbassieh Sobh, no address; oppose
- Amy Leigh Talarico, no address; oppose
- Arushi Mahajan, no address; oppose
- L. Xiaob (Bob), no address; oppose
- Brian Bartkowiak, 4278 Lehigh; oppose
- Brian Conolly; no address; oppose
- Carl Koenig, 4393 Cahill; oppose
- Carmen Franco, no address; oppose
- Carol Kohut, no address; oppose
- Cynthia Desmon, no address; oppose
- Cindy Sweeney, 4037 Glencastle; oppose
- Dan Raubinger, no address; President Woodlands of Troy HOA; oppose
- Daphne Ntiri, 4198 Carson; oppose
- Daryl Dickhudt, 4143 Glencastle; oppose
- David and Claudette Rusing, 1425 Bradbury; oppose
- Deanna Vetrone, no address; oppose
- Debbie A. Knauss, 3897 Meadowbrook; oppose
- Devinder Singh, 2452 Claymont; oppose
- Edmund Jaskulka, 4291 Lehigh; oppose
- Geeta Desai, 1844 Rolling Woods; oppose
- Geomy George, 4025 Glencastle; oppose
- James and Sharon Murray, 1267 Bradbury; oppose
- Jayashree Rao, 4415 Wintergreen; oppose
- Jenn-Tser and Jin-Feng Pan, 4059 Parkstone; oppose
- Jenny Chang, no address; oppose
- Jinming Xu, 4179 Carson; oppose
- John Bridge, 4089 Penrose; oppose
- Gerald and Judith Holmberg, no address; oppose
- Thomas and Karen Shaw, 4040 Glencastle; oppose
- Katherine Mikulski, 4408 Cahill; oppose
- Kosta and Carol Hardaloupas, no address; oppose
- Kristen Rondeau, 5090 Longview; oppose
- Les and Liz Kobylak, 1938 Canary; oppose
- Lisa Paglino, no address; oppose
- Lopa Rana, no address; oppose
- Mark and Diane Paul, 3844 Root; oppose
- Mary Kay Michaels, 4535 Hycliffe; oppose
- Mary Kennedy, no address; oppose
- Masood Siddiqui, no address; oppose

- Mike Lipinski, 4233 Carson; oppose
- Praveen Gomer, 1062 Whisper Way; oppose
- Pat Baker, no address; oppose
- Paul Pabian, no address; oppose
- Priti Gupta, no address; oppose
- Ringo Zhang, no address; oppose
- Robert Laudicina, 1286 Fountain; oppose
- Robert Marku, no address; oppose
- Scott and Claudia Leman, 1075 Fountain; oppose
- Sujith Nair, 1337 Bradbury; oppose
- Susan Turpin, 4216 Carson; oppose
- Xiao Min Chen, 975 Emerson; oppose
- Jerry Rauch, 4187 Penrose; oppose
- Xiaoqing Yu, 1260 Bradbury; oppose
- Yi Guo and Zhe Xu, 1192 Provincial; oppose
- Yongpeng Zhang, no address; oppose
- Zachary Reed, 1395 Fountain; oppose
- Kevin Zhou, no address; oppose
- Shelley Stenger, no address; oppose
- Aditi Mahajan, no address; oppose
- Atika Singh, no address; oppose
- Dorothy Shetler, 4558 Rivers Edge; oppose
- Fred Tarazi, 4388 Cahill; oppose
- Jayne and Rick Smith, no address; oppose
- Jean-Claude Quenum, 4198 Carson; oppose
- Jigna Shah, 4088 Parkstone; oppose
- Kelly Coval, no address; oppose
- Kristi Roncelli, no address; oppose
- Mary Branch, no address; oppose
- Michael and Peggy O'Shaughnessey, no address; oppose
- Mike Temkin, no address; oppose
- Patricia Orlovski, 1381 Bradbury; oppose
- Paul Balas, 4087 Parkstone; oppose
- Ravi, no address; oppose
- Renee Weiss, no address; oppose
- Rhea Sautter, no address; oppose
- Rose Wright and James Laherty, 1269 Autumn; oppose
- Lisa Paglino, 1061 Redding; oppose
- Sumit Mathur, 4426 Hycliffe; oppose
- Ashish and Swati Mody, 4752 Rivers Edge; oppose

Chair Krent called a recess at 9:32 p.m. The meeting reconvened at 9:38 p.m.

Voicemail messages received in response to Agenda item #6.

- Aashit Shah, 4088 Parkstone; oppose
- Thomas Mikulski, 4408 Cahill; oppose
- Edmund Jaskulka, 4291 Lehigh; oppose
- Praveen Gomer, 1062 Whisper Way; oppose
- David Rusing, 1425 Bradbury; oppose
- Indiscernible name; oppose
- Joyce Barnett, 3448 Tothill; oppose
- Deepak Parekh, 2956 Devonwood; oppose
- Indiscernible name; oppose
- Robert Marku, 3394 Kilmer; oppose
- Tim Dryzga, 4642 Bentley; oppose
- Jigna Shah, 4088 Parkstone; oppose
- Gloria Vanevery, 2140 Charnwood; oppose
- Resident, Woodlands of Troy; oppose
- Victor Nowak, 1132 Fountain; oppose
- Michael Walsh, 4318 Bender Court; oppose
- Heena Shah, 1701 Caliper; oppose
- Deborah Louzecky, 6327 Donaldson; oppose
- Carol Quigley, 2489 Tall Oaks; oppose
- (first name indiscernible) Raghavulu, 4020 Penrose; oppose
- Henry Bzdziuch, 2337 Valleyview; oppose

PRELIMINARY SITE PLAN APPROVAL

6. PRELIMINARY SITE PLAN REVIEW (File Number SP JPLN2019-0022) – Proposed Crooks Road Townhomes, West side of Crooks Road, North of Wattles Road, Section 17, Currently Zoned NN (Neighborhood Node “I”) District

Mr. Savidant gave a history of the Preliminary Site Plan application from its initial submission on June 28, 2019. He indicated a public hearing is not required for the application but at two previous Planning Commission meetings, the Chair opened the floor for public comment. At the September 24, 2019 meeting, 30 people spoke and 82 email messages were received. At the January 14, 2020 meeting, 18 people spoke and 59 email messages were received.

Mr. Savidant indicated the applicant has brought back the application with minor modifications after meeting with representatives of the abutting neighborhood. He said the administration notified the Woodlands Homeowners Association with a link to the agenda packet posted online this past Friday afternoon, which generated the public comment presented this evening. Mr. Savidant said the applicant has a right to due process by law to be heard by the Planning Commission.

Mr. Carlisle gave a review of the Preliminary Site Plan application identifying the recent modifications to the plan since last reviewed by the Planning Commission and as identified in his report dated November 6, 2020. He shared the renderings provided by the applicant.

Mr. Carlisle reported the proposed use is appropriate for the site and multiple family residential is a permitted use in the neighborhood node. He asked the Planning Commission to take into consideration the type of multiple family residential proposed, the number of units proposed, and transitional features as set forth in Section 5.06.E.3 of the Zoning Ordinance.

Discussion among members and administration:

- Building height permitted in Neighborhood Node districts.
- Pedestrian path and picnic area.
 - Amenity for development or adjacent Penrose residents; question for applicant.
 - Access; no physical vehicular or pedestrian connection.
- Community Image Builders communication; some valid points, some points not related specifically to Troy.
- Stormwater management; review during final site plan process by City Engineering Department, as well State permits required.
- No applications on file for proposed development on remaining corners of Wattles and Crooks.

Present were Attorney Greg Obloy of Carson Fischer, Carmine Avantini of Community Image Builders, James Butler and Gregory Bono of Professional Engineering Associates and the applicant Arban Stafa of Tollbrook North LLC.

Mr. Obloy said the applicant met with representatives of the abutting residential neighborhood after the Planning Commission meeting in January and resubmitted the plan in March with revisions to address transition and Planning Consultant review comments. Mr. Obloy clarified the picnic area is intended as an amenity for the neighborhood to the west. Mr. Obloy said the application complies with all requirements of the Zoning Ordinance and respectfully requested action this evening to approve the Preliminary Site Plan.

Mr. Avantini gave a PowerPoint presentation. He addressed a reduction in building height, elevation difference between uses, amenities and building material. Mr. Avantini said building material is brick and cement fiber board, no vinyl. He noted trash collection would be internally for individual townhomes with no dumpsters on site. Mr. Avantini's presentation showed various renderings and a three-dimensional view of the development in context to neighboring homes.

There was discussion on:

- Neighborhood meeting on January 23, 2020 at City Hall Library; applicant indicated no compromise reached.
- Pedestrian path and picnic area.
- Elevation and grading differences; approximate 5-foot difference, accuracy of information provided by applicant.
- Transitional features and compatibility with surrounding neighbors.
 - Interpretation(s) of design standards subjective.
- Application as relates to Zoning Ordinance requirements and Master Plan.
- Traffic study dated January 14, 2020; same data and conclusion for revised application.
- Department reviews of application; no outstanding issues cited.
- Recent legal matter received in City Attorney office.

Resolution # PC-2020-11-

Moved by: Lambert

Support by:

RESOLVED, That Preliminary Site Plan Approval, pursuant to Article 8 of the Zoning Ordinance, as requested for the proposed Crooks Road Townhomes, located on the west side of Crooks, North of Wattles, Section 17, within the NN (Neighborhood Node “I”) District, be DENIED, for the following reason(s):

1. That the applicant has not provided the appropriate transition.
2. That it does not meet the design standards, does not enhance the character, environment and safety of pedestrian and motorists through the requirements of the Zoning Ordinance.

Reason #2 offered by Ms. Perakis prior to support on the motion.

Ms. Perakis shared concerns about the safety of children in the context of lack of sidewalks and internal traffic circulation with respect to pedestrians and vehicles.

Ms. Dufrane encouraged further discussion if Ms. Perakis believes there is a safety issue.

Chair Krent stated there appears to be plenty of sidewalks; the open issue is whether the application meets transition and compatibility standards.

Mr. Savidant responded to the concerns expressed by Ms. Perakis about safety. He said the application was submitted to appropriate City departments for review. Mr. Savidant said the traffic professionals and the Fire Department cited no safety concerns with the development. Mr. Savidant said there is nothing dangerous about the project and that the Planning Department does not forward applications to the Planning Commission to act upon if there are any safety concerns.

Chair Krent and Mr. Savidant encouraged the Board to act on the application this evening given that the item has been postponed twice.

Resolution # PC-2020-11-030

Moved by: Lambert

Support by: Hutson

RESOLVED, That Preliminary Site Plan Approval, pursuant to Article 8 of the Zoning Ordinance, as requested for the proposed Crooks Road Townhomes, located on the west side of Crooks, North of Wattles, Section 17, within the NN (Neighborhood Node "I") District, be **DENIED**, for the following reasons:

- 1. Lack of compatibility; and
- 2. Inadequate transition.

Yes: Crusse, Faison, Hutson, Krent, Lambert, Perakis, Rahman, Tagle

No: Apahidean

MOTION CARRIED

OTHER ITEMS

7. **CITY OF TROY MASTER PLAN AMENDMENT**

Mr. Savidant indicated with an apology that this item was placed on the agenda in error.

8. **PLANNING COMMISSION COMMENT**

There were general Planning Commission comments, some relating to:

- Proposed Zoning Ordinance Text Amendments in process.
- Planning Commission role; Zoning Ordinance and Master Plan.
- Developer rights vs Residents rights.

The virtual Regular meeting of the Planning Commission adjourned at 11:43 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Tom Krent, Chair



Kathy L. Czarnecki, Recording Secretary