

Chair Lambert called the Regular meeting of the Troy City Planning Commission to order at 7:00 p.m. on July 11, 2023, in the Council Chamber of the Troy City Hall. Chair Lambert and Vice Chair Perakis presented opening remarks relative to the role of the Planning Commission and procedure of tonight's meeting.

1. ROLL CALL

Present:

Toby Buechner  
Carlton M. Faison  
Tyler Fox  
Michael W. Hutson  
Tom Krent  
David Lambert  
Lakshmi Malalahalli  
Marianna Perakis  
John J. Tagle

Also Present:

Ben Carlisle, Carlisle Wortman & Associates  
R. Brent Savidant, Community Development Director  
Alan Motzny, Assistant City Attorney  
Kathy L. Czarnecki, Recording Secretary

2. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

**Resolution # PC-2023-07-041**

Moved by: Krent  
Support by: Buechner

**RESOLVED**, To approve the Agenda as prepared.

Yes: All present (9)

**MOTION CARRIED**

3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – June 27, 2023

Chair Lambert announced that at the June 27, 2023 Planning Commission meeting Article VII, Section 5.D., of the Planning Commission Bylaws was revised. With a majority vote of the Planning Commission members present and under appropriate circumstances, public speaker(s) are allowed an additional time to speak above the limited three (3) minutes rule.

**Resolution # PC-2023-07-042**

Moved by: Fox

Support by: Malalahalli

**RESOLVED**, To approve the minutes of the June 27, 2023 Regular meeting as submitted.

Yes: All present (9)

**MOTION CARRIED**4. **PUBLIC COMMENT** – For Items Not on the Agenda

There was no one present who wished to speak.

**PRELIMINARY SITE PLAN APPROVAL**5. **PRELIMINARY SITE PLAN REVIEW (File Number SC JPLN2023-0007)** – Proposed Estates of Eckford Site Condominium, 22 units/lots, South side of Eckford, West of Rochester (Parcels 88-20-15-252-028, -002, -036, -037, -004, -005), Section 15, Currently Zoned R-1C (One Family Residential) District

Mr. Carlisle reviewed the Preliminary Site Plan application for Eckford Site Condominium. Mr. Carlisle said the application is for a by-right site condominium project and meets all requirements of the Zoning Ordinance. He addressed the number of proposed units, range of square footage and style of homes, existing wetland and tree mitigation and access and circulation. Mr. Carlisle said the applicant is providing a 10-foot-wide bike path/sidewalk along Tallman Drive and Eckford Drive that would continue the path that starts at the Daisy Knight Dog Park on Livernois through to the Department of Public Works (DPW) to the north. Mr. Carlisle said the applicant must obtain an EGLE (Environment, Great Lakes & Energy) wetland permit before Final Site Plan approval. He reported the applicant submitted six different elevations and, as requested, side and rear elevations and building materials in a late submittal to the Planning Department.

Mr. Carlisle said the applicant was before the Planning Commission on February 14, 2023 for consideration of a Cluster development application for the same parcels, at which time the Planning Commission forwarded to City Council a recommendation of approval. The City Council unanimously denied the Cluster development application at their April 10, 2023 meeting.

Mr. Carlisle asked the Planning Commission to consider in its deliberation if the Site Plan Review Design Standards and Site Condominium Standards have been met. He recommended the following conditions should the Planning Commission grant approval of the Preliminary Site Plan application:

- The applicant obtains an EGLE wetland permit.
- The applicant flips the driveway location of Lot 6 to not conflict with the proposed pedestrian crossing of Eckford.

The Board acknowledged receipt of a written communication from resident at 613 Thurber expressing potential negative impact on his property as relates to the wetland designation, orientation of the cul-de-sac, existing standing water and preservation of an existing 200+ year-old landmark oak tree.

There was discussion among administration, some comments related to:

- Preservation of existing 200+ year-old landmark oak tree.
- Opportunity to improve storm water management on site.
- Confirmation on lot number to be flipped for pedestrian path (Lot 6).
- Administration acknowledged no concerns communicated from either EGLE or DPW regarding traffic or number of driveways.
- Orientation of cul-de-sac as relates to wetland.
- Percentage/acreage of green space, wetland.
- Comparison of previously considered Cluster development plan as relates to percentage of wetland preserved, open space, number of lots.

Mr. Carlisle briefly reviewed the process for which the applicant would pursue to obtain a permit from EGLE. He said the City does not control or mitigate wetlands.

Mr. Savidant explained non-regulated and State regulated wetlands. He said it is his understanding that EGLE will hold a public hearing on the wetland permit request should residents want to comment on the application. Mr. Savidant also stated that should EGLE make modifications to the plan, the applicant would come back to the Planning Commission for consideration.

Jim Eppink of J Eppink Partners, Inc. was present to represent Mondrian Properties. Mr. Eppink addressed the EGLE permit process for mitigation of the existing wetland. He said a permit was granted for the proposed Cluster development plan and assumes one will be granted for this application because it is similar in nature. Mr. Eppink said EGLE would most likely ask the developer to buy credits for certified wetland banks to obtain a permit. Mr. Eppink addressed lot sizes, style of homes and the 10-foot-wide sidewalk/path as a site amenity. He said the developer is agreeable to flip the driveway on Lot 6. He assured the Board that the 200+ year-old landmark oak tree would be preserved and not impacted by construction on site.

There was discussion, some comments related to:

- Style of homes; two-story, no ranches.
- Adding a reference sign to the 200+ year-old landmark oak tree.
- Site Plan Review Design Standards as relates to amenities provided by applicant.
- EV charging stations; developer might be amenable to provide at point of home purchase.
- Differences between previously considered Cluster development plan and subject application, as relates to number of lots, size of lots, density, home square footage, percentage of open space.

Mr. Carlisle said the list of amenities in the Site Plan Review Design Standards apply to all applications but are sometimes based on the type of development. He said the applicant is not required to provide an amenity but has offered to provide the sidewalk/path.

Chair Lambert opened the floor for public comment.

- Anthony Kapas, 501 Eckford; asked for confirmation application meets all requirements, expressed concerns with negative impact on neighborhood during construction phases.
- Greg Schaff, 613 Thurber; said cul-de-sac is further south and affects more wetland than pointed out by administration; addressed potential negative impact on neighborhood, cul-de-sac and existing wetland; addressed concerns with existing standing water and damage to root structure of landmark oak tree.
- Russell Crawshaw, 627 Thurber; addressed overlay of wetland as relates to Lots 9 and 22; expressed concerns with destruction of trees, existing standing water and noise from the cul-de-sac.

Chair Lambert closed the floor for public comment.

Mr. Carlisle confirmed the application requires no variances of the Zoning Ordinance requirements and that the applicant must obtain an EGLE permit prior to Final Site Plan approval.

Mr. Savidant addressed concerns expressed during the development construction phases. He said the City Engineering department determines management of construction traffic and monitors site conditions. Mr. Savidant informed residents that construction hours are Monday through Saturday, 7 a.m. to 8 p.m. Mr. Savidant assured residents that appropriate measures will be taken by the project landscape architect and project civil engineer to preserve the landmark tree. He said it is a Zoning Ordinance requirement that development cannot negatively impact surrounding neighbors, and there's potential that the development might correct any existing drainage problems.

In response to a question by Mr. Fox, Mr. Eppink said the developer did not consider a redraft of a Cluster development plan. He said after much discussion by the City Council in its deliberation of the Cluster development application, it was clear to the developer that going for a straight site plan condominium application would be best. Mr. Eppink said they will do proper engineering but noted the wetland will continue to be a functioning wetland and remain wet.

Ms. Perakis shared her perspective of the City Council consideration of the Cluster development application.

Several members shared disappointment that the Cluster development plan did not get approved.

**Resolution # PC-2023-07-043**

Moved by: Krent  
Seconded by: Faison

**RESOLVED**, That Preliminary Site Condominium Approval, pursuant to Article 8 and Section 10.02 of the Zoning Ordinance, as requested for the proposed Estates of Eckford Site Condominium 22 units/lots, South side of Eckford, West of Rochester (Parcels 88-20-15-252-028, -002, -036, -037, -004, -005), Section 15, approximately 7.56 acres in size, Currently Zoned R-1C (One Family Residential) district, be granted, subject to the following conditions:

1. The applicant is to obtain the EGLE wetland permit prior to Final Engineering Approval.
2. The applicant is to flip the driveway on unit/lot 6 so it is less in conflict with the proposed pedestrian crossing of Eckford.

Yes: All present (9)

**MOTION CARRIED**

**OTHER ITEMS**

6. **PUBLIC COMMENT** – For Items on the Agenda

There was no one present who wished to speak.

7. **PLANNING COMMISSION COMMENT**

Mr. Savidant said so far Board members Lambert, Krent and Fox signed up to attend the Michigan Association of Planning Annual Conference in October. He asked other members to let him know if they have an interest in attending.

Mr. Savidant reported there are no items to be placed on the regularly scheduled July 25, 2023 Planning Commission meeting agenda and suggested the Board might consider canceling the meeting.

**Resolution # PC-2023-07-044**

Moved by: Buechner  
Seconded by: Perakis

**RESOLVED**, To cancel the July 25, 2023 Regular meeting.

Yes: All present (9)

**MOTION CARRIED**

There was a brief discussion on whether to reconsider including calculations of regulated wetlands within the open space requirement for Cluster developments.

8. ADJOURN

The Regular meeting of the Planning Commission adjourned at 8:14 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



---

David Lambert, Chair



---

Kathy L. Czarnecki, Recording Secretary

G:\PLANNING COMMISSION MINUTES\2023 PC MINUTES\FINAL\2023 07 11 FINAL.docx