



500 West Big Beaver  
Troy, MI 48084  
troymi.gov

# CITY COUNCIL AGENDA ITEM



Date: May 2, 2023

To: Mark F. Miller, City Manager

From: Robert J. Bruner, Assistant City Manager  
Dee Ann Irby, Controller  
Kurt Bovensiep, Public Works Director  
Dennis Trantham, Facilities and Grounds Operations Manager  
Emily Frontera, Purchasing Manager

Subject: Standard Purchasing Resolution 2: Award to Low Bidder Meeting Specifications – Tree/ Stump Maintenance Services

## History

- The scope of work includes all labor, tools, equipment, and transportation for tree maintenance services.
- These services include preventative tree trimming maintenance, tree removal, storm damage removal, tree stump removal, and treatment of DDA Spruce Trees.
- These tasks enable the City of Troy to be eligible to be recognized as a Tree City USA.
- In 2010, Troy City Council adopted a budget for the FY 2010/11 which included the elimination of two (2) AFCSME tree trimmer positions through layoff. As result of the reduction in staff, the majority of the city owned forestry equipment was sold.
- J.H. Hart Urban Forestry of Sterling Heights, MI has been the City of Troy’s Tree/Stump Maintenance Services Contractor for 20 years providing quality work and has maintained a positive working relationship with the residents and Parks Division staff.
- In 2018, Troy City Council approved a three-year contract with an option to renew for two additional years to the low bidder *J.H. Hart Urban Forestry of Sterling Heights, MI*, (Resolution #2018-06-108-J-4a), which allowed for a 5% escalator in the 2022 and 2023 seasons.
- The proposed pricing for three-year requirements increased by approximately 15% from the FY 2023 rates and is 50% lower than the other bidder.

## Purchasing

On April 20, 2023, a bid opening was conducted as required by City Charter and Code for Tree Stump Maintenance. The bid was posted on the MITN Purchasing Group website; [www.bidnetdirect.com/city-of-troy-mi](http://www.bidnetdirect.com/city-of-troy-mi). Two Hundred and Thirty (230) vendors were notified of the bid opportunity via the MITN website. Two (2) bid proposals were received. Below is a detailed summary of potential vendors for the bid opportunity.

Companies notified via MITN	230
Troy Companies notified via MITN	5
Troy Companies notified Active email Notification	4
Troy Companies Active Free	1
Companies that viewed the bid	21
Troy Companies that viewed the bid	0

**MITN** provides a resourceful online platform to streamline the procurement process, reduce costs, and make it easier and more transparent for vendors to do business with the City of Troy.

**Active MITN** members with a current membership and paying annual dues receive automatic electronic notification which allows instant access to Bids, RFPS and Quote opportunities with the City.

**Active MITN non-paying members** are responsible to monitor and check the MITN website for opportunities to do business with the City.

**Inactive MITN member** status can occur when a company does not renew their account upon expiration. Inactive members cannot be notified of solicitations or access any bid information.



500 West Big Beaver  
Troy, MI 48084  
troymi.gov

## **CITY COUNCIL AGENDA ITEM**

### **Purchasing (continued)**

- Bids were reviewed. *J.H. Hart Urban Forestry of Sterling Heights, MI* is the low bidder meeting specifications and is currently successfully provide tree and stump maintenance service for the City.
- J.H. Hart's bid included a 5% escalator for each option year renewal.
- The award is contingent upon contractors' submission of properly executed bid documents, insurance certificates, and all other specified documents.

### **Financial**

Funds are available in the Parks Division and Streets Division operating budgets.

### **Recommendation**

City Management recommends awarding a three (3) year contract with an option to renew for two (2) additional years for Tree/Stump Maintenance Services to the low bidder meeting specifications, *J.H. Hart Urban Forestry of Sterling Heights, MI* at unit prices contained in the bid tabulation opened April 20, 2023; not to exceed budgetary limitations; contract to expire June 30, 2028.

CITY OF TROY  
 BID TABULATION  
 TREE/STUMP REMOVAL SERVICES

VENDOR NAME:	J.H. Hart Urban Forestry	Owen Tree Service, Inc.
City:	Sterling Heights, MI	Attica, MI
Check #:	On File	2506576
Check Amount:		\$10,000.00

**PROPOSAL: TO FURNISH THREE YEAR REQUIREMENTS OF TREE/STUMP MAINTENANCE SERVICES WITH AN OPTION TO RENEW FOR TWO ADDITIONAL YEARS.**

<b>PROPOSAL A</b> <u>TREE REMOVAL</u> Provide three-man tree removal crew, all equipment, saws, vehicles, aerial tower, chipper, trucks, traffic control devices, etc.	<b>Estimated Man Hours</b>	<b>Price/Hour/Three-Man Crew</b>	<b>Price/Hour/Three-Man Crew</b>
	420		
	<b>Regular Time:</b>	\$201.00	\$336.00
	<b>Overtime:</b>	\$277.41	\$504.00
	<b>Typical Crew Size</b>	3	3
<b>PROPOSAL B</b> <u>STUMP REMOVAL</u> Provide a stumping crew including all equipment for removal and grinding of the stumps.	<b>Estimated Man Hours</b>	<b>Price/Hour/Two-Man Crew</b>	<b>Price/Hour/Two-Man Crew</b>
	300		
	<b>Regular Time:</b>	\$206.69	\$272.00
	<b>Typical Crew Size</b>	2	2
<b>PROPOSAL C</b> <u>BLOCK PRUNING</u> Provide two crews consisting of two-men, two aerial towers & two chippers for tree pruning	<b>Estimated Man Hours</b>	<b>Price/Hour/Two Crews of a Two-Man Crew</b>	<b>Price/Hour/Two Crews of a Two-Man Crew</b>
	1,100		
	<b>Regular Time:</b>	\$140.76	\$448.00
	<b>Overtime:</b>	\$194.02	\$672.00
	<b>Typical Crew Size</b>	2	4
<b>PROPOSAL D</b> <u>SERVICE REQUEST RESPONSE</u> Provide a two-man crew for individual pruning requests.	<b>Estimated Man Hours</b>	<b>Price/Hour/Two-Man Crew</b>	<b>Price/Hour/Two-Man Crew</b>
	1,100		
	<b>Regular Time:</b>	\$140.76	\$224.00
	<b>Typical Crew Size</b>	2	2
<b>PROPOSAL E</b> <u>STORM DAMAGE REMOVAL</u> Provide a three-man storm damage removal crew, all eqpt., saws, vehicles, aerial tower, chipper, trucks, traffic control devices, etc.	<b>Estimated Man Hours</b>	<b>Price/Hour/Three-Man Crew</b>	<b>Price/Hour/Three-Man Crew</b>
	10		
	<b>Regular Time:</b>	\$277.41	\$450.00
	<b>Typical Crew Size</b>	3	3
<b>PROPOSAL F</b> <u>OPEN DRAIN TREE &amp; DEBRIS DAM REMOVAL</u> Provide a three-man removal crew, all eqpt. saws, vehicles, aerial tower, chipper, trucks, traffic control devices, etc.	<b>Estimated Man Hours</b>	<b>Price/Hour/Three-Man Crew</b>	<b>Price/Hour/Three-Man Crew</b>
	10		
	<b>Regular Time:</b>	\$201.00	\$336.00
	<b>Typical Crew Size</b>	3	3
<b>PROPOSAL G</b> <u>GRAPPLE SAW CRANE TREE REMOVAL</u> Provide a tree removal crew, all equipment, grapple crane saw, saws, vehicles, aerial tower, chipper, trucks, traffic control devices, etc.	<b>Estimated Man Hours</b>	<b>Price/Hour/Three-Man Crew</b>	<b>Price/Hour/Three-Man Crew</b>
	50		NO BID
	<b>Regular Time:</b>	\$468.84	
	<b>Typical Crew Size</b>	3	
<b>PROPOSAL H</b> <u>INSECT AND DISEASE TREATMENT</u> Treat 31 groups of Blue Spruce totaling approx. 227 trees within the DDA Corridor on the Big Beaver median between Rochester to just west of Coolidge.		<b>Price per Annual Treatment</b>	<b>Price per Annual Treatment</b>
		\$3,995.00	\$2,800.00

CITY OF TROY  
 BID TABULATION  
 TREE/STUMP REMOVAL SERVICES

VENDOR NAME:		<b>J.H. Hart Urban Forestry</b>	
<b>PROPOSAL I</b> <u>DOUBLE GROUND MULCH</u> Double Shred Mulch	<b>Estimated Cu Yds</b>	<b>Cost per Cu Yd Delivered</b>	<b>Cost per Cu Yd Delivered</b>
	250	\$0.00	\$16.00
	<b>Minimum amount per Delivery</b>	60 Yards	50 Yards
<b>Total Proposal Price:</b>		<b>\$488,320.10</b>	<b>\$976,580.00</b>
			Note: Proposal G not bid
Insurance Met:	Y or N	Y	Y
References:	Y or N	Y	Y
Site Inspection:	Y or N	Y	N
Extension of contract:	Y or N	N	Y
Contact Information:			
24 Hour Phone #:		248-755-1793	810-724-6651
Hours of Operation:		M-F 7:30am-5pm	8:00 - 5:00
Phone #:		586-795-5581	810-217-7862
Payments:		Net 30 days	15 days
Exceptions:		5% increase in prices for each year of the two year extension.	None
Acknowledgement:	Y or N	Y	Y
Proposal A-I Attachments provided:	Y or N	Y	Y
Schedule of Values provided:	Y or N	Y	Y
Forms:	Y or N	Y	Y

ATTEST:

(\*Bid Opening conducted via a Zoom Meeting)

Dennis Trantham

Andrew Chambliss

Heather Chomiak

Emily Frontera

Purchasing Manager