



CITY COUNCIL AGENDA ITEM

Date: June 8, 2017

To: Brian Kischnick, City Manager

From: MaryBeth Murz, Purchasing Manager
Steven J. Vandette, P.E, City Engineer
Mark Miller, Director of Economic & Community Development

Subject: Standard Purchasing Resolution 8: Best Value Award – General Consulting Engineering Services

Consulting Services History

General consulting engineering services are used primarily by the Engineering Department. These services are needed when in-house project design capacity is exceeded; when specific professional engineering expertise is not available in-house; when spikes occur in workload (especially inspection); when technical studies, long range utility studies and/or plans are needed; and when reviews of complex traffic studies for major new development proposals are needed.

Outside design services are needed for large capital projects, particularly road widening projects in the \$3-15 million cost range. These projects, such as the upcoming two (2) mile John R widening project from Long Lake to South Boulevard not only exceeds in-house engineering design capacity, but also requires specific engineering expertise for traffic signal replacements and street lighting that are not available in-house. For these large projects approximately 80% of the cost of design services and construction administration is reimbursed by federal funds.

Consultants are also needed at times for design and/or inspection of the city's water, sewer, and road projects; for soil erosion permit inspections; and for right-of-way permit inspections of utility and private developer work. The number of projects and permits each year far exceeds the capacity of the department's inspection staff and sometimes the capacity of the project design staff.

The cost of engineering design and inspection by consultants is included in the capital budget, while the cost of permit inspections by consultants is included in the Engineering Department operating budget.

The City currently has three engineering consultants: Hubbell, Roth & Clark, Inc. (HRC), Spalding DeDecker Associates, Inc. (SDA) and OHM Advisors (OHM). HRC has long been the City's consultant, since the 1960s, and at one time they were the city's only consultant. In 2004, SDA and OHM were added to take advantage of the strengths of each consultant and to assure that our service needs, particularly inspection services, did not exceed the capacity of our consultants. The current contracts have been in place since 2008. They expire on June 30, 2017, however; a provisional 60 day extension was approved by City Council on May 22, 2017, (Resolution #2017-05-089-J7).



CITY COUNCIL AGENDA ITEM

Purchasing

- April 4, 2017 a Request for Proposal was issued and posted on the Michigan Inter-governmental Trade Network (MITN) website: www.mitn.info. The vendor list from MITN was supplemented by the Purchasing Division with additional firms who were also notified via email.
- May 22, 2017 a bid opening was conducted and Proposals were received as required by City Charter and Code for General Consulting Engineering Services. Below is a summary of potential firms.

Companies notified via MITN	449
Troy Companies notified via MITN	4
Troy Companies - Active email Notification	4
Troy Companies - Active Free	0
Companies that viewed the bid	65
Troy Companies that viewed the bid	3
Number of Companies notified outside of MITN	8

*MITN provides a resourceful online platform to streamline the procurement process, reduce costs, and make it easier and more transparent for vendors to do business with the City of Troy. **Active MITN** members with a current membership and paying annual dues receive automatic electronic notification which allows instant access to Bids, RFPS and Quote opportunities with the City. **Active MITN non-paying members** are responsible to monitor and check the MITN website for opportunities to do business with the City. **Inactive MITN member** status can occur when a company does not renew their account upon expiration. Inactive members cannot be notified of solicitations or access any bid information.*

Eight (8) Proposal responses were received:

- Anderson, Eckstein & Westrick, Inc. Shelby Township, MI
- Spalding DeDecker Associates Rochester Hills, MI
- Fishbeck, Thompson, Carr & Huber, Inc. Novi, MI
- OHM Advisors Livonia, MI
- Hubbell, Roth & Clark, Inc. Bloomfield Hills, MI
- Giffels Webster Birmingham, MI
- Nowak & Fraus Engineers Pontiac, MI
- Rowe Professional Services Company Farmington Hills, MI

Qualifying conditions of the General Consulting Engineering Services were:

- Experience, knowledge and project approach.
- Positive references for the firm.
- Team membership
- Team experience
- Response to questionnaire

Scoring criteria was as follows:

Phase 1 Criteria	Points
Technical Approach to Service	35
Demonstrated Ability to Meet RFP Requirements	25
Experience and Key Personnel Involved	25
Cost	10
References	3
*Local Preference	2
TOTAL POINTS	100
Phase 2 Interview	
Rank 1	60
Rank 2	25
Rank 3	15



CITY COUNCIL AGENDA ITEM

Purchasing (continued)

- Four (4) Committee Members reviewed and evaluated the proposals. The Committee Members were as follows:
 - Steven Vandette, City Engineer
 - William Huotari, Deputy City Engineer
 - Scott Finlay, Civil Engineer
 - Mark Miller, Director of Economic and Community Development
- Based on the Firms' qualifying conditions and scores for proposals; the two top (2) ranked Firms which did not require interviews were:
 - Hubbell, Roth & Clark, Inc.
 - OHM Advisors
- The other top rated Firms were interviewed on Wednesday June 7, 2017:
 - Anderson, Eckstein & Westrick, Inc.
 - Spalding DeDecker Associates
 - Fishbeck, Thompson, Carr & Huber, Inc.
- Based on the scoring criteria, the committee unanimously recommends awarding contracts to the highest rated proposers:
 - Hubbell, Roth & Clark, Inc.
 - OHM Advisors
 - Anderson, Eckstein & Westrick, Inc.
 - Fishbeck, Thompson, Carr & Huber, Inc.
- The Scoring Summary is attached.
- It is in the best interest of the City to retain Hubbell, Roth & Clark and OHM Advisors, who have given excellent service to the city for over thirteen years. They have provided services on many important projects such as the Town Center Master Plan, which is still in progress, and the upcoming reconstruction of John R from Long Lake to South Boulevard to name a few.
- We are pleased to recommend two new consultants; Anderson, Eckstein & Westrick, Inc. (AEW) and Fishbeck, Thompson, Carr & Huber, Inc. (FTC&H).
- AEW is a full service civil engineering, architectural and land surveying company. AEW has been providing professional engineering services to southeast Michigan since 1968. AEW currently serves 29 municipal clients including nearby communities such as Clawson, Rochester, Rochester Hills, Warren, St. Clair Shores, Pleasant Ridge and Mt. Clemens. We intend to use their inspection staff to meet our increasing demand for inspection caused by the growth in private development activity and the city's own capital projects. Other services such as project design and construction project administration may be used as needed over the course of the 5-year contract.
- FTC&H is a professional civil engineering, environmental, architectural/engineering, and construction services consulting firm. FTC&H has been providing professional engineering services in Michigan since 1967. They currently have 10 offices in Michigan, including Novi, Macomb, and Detroit. They provide services to many nearby local public entities including



CITY COUNCIL AGENDA ITEM

Purchasing (continued)

Warren, Farmington Hills, Oak Park, Royal Oak, Rochester, Novi, Macomb County Department of Roads and the Oakland County Water Resources Commissioner. We intend to use their inspection staff to meet our increasing demand for inspection caused by the growth in private development and the city's own capital projects. Other services such as project design and construction project administration may be used as needed over the course of the 5-year contract.

Financial

General Consulting Engineering Services for capital projects are funded from each projects funding source, such as from Water and Sewer funds and the Capital Projects Fund. Additionally, as needed General Consulting Engineering Services for inspection, infrastructure planning and engineering studies is funded by the Engineering Department's operating budget. The budget for permit inspections was trending down during the economic downturn, but in recent years it's trending up as private development activity has increased and the number of city's own infrastructure projects have increased.

Recommendation

City management recommends awarding four (4) General Consulting Engineering Services contracts, for 5-year terms with an option to renew for an additional five (5) years, to the consultants rated highest overall at the end of the proposal review and interview process. These consultants are: Hubbell, Roth & Clark, Inc., OHM Advisors, Anderson, Eckstein & Westrick, Inc. and Fishbeck, Thompson, Carr & Huber, Inc.

STANDARD PURCHASING RESOLUTION 8 – Best Value Award – General Consulting Engineering Services

RESOLVED, That Troy City Council hereby **AWARDS** a five-year contract with an option to renew for an additional five years to the four (4) highest rated proposer(s), *Hubbell, Roth & Clark, Inc., of Pontiac, MI; OHM Advisors, of Livonai, MI; Anderson, Eckstein & Westrick, Inc., of Shelby Township, MI; and Fishbeck, Thompson, Carr & Huber, Inc., of Novi, MI* as a result of a best value process with the contract expiring June 30, 2022;

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, That the award is **CONTINGENT** upon the firms' submission of properly executed proposal and contract documents, including agreements, insurance certificates and all other specified requirements;

BE IT FINALLY RESOLVED, That Troy City Council hereby **AUTHORIZES** the Major and the City Clerk to execute the agreements once in acceptable form.